DOI: 10.1002/mar.22013

#### RESEARCH ARTICLE



#### Psychology Markeling WILEY

## The role of anthropomorphism and racial homophily of virtual influencers in encouraging low- versus high-cost pro-environmental behaviors

Calvin Wan<sup>1,2</sup> I Daisy Lee<sup>3</sup> Peggy Ng<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Edinburgh Business School, Heriot-Watt University, Edinburgh, UK

<sup>2</sup>Henley Business School, University of Reading, Reading, UK

<sup>3</sup>School of Professional Education and Executive Development, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, Hong Kong, Hong Kong

#### Correspondence

Calvin Wan, Edinburgh Business School, Heriot-Watt University, Edinburgh EH14 4AS, UK. Email: c.wan@hw.ac.uk

Funding information

College of Professional and Continuing Education, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University

#### Abstract

Virtual influencers have great potential to shape the audience's perception and motivate behavioral change. Drawing upon anthropomorphism theory and social identity theory, this paper examined the interaction effect of anthropomorphism and racial homophily of virtual influencers in shaping audiences' trust and subsequently pro-environmental behaviors in low- and high-cost contexts. Two online studies employing experimental materials generated by artificial intelligence were conducted. Study 1 revealed that high anthropomorphism (human-like virtual influencers) and high racial homophily (local-like virtual influencers) are more effective for eliciting trust in the context of low-cost proenvironmental behaviors. The findings also showed that low racial homophily (foreignlike virtual influencers) would further weaken the trust level of a virtual influencer in low anthropomorphism (animate-like virtual influencers). Study 2 aimed to replicate the findings from Study 1 in the context of high-cost pro-environmental behaviors. The findings showed that low racial homophily (foreign-like virtual influencers) enhanced the trust in a high anthropomorphism (human-like virtual influencers) virtual influencer. The moderated mediation analyses confirmed the hypothesized relationships in the proposed research model. This research advanced our understanding on the moderating role of racial homophily that serves as a cognitive shortcut for low-cost and quick decisions. However, a low racial homophily (foreign-like) virtual influencer would be more effective for high-cost and symbolic pro-environmental behaviors. These insights provide valuable guidance to businesses, marketers, and environmental advocates aiming to leverage virtual influencers for encouraging sustainability practices.

#### KEYWORDS

artificial intelligence, influencing marketing, pro-environmental behaviors, sustainability, virtual influencers

This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

© 2024 The Authors. Psychology & Marketing published by Wiley Periodicals LLC.

#### 1.1 | The emergence of virtual influencers

Social media influencers, ranging from everyday people to celebrities, leverage their online presence to influence their followers, and they are valued for their ability to attract audiences and shape opinions (Ouvrein et al., 2021). Brands are actively collaborating with influencers to effectively engage audiences and promote their brands (Nascimento et al., 2020). In 2023, global spending on influencer advertising reached USD30 billion, with projections indicating it will maintain its upward momentum, reaching USD56 billion by 2029 (Statista, 2024). Computer-generated virtual influencers have recently emerged as an alternative to human influencers due to the lower marketing costs and reduced risk of public relations scandals (Thomas & Fowler, 2021). Virtual influencers has gaining popularity among businesses and marketers for their influencer marketing campaign and also potentially contribute to a customer perception of innovativeness in promotional activities (Franke et al., 2023). Brands in different sectors, such as Nike, Prada, BMW, and IKEA, have utilized virtual influencers in their marketing campaigns (Shen, 2024). The global virtual influencer market is currently valued at USD4.6 billion, is projected to increase by 26% by 2025 (Kuzminov, 2023). Amid the ongoing digital transformation and evolution of social media platforms, gaining insights into audience perceptions of virtual influencers becomes imperative for businesses and marketers (Jhawar et al., 2023).

# **1.2** | The potential role of virtual influencers in promoting pro-environmental behaviors

Encouraging pro-environmental behaviors is often seen as a key strategy for mitigating environmental problems (Grilli & Curtis, 2021). Human influencers have emerged as effective advocates for promoting such changes (Boerman et al., 2022; Zhang et al., 2021). Dekoninck and Schmuck (2022) found that influencers' online contents do not only strengthen intentions but also translate into actual offline pro-environmental behaviors. To promote proenvironmental behaviors, Gerrath et al. (2024) suggested that virtual influencers offer a potential solution to the negative publicity associated with human influencers, this is attributed to advertisers' control over virtual influencers and their clean track record that is free from unsustainable practices. Virtual influencers demonstrated effective advertising effects in endorsing green products and proenvironmental campaign (Jiang et al., 2024; Yang, Chuenterawong, Lee, & Chock, 2023). In practice, BMW engaged Lil Miquela (@limiquela) to endorse its new energy vehicle, and WWF partnered with Noonoouri (@noonoouri) to promote the earth hour campaign. Utilizing virtual influencers to promote pro-environmental behaviors presents a promising pathway for tackling environmental challenges and motivating behavioral change.

### 1.3 | Research aim

Gerrath et al. (2024) have pointed out a significant gap in our current understanding of virtual influencers' impact on pro-environmental behavior. While a few research studies have investigated the effectiveness of human influencers in promoting pro-environmental behaviors (e.g., Boerman et al., 2022; Li et al., 2024), less attention has been paid to how audiences perceive and respond to environmental messages delivered by virtual influencers pertaining to different types of pro-environmental behaviors.

Existing studies on virtual influencers have primarily focused on anthropomorphic characteristics and their influence on audience behavior, often comparing human influencers, human-like virtual influencers, and animate-like virtual influencers (e.g., Arsenyan & Mirowska, 2021; Gutuleac et al., 2024), however little is known about other visual traits of virtual influencers (Yang, Chuenterawong, et al., 2023). Drawing upon social identity theory (Taifel, 1978), individuals tend to favors others who share similar characteristics. While the effect of homophily, where influencers and audiences share common characteristics, has been tested in influencer marketing research (Ladhari et al., 2020), the specific impact of racial homophily, recognized as a significant factor in developing social networks in the field of sociology (Leszczensky & Pink, 2019), remains largely unexplored in virtual influencer marketing. This study aims to bridge this gap by examining the interplay between anthropomorphism and racial homophily in shaping pro-environmental behaviors.

Recent studies have found virtual influencers are more effective in promoting certain products, such as technical products (Franke et al., 2023) and products focusing on functional features (Liu & Lee, 2024) than others. This could probably be explained by the matchup hypothesis that product-endorser congruence affects advertising effectiveness (Kamins, 1990). However, the effectiveness of virtual influencers in encouraging different types of pro-environmental behaviors is yet to be studied. Engagement in pro-environmental behaviors is influenced by various factors such as personal experience, knowledge, and other situational factors (Lauren et al., 2016; Truelove & Gillis, 2018). The low-cost hypothesis by Diekmann and Preisendörfer (2003) suggested that the perceived costs is the key factor influencer whether individuals carry out pro-environmental actions, and pro-environmental behaviors can broadly be categorized as low-cost and high-cost. Therefore, we investigate the impacts of virtual influencers' anthropomorphism and racial homophily in the context of both low- and high-cost pro-environmental behaviors.

By employing two online experimental studies, this research makes both theoretical and practical contributions. Primarily, the findings contribute to expanding knowledge base of virtual influencers (Arsenyan & Mirowska, 2021; Franke et al., 2023; Gutuleac et al., 2024) by examining the interaction effect of anthropomorphism and racial homophily on pro-environmental behaviors. The two studies in this research utilize materials generated by artificial intelligence, encompassing virtual influencers' avatars portraying human-like versus animate-like traits and local-like versus foreign-like characteristics. Leveraging images generated by artificial intelligence maintains higher

Psychology Warketing -WILEY- 15206793, 2024, 8, Downloaded from https

.wiley

com/doi/10.1002/mar.22013 by HONG KONG POLYTECHNIC UNIVERSITY HU NG HOM,

Wiley Online Library on [10/12/2024]. See the '

Terms

and Conditions

(https

telibrary

.wiley

on Wiley Online

Library for rules of use; OA articles

are governed by the applicable Creative Commons

level of consistency across visual stimuli used in different conditions, with only the relevant differences highlighted for the tested conditions (Kim et al., 2024). Moreover, each of our studies explores the contexts of low- and high-cost pro-environmental behaviors, this helps advance our understanding of virtual influencers' effectiveness in promoting different types of behaviors. Furthermore, this study provides practical implications for businesses and marketers on planning and formulating virtual influencer marketing campaigns in promoting sustainable consumption and lifestyles.

## 2 | LITERATURE REVIEW

## 2.1 | Virtual influencer and the advocation of pro-environmental behaviors

Social media influencers are individuals from everyday people to celebrities who create online contents that influences their followers (Hudders et al., 2021). A virtual influencer is a computer-generated character designed to simulate a human influencer and engage with audiences on social media platforms (Laszkiewicz & Kalinska-Kula, 2023). They are typically created using advanced 3D animation and artificial intelligence technologies. The terms virtual influencers and computer-generated imagery (CGI) influencers are often used interchangeably, however, virtual influencers differ from CGI influencers in several ways. CGI influencers originated from CGI characters are computer-generated characters that appear in movies, video games, and other forms of media (Hetherington & McRae, 2017). They are typically used to create realistic and visually appealing characters for entertainment purposes, such as Barbie (@Barbie), Pokémon (@pokemon). These CGI influencers have often extended their presence onto social media platforms nowadays. Virtual influencers, on the other hand, are designed specifically for social media and marketing purposes. They are created to engage with audiences, promote brands, and influence consumer behaviors. Virtual influencers possess distinct personalities, interests, and visual identities that enables them to connect with audiences and promote brands or products (Mouritzen et al., 2023), such as Lil Miquela (@limiquela), Noonoouri (@noonoouri), Imma (@imma.gram). Virtual YouTubers or VTubers is a distinct category of virtual influencers who specialize in creating video content and live streams (Conti et al., 2022), such as Kizuna Ai (@a.i.channel\_official), Ami Yamato (@amiyamato). In most cases, there are teams of people (e.g., animators, social media marketers, digital advertising agencies) working behind the scenes to create and manage virtual influencers, developing the character's backstory, personality, and visual appearance, as well as creating and publishing content on their social media channels.

Virtual influencers have advantages over human influencers because of their consistent image, low risk of indiscretions, and free from ethical issues related to brand attachment (Byun & Ahn, 2023; Tan, 2019). However, in a qualitative study by Moustakas et al. (2020), industry practitioners raised several challenges of virtual

influencer marketing. One key challenge of virtual influencers is to sustain interests among audiences and who may easily lose interest if they perceive virtual influencers as inauthentic, lacking human touch and appearing overly commercial (Sands et al., 2022). The practitioners also raised concerns about the initial investment required to develop virtual influencers, as well as the risks associated with poor strategy or execution, which could negatively impact a brand's image (Moustakas et al., 2020). Furthermore, ethical concerns, disclosure of virtual identity, projection of unattainable beauty standards, and cultivation of fabricated parasocial relationships, are hurdles for brands using virtual influencer, these highlight the importance of thorough deliberation and ethical consideration in the utilization of virtual influencers for marketing purposes (Kim & Wang, 2023). Despite the drawbacks associated with virtual influencers, the emerging trend of using virtual influencers in social media marketing will continue to be an important research topic, particularly in the age of generative artificial intelligence (Laszkiewicz & Kalinska-Kula. 2023). Virtual influencers provide brands with more flexibility and control compared to human influencers. They can, therefore, be designed specifically to advocate for target actions and social and environmental causes. Their messages and actions can be carefully crafted to maximize persuasive impact, as virtual influencers do not have opinions and act as messengers for brands and causes. This means their endorsement of environmentally friendly behaviors and promotion of more sustainable consumption patterns is less likely to be compromised by personal biases or commercial conflicts of interest (Byun & Ahn, 2023; Kim & Kim, 2021). Moreover, virtual influencers have the potential to reach and engage large audiences through their interactive presence on social media. If designed and leveraged effectively, they could help raise awareness of environmental issues and climate change amongst consumers, particularly younger generations that are active social media users (Pradhan et al., 2023).

Table 1 summarizes the recent studies examining virtual influencers' role in encouraging pro-environmental behaviors. These studies mainly investigated the virtual influencers' level of humanness (e.g., Jiang et al., 2024), message appeal (e.g., Gerrath et al., 2024), and interactivity (e.g., Yang, Chuenterawong, Lee, Tian, et al., 2023). While these studies contributed valuable insights into the use of virtual influencers for pro-environmental behaviors, they often focused on single and specific characteristics of the influencers that called for a more comprehensive understanding of the various components that constitute an effective virtual influencer campaign.

Virtual influencer research has explored various theoretical frameworks. This study, however, focuses on anthropomorphism theory (Duffy, 2003; Epley et al., 2007) to compare the impact of human-like versus animate-like virtual influencers, social identity theory (Tajfel, 1978) to analyze local-like versus foreign-like virtual influencers, and the low-cost hypothesis (Diekmann & Preisendörfer, 2003) to examine the interaction of anthropomorphism and racial homophily in low- and high-cost pro-environmental behavior contexts. The following subsections present the theoretical foundations and hypotheses of this paper.

•		_			
Reference	Theories used	Key focus	Methodology	Key findings	
Gerrath et al. (2024)	Stereotype content model	The impact of message warmth and trust in experts on virtual influencers' effectiveness in promoting environmental causes	Qualitative interviews, experimental studies	The impact of the message warmth of virtual influencers on audiences' pro-environmental engagement is mediated by social-psychological distance.	
Guo et al. (2023)	Theory of mind	The effectiveness of virtual avatars in promoting sustainable behaviors in hotels	Survey	Affective and cognitive trust influenced customer experience and engagement with the brand.	
Jiang et al. (2024)	Computers-as-social-actors paradigm	The effectiveness of using virtual influencers in green advertising	Experimental studies	Human-like virtual influencers had an advantage over animate-like virtual influencers for green product advertising, particularly for high-involvement products and pride appeals.	
Kleinlogel et al. (2023)	Social cognitive theory	The effectiveness of virtual avatars in promoting pro- environmental behaviors in virtual reality	Experimental studies	Virtual avatars (compared to print and video promotion) enhanced the promotional effectiveness of energy-saving attitudes and behaviors.	
Yang, Chuenterawong, Lee, Tian, et al. (2023)	Expectancy violation theory, source credibility theory	The role of virtual influencers' humanness and interactivity on climate change message	Experimental studies	The interaction effect of virtual influencers' humanness and interactivity strengthened the source credibility and subsequently influenced engagement of the climate change message	
Yang, Chuenterawong, Lee, Tian, et al. (2023)	Expectancy violation theory, source credibility theory	The impact of virtual influencers' humanness and congruence on the effectiveness of climate change messages	Experimental studies	Virtual influencers with a higher level of humanness elicited a higher level of expertise and trustworthiness, which in turn enhanced audiences' engagement	
This Study	Anthropomorphism theory, social identity theory, low-cost hypothesis	The role of anthropomorphism and racial homophily of virtual influencers in encouraging high versus low-cost pro-environmental behaviors	Experimental studies	Racial heterophily reduces the trust of animate-like virtual influencers in low-cost behaviors but increase trust of human-like virtual influencers in high-cost behaviors	

**TABLE 1** A summary of recent studies on virtual influencers and pro-environmental behaviors.

1836

# 2.2 | Anthropomorphism, trust, and pro-environmental behaviors

### 2.2.1 | Anthropomorphism in virtual influencers

Anthropomorphism refers to the attribution of human-like characteristics to nonhuman entities, such as animals, objects, or in this study, virtual influencers or other related technologies (Epley et al., 2007). Blut et al. (2021) highlighted in a recent meta-analysis on anthropomorphism the two divergent perspectives within anthropomorphism literature. One stream of research adopts anthropomorphism theory focusing its positive effects on technology use (e.g., Chiang et al., 2022; Letheren et al., 2021); another group of literature conversely emphasizes the negative effects of anthropomorphism and often references the uncanny valley theory (e.g., Arsenyan & Mirowska, 2021; Gutuleac et al., 2024). Although there may exist a threshold beyond which human-like entities become unsettling or eerie to users (Mori, 1970), a recent study by Kim et al. (2024) have examined the concept of ambivalence that individuals may experience a mix of feelings, including both coolness and uncanniness, when interacting with anthropomorphic virtual influencers. Therefore, unless the anthropomorphic features become unrealistic and overly sophisticated, carefully designed and implemented anthropomorphic features can enhance user engagement (Chiang et al., 2022). Based on the taxonomy of virtual influencers developed by Mouritzen et al. (2023) and drawing upon prior research (Arsenyan & Mirowska, 2021; Gutuleac et al., 2024), this study focuses on animate-like (low level of anthropomorphism) and human-like (high level of anthropomorphism) virtual influencers.

Animate-like virtual influencer is a virtual influencer with anime characters processing cartoonish representations of humans, such as exaggerated eyes and small mouths (Yang et al., 2020). Human-like virtual influencers appear exceedingly similar to humans and sometimes attempt to create a human-like experience with fans. Studies have found contradictory results on whether human-like or animate-like virtual influencers perform better in influencing audiences' attitudes and behavior. Some research found that human-like virtual influencers can elicit more robust emotional responses in audiences and are received more positively than those that are less human-like (Ozdemir et al., 2023), while others showed that animate-like virtual influencers are more influential (Arsenyan & Mirowska, 2021), depending on the outcome behaviors and mediating factors. Besides the arguments about whether animate-like or human-like virtual influencers are more effective in influencing audiences, the use of virtual influencers in the context of proenvironmental behaviors is limited. Yang, Chuenterawong, Lee, Tian, et al. (2023) recently found that human-like influencers drive consumers' corporate social responsibility engagement more effectively. Nevertheless, studies on driving individuals' sustainable behaviors are limited.

### 2.2.2 | Trust in virtual influencers

Trust in influencers refers to how honest, sincere, and truthful an influencer perceive to be, indicating whether they are seen as a

Psychology Warketing -WILEY-

.wiley.

com/doi/10.1002/mar.22013 by HONG KONG POLYTECHNIC UNIVERSITY HU NG HOM, Wiley Online Library on [10/12/2024]. See the 7

Term

(https

on Wiley Online Library for rules of use; OA articles are governed by the applicable Creative Commons

1837

source of unbiased and truthful information (Ohanian, 1990). Enhanced trust in influencers not only strengthens communication effectiveness but also fosters a rewarding relationship between influencers and their followers (Kim & Kim, 2021). Additionally, trust stands out as the most crucial success factor for influencers (Wiedmann & von Mettenheim, 2020). Boerman et al. (2022) demonstrated that the trustworthiness of green influencers positively influences audiences' intentions towards pro-environmental actions in environmental communication. Building on social exchange and source credibility theories (Homans, 1974; Hovland & Weiss, 1951), Kim and Kim (2021) proved source credibility and source attractiveness are the key factors sharping trust in influencers. Conversely, research in technology, particularly focused on service robots, particularly focused on service robots, chatbots, and similar technologies, has consistently demonstrated that anthropomorphism plays a significant role in bolstering levels of trust. For instance, De Visser et al. (2016) proposed a theory of human-agent trust and demonstrated that anthropomorphism positively affects trust in automated cognitive agents and a higher resistance to breakdowns in trust, Wu et al. (2023)'s study in shared autonomous vehicles showed that anthropomorphism in physical appearance and communication mode contributed to an increased level of trust, and Van Pinxteren et al. (2019) showed that anthropomorphism drives trust in humanoid service robots. Do et al. (2021) found that when an anthropomorphic virtual character is added to green messages, audiences become more receptive to the recommended green initiatives. Hofeditz et al. (2022)'s study compared human and virtual influencers, revealing that a higher level of anthropomorphism, such as that found in human influencers, results in increased trustworthiness. Thus the following hypothesis is proposed:

**Hypothesis 1 (H1).** Virtual influencers with high anthropomorphism (i.e., human-like virtual influencers) elicit higher levels of trust compared to virtual influencers with low anthropomorphism (i.e., animate-like virtual influencers).

## 2.2.3 | Trust in virtual influencers and pro-environmental behaviors

The relationship between trust and prop-environmental behavior is extensively studied in social science literature. For example, Tam and Chan (2018) showed that a higher level of trust increases individuals' engagement in pro-environmental behaviors. Cologna et al. (2022) also demonstrated that trust in climate scientists positively influences the willingness to adopt pro-environmental actions. Furthermore, Joffe-Nelson et al. (2024) proved that trust in regulatory institutions enhances pro-environmental intentions in outdoor recreation contexts. These findings collectively demonstrated the influential role of trust in various entities and its significant role in promoting proenvironmental behaviors. Trust in influencers is a crucial factor driving a range of positive outcomes, including enhancing loyalty, influencing purchase decisions, and motivating intentions to follow

recommendations (Chetioui et al., 2020; Kim & Kim, 2021; Lou & Yuan, 2019). When individuals perceive influencers as trustworthy sources of information and guidance, they are more likely to adopt pro-environmental behaviors advocated by these influencers (Boerman et al., 2022). Trust can also shape individuals' perceptions of environmental issues and strengthen the motivation to engage in sustainable practices (Pittman & Abell, 2021). Therefore, understanding trust in virtual influencers and its impact on pro-environmental behaviors is crucial for developing effective influencer marketing strategies and promoting sustainable lifestyles. The following hypothesis is proposed:

**Hypothesis 2 (H2).** Trust in virtual influencers positively affects pro-environmental behaviors

## 2.3 | Racial homophily in low- versus high-cost pro-environmental behaviors

#### 2.3.1 | Racial homophily of virtual influencers

The social identity theory (Tajfel, 1978) suggested that individuals derive a sense of identity from their membership in social category or group and individuals often favor their own group over others. In sociological literature, homophily refers to similarity among individuals, it affects the development of friendship and social networks based on the preferences to connect with similar others (e.g., Hafen et al., 2011; Kandel, 2017). In the context of social media marketing, homophily drives individuals to connect and engage with social media influencers who share similar characteristics or interests as themselves, promotes authenticity judgments through increased feelings of understanding and trust (De Veirman et al., 2017). When audiences perceive an influencer as similar to themselves, they are more likely to find the influencer credible and trust their recommendations (Schouten et al., 2021). Homophily has consistently been proved as a significant factor influencing audiences engagement (Bu et al., 2022; Shoenberger & Kim, 2023).

When audiences perceive similarities between themselves and a message source, it leads to feelings of trust and goodwill toward that source (Kim & Kim, 2021). Audiences are more willing to believe a source "like me" provides accurate information and has their best interests at heart rather than some hidden agenda (Centeno & Wang, 2020). However, on the one hand, virtual influencers cannot be perfectly similar to diverse audiences due to their digital nature. On the other hand, virtual influencers can be tailor-made to be closely similar to the audiences to be reached using highly targeted digital platforms. Homophily is often conceptualized as similarity in appearance, value, attitude, and socioeconomic status (Ladhari et al., 2020), but racial similarity remains relatively underexplored in influencer marketing research and other digital contexts (Azer et al., 2023). This study utilizes foreign-like and local-like virtual influencers to represent low and high levels of racial homophily respectively.

## 2.3.2 | Low- versus high-cost pro-environmental behaviors

According to low-cost hypothesis (Diekmann & Preisendörfer, 2003), individuals' perception of the costs affects their willingness to engage in pro-environmental behavior and therefore influences their likelihood of taking sustainable actions. Low-cost pro-environmental behaviors typically require low level of effort, such as reusing shopping bags (Arias & Trujillo, 2020), reduction of household energy use (Kothe et al., 2019) and recycling household waste (Andersson & von Borgstede, 2010). High-cost pro-environmental behaviors demand higher costs or effort changes, for example, choosing sustainable transportation over personal vehicles (Ahmat Zainuri et al., 2022), paying extra for sustainable products (Moser, 2015), and using higher-priced eco-friendly travel products (Yin, 2023).

Research has shown that environmental messages highlighting the ease of behaviors like recycling are more effective at promoting action than focusing on more costly behaviors (Gifford & Nilsson, 2014). This is because emphasizing ease alleviates concerns about the costs and difficulties of changing behaviors and allows individuals to feel that their daily routines are affected with minimal disruption (Uren et al., 2021; Wyss et al., 2022). Social media plays an important role in encouraging pro-environmental behaviors, primarily by fostering interpersonal communication (Han & Xu, 2020) and facilitating the sharing of relevant information (Shen et al., 2023). Prior studies have demonstrated that influencers can effectively shape followers' sustainable behaviors (e.g., Dekoninck & Schmuck, 2022), research has yet to address the potential differences between the effectiveness of influencers in promoting low-cost versus high-cost pro-environmental behaviors. Therefore, it is important to explore how virtual influencers can impact both types of pro-environmental behaviors. This would shed light on formulating successful strategies for virtual influencer campaigns. Following the categorization proposed by Uren et al. (2021), this study selected two distinct pro-environmental behaviors, that is, opting out of cutlery in food delivery orders as a representation of low-cost proenvironmental behavior and purchasing carbon offsets as a highcost pro-environmental behavior.

### 2.3.3 | The moderating role of racial homophily

Robots and other virtual entities can display racial characteristics and users are able to identify these difference (Sparrow, 2019). Prior studies in different contexts, such as online reviews and interactions with Al bots, has revealed the impact of racial characteristics affecting audiences' perceptions and behaviors (Azer et al., 2023; Bozkurt et al., 2021; Davis et al., 2023). Although previous sociological studies have highlighted the significant role of racial homophily in shaping interpersonal relationships in both offline and online settings (Hofstra et al., 2017; McPherson et al., 2001), its impact may vary (Antonoplis & John, 2022; Leszczensky & Pink, 2019). For instance, McDonald et al. (2013) discovered that racial homophily influences the initial

development of relationships but not their stability. Wimmer and Lewis (2010) also showed that racial background only partially explains the formation of social relationships on social media platforms. Therefore, racial homophily serves as a convenient shortcut for customers for making quick decisions.

In the literature of celebrity endorsement, there are mixed results regarding the impact of racial homophily. While some studies found that endorsers who matched the customer's ethnicity were found to be more persuasive (Erba et al., 2019; Hesapci et al., 2016), others reported that race of endorsers did not have any insignificant impact on customers' attitudes and perception (Apaolaza et al., 2014; Bui, 2017). However, Lord et al. (2019) provide further insights on how that racial homophily influences customers' evaluation of endorsers' attractiveness and trustworthiness in different behavioral contexts, the study findings showed than racial homophily is particularly impactful in contexts of simpler consumer decisionmaking, rather than in situations involving high-involvement information processing. Several recent studies have investigated the specific circumstances under which racial homophily exerts an influence on the audiences. For example, Tong and Su (2021) found that aligning endorser's ethnicity and products' country-of-origin enhances customers' quality perception and brand attitudes. Similarly, and Li et al. (2022) showed that celebrity endorsement in tourism destination marketing is most effective when the celebrity originates from the destination country. These studies collectively suggested that the impact of racial homophily is dependent upon the behavioral contexts.

While social media influencers' racial homophily plays role in influencing customers' perception (Yu & Hu, 2020), local influencers are proved to be effective for functional goods while foreign influencers are more impactful for promoting symbolic goods (Zhu et al., 2019). In this study, opting out of cutlery in food delivery orders is selected as a low-cost pro-environmental behavior and that is often perceived as a simple and practical action. As audiences tend to rely on the source's race for quick decisions, racial homophily is hypothesized to strengthen the relationship between anthropomorphism and trust in virtual influencers in the low-cost behavioral context. Conversely, purchasing carbon offsets, considered as a high-cost pro-environmental behaviors in this study, impose financial burden on customers (Huang et al., 2020) and is associated with

personal status and uniqueness (Liu et al., 2015). Therefore, considering potential symbolic value of the high-cost proenvironmental behaviors, utilizing a foreign-like virtual influencers would strengthen the impact of anthropomorphism on trust in virtual influencers. The hypotheses are proposed as follows.

**Hypothesis 3a (H3a).** Virtual influencers with high racial homophily (i.e., local-like virtual influencers) strengthen the relationship between anthropomorphism and trust in the context of low-cost pro-environmental behaviors.

**Hypothesis 3b (H3b).** Virtual influencers with low racial homophily (i.e., foreign-like virtual influencers) strengthen the relationship between anthropomorphism and trust in the context of high-cost pro-environmental behaviors.

Based on the literature mentioned above, the research model is presented in Figure 1.

## 3 | OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH DESIGN

### 3.1 | Study design

This research consists of two online experimental studies that collectively contribute a comprehensive understanding of the role of anthropomorphism and racial homophily in promoting proenvironmental behaviors in both low-cost and high-cost scenarios. Artificial intelligence has become widespread in marketing activities (Karnouskos, 2020; Kietzmann et al., 2018). With the accelerated adoption of generative artificial intelligence, consumers' acceptance of artificial intelligence has also increased. The adoption of generative artificial intelligence in content marketing of virtual influencers will soon become a norm (Insider, 2023). Both studies in this paper leveraged AI-generated materials, this ensures the consistency across virtual influencers while highlighting relevant differences for the tested conditions (Kim et al., 2024).

Study 1 investigates the interaction of anthropomorphism and racial homophily in virtual influencers on audience trust and the



on [10/12/2024]. See the "

Terms

and Conditions

(https

.willey

on Wiley Online Library for

of use; OA articles

are governed by the applicable Creative Commons

15206793, 2024, 8, Downloaded from

https:

rary.wiley.

com/doi/10.1002/mar.22013 by HONG KONG POLYTECHNIC UNIVERSITY HU NG HOM, Wiley Online Library

1839

subsequent impact on audience intentions to engage in low-cost pro-environmental behaviors. Study 2 expands this inquiry to the context of high-cost pro-environmental behaviors. Understanding these dynamics is crucial for businesses and marketers aiming to develop effective virtual influencer marketing strategies for proenvironmental advocacy.

#### 3.2 | Data collection

Participants will be recruited online by a Chinese research agency, their panel covers over 300 million Chinese consumers and is widely representative of the population. The study focuses on Chinese customers because of the country's significant number of social media users (Ruby, 2023) and the pressing need to address environmental challenges (Khan et al., 2022). The minimum sample size is estimated by G\*Power 3.1 software (Faul et al., 2009). For the two studies involving four experimental groups, using a significance level of 5%, under a power of 95%, and an estimated medium effect size of 0.25, at least 279 respondents should be recruited for each study.

#### 3.3 | Measures

In addition to the experimental conditions (i.e., anthropomorphism and racial homophily), the measurement items of trust and proenvironmental intentions are measured on a 7-point scale (1 = Strongly Disagree to 7 = Strongly Agree). These measurement items were adapted from validated scales used in previous studies (see Appendix A). Participants were also required to provide their responses to two control variables, that is, environmental identity and perceived behavioral control, and this helps ensure the findings are unaffected by any pre-existing conditions or external factors during the data analysis process. In addition, respondents' demographic information, including gender, age, and educational level, and their responses to the manipulation check questions were collected.

#### 3.4 | Data analysis

Analysis of variance (ANOVA) would be performed to confirm the difference among the respondents in different experimental groups in terms of their responses to the manipulation questions. Two-way ANCOVA, with demographic variables (gender, age, and educational level) and the two continuous control variables (environmental identity and perceived behavioral control) as co-variates, would also be performed to test the main and interaction effect of anthropomorphism and racial homophily on trust in virtual influencers. To collectively test the relationships hypothesized in the research model, PROCESS MACRO v4.2 (Hayes, 2018) would be employed (95% confidence interval; 10,000 bootstrap samples).

### 4 | STUDY 1

### 4.1 | Design, participants, stimuli, and procedures

The purpose of Study 1 was to examine how the virtual influencer's level of anthropomorphism and racial homophily affect trust in the virtual influencers and pro-environmental intentions. A 2 (animatelike vs. human-like virtual influencer) × 2 (foreign-like vs. local-like virtual influencer) between-subjects experimental design was employed. Four fictitious social media posts were created with both virtual influencer's profile avatars and the message generated by artificial intellgience. The platforms used, prompts, and outputs are presented in Appendix B. Study 1 focuses on the low-cost proenvironmental behavior of using reusable cutlery during food delivery due to its popularity (Mehrolia et al., 2021) and the significant rise in single-use cutlery usage worldwide (Janairo, 2021; Molina-Besch, 2020). Therefore, this choice of pro-environmental behavior resonates with the respondents' daily experiences requiring minimal cost and makes it easier for respondents to connect with their own experiences. Each condition comprised a different virtual influencer's profile picture but the same message encouraging the use of reusable cutlery in food delivery orders (see Appendix B).

The market research agency recruited 414 Chinese individuals who participated in Study 1 (age range: 18–60; 41.5% male, 58.5% female). Participants were randomly assigned to one of the four experimental conditions. *N* for each condition was ranged from 102 to 104. Participants were first presented with the randomly assigned social media post; they were then requested to complete an online survey that included the variables in the research model, control variables, demographic questions, and manipulation checks questions.

#### 4.2 Results

#### 4.2.1 | Manipulation checks

One-way ANOVA was conducted to evaluate the success of both animate-like versus human-like and foreign-like versus local-like virtual influencers manipulations. As expected, respondents in the animate-like condition rated their perception of the virtual influencers higher as "like an animate character" than those in human-like condition ( $M_{Animate} = 5.74$ ,  $M_{Human} = 2.09$ , p < 0.001). By contrast, respondents in human-like condition rated the virtual influencer as "like a real person" than those in animate-like condition ( $M_{Animate}$  = 2.34,  $M_{\text{Human}}$  = 5.98, p < 0.001). The items checking the foreign-like and local-virtual influencer manipulations asked respondents whether the virtual influencer resembled "a foreigner" or "a local person" and the responses demonstrated the expected difference between the respondents assigned to both conditions. Respondents in the foreign-like virtual influencer condition rated the virtual influencer as "a foreigner" significantly higher ( $M_{\text{Foreign}} = 6.21$ ,  $M_{\text{Local}} = 2.04$ , p < 0.001). Respondents in local-like virtual influencer condition rated

their perception of the virtual influencer higher as "a local person" than those in the foreign-like virtual influencer condition ( $M_{\text{Foreign}}$  = 1.86,  $M_{\text{Local}}$  = 5.95, p < 0.001). In sum, both manipulations were successful.

#### 4.2.2 | Hypothesis testing

A two-way ANCOVA analysis was performed to test the main and interaction effects of anthropomorphism (animate-like coded as 0 vs. human-like coded as 1) and racial homophily (foreign-like coded as 0 vs. local-like coded as 1) on trust in the virtual influencer. As explained above, we included three demographic variables, that is gender, age and education level, and two continuous variables, that is, environmental identity and perceived behavioral control, as control variables in the analysis. The results showed that the main effect of anthropomorphism on trust was significant ( $M_{Animate} = 5.433$ ,  $M_{Human} = 5.783$ , F = 22.170, p < 0.001,  $\eta^2 = 0.052$ ) in which high level of anthropomorphism (human-like virtual influencer) elicited a higher level of trust than low level of anthropomorphism (animate-like virtual influencer). Thus, H1 was supported. The main effect of racial homophily was also significant (M<sub>Foreign</sub> = 5.463, M<sub>Local</sub> = 5.752, F = 15.071, p < 0.001,  $n^2 = 0.036$ ) in that high level of racial homophily, that is local-like virtual influencer, elicited a higher level of trust than foreign-like virtual influencer. Furthermore, the interaction effect was significant (F = 4.698, p < 0.05,  $\eta^2 = 0.011$ ). Follow-up contrast showed that participants in the animate-foreign condition (M<sub>Animate-Foreign</sub> = 5.207) reported a significantly lower level of trust compared with those in animate-local ( $M_{Animate-Local} = 5.658$ , p < 0.001) and human-foreign  $(M_{Human-Foreign} = 5.846, p < 0.001)$  conditions (see Figure 2). H3a was partially supported because high racial homophily did not strengthen the impact of anthropomorphism in the context of low-cost proPsychology WILFY 1841

environmental behaviors, instead racial heterophily, that is, low racial homophily, was found diminish the trust level when anthropomorphism was low (i.e. animate-like virtual influencer).

To collectively test the manipulated and measured variables, a moderated mediation analysis utilizing PROCESS MACRO v4.2 Model 7 (Hayes, 2018) was conducted (95% confidence interval; 10,000 bootstrap samples). Anthropomorphism (0 = animate-like; 1 = human-like was included as independent variable, racial homophily (0 = foreign-like; 1 = local-like) as a moderator, trust as mediator and pro-environmental intention (to opt-out cutlery in food delivery order) as dependent variable. The control variables were the same as the ANCOVA analysis. The index of moderated mediation was significant (Index = -0.0439, SE = 0.0250, CI = [-0.0989, -0.0022]) indicating that the effect of anthropomorphism on pro-environmental intention via trust was conditional on racial homophily.

Specifically, the results showed a significant positive relationship between anthropomorphism and trust ( $\beta = 0.5125$ , SE = 0.1058, *p* < 0.001, CI = [0.3045, 0.7206]), indicating higher levels of anthropomorphism lead to greater trust in the virtual influencer. The effect of racial homophily was also positively significant  $(\beta = 0.4514, SE = 0.1051, p < 0.001, CI = [0.2447, 0.6580]), suggest$ ing that high level of homophily contributes to greater trust. There was a negative significant interaction effect of anthropomorphism and racial homophily on trust ( $\beta = -0.3249$ , SE = 0.1499, p < 0.05, CI = [-0.6196, -0.0302]). Therefore, H1 was supported. The conditional effect of anthropomorphism at different values of racial homophily revealed that when racial homophily was low (i.e., foreign-like virtual influencer), the effect of anthropomorphism on trust was positive and significant ( $\beta = 0.5125$ , SE = 0.1058. p < 0.001, CI = [0.3045, 0.7206]). This indicates that human-like traits enhance the level of trust in a foreign-like virtual influencer.



FIGURE 2 Effect of anthropomorphism and racial homophily on trust in virtual influencers (Study 1).

However, the effect of anthropomorphism on trust was insignificant when racial homophily was high (i.e., local-like virtual influencer) ( $\beta = 0.1876$ , SE = 0.1053, p = 0.0756, CI = [-0.0194, 0.3947]). H3a was partially supported as the impact of anthropomorphism on trust was only significant when the race of the virtual influencer was perceived as different from the audiences (low in racial homophily). Considering the pro-environmental intentions, the direct effect of anthropomorphism on the pro-environmental intentions was insignificant ( $\beta = -0.1184$ , SE = 0.0728, p = 0.1048, CI = [-0.2616, 0.0248]). However, the relationship between trust and pro-environmental intentions was significant ( $\beta$  = 0.1352, SE = 0.0463, p < 0.05, CI = [0.0441, 0.2263]) and thus H2 was supported. The results also indicated a significant conditional indirect effect of anthropomorphism on pro-environmental intentions, particularly at low level of racial homophily ( $\beta = -0.0693$ , SE = 0.0693, CI = [0.0188, 0.1335]) but not at high level ( $\beta = 0.0254$ , SE = 0.0185, CI = [-0.0004, 0.0699]).

#### 5 | STUDY 2

#### 5.1 | Design, participants, stimuli, and procedures

Study 2 aimed to replicate the findings from Study 1 within the context of high-cost pro-environmental behaviors. This involved focusing on purchasing carbon offsets, a high-cost pro-environmental action with notable financial implications (Huber et al., 2018; del Saz Salazar & Pérez y Pérez, 2021). While the voluntary carbon offset schemes are gaining popularity among Chinese consumers (Wu et al., 2024), there is still a need to explore strategies to encourage more customers to engage in such high-cost pro-environmental action (Liu et al., 2015; Truong-Dinh et al., 2023). Additionally, Study 2 employed distinct sets of virtual influencer avatars and messages, further validating the generalizability of the findings in a broader context. Same as Study 1, the materials for Study 2 were generated using artificial intelligence for a 2 (animate-like vs. human-like virtual influencer) × 2 (foreign-like vs. local-like virtual influencer) between-subjects experimental design. To ensure the generated message resonated with the audiences, the prompt incorporated realistic data on carbon emissions and the pricing of carbon offset schemes (Liu & Jiang, Peng, et al., 2024; The World Bank, 2024). Four fictitious social media posts were created, and the platforms used, prompts, and outputs are presented in Appendix C. Following the same protocol of Study 1, we recruited 402 Chinese individuals through the commissioned marketing research agency (age range: 18-60; 54.0% male, 46.0% female). Participants were randomly assigned to one of the four experimental conditions. N for each condition ranged from 99 to 103. After the participants were presented with the assigned social media post, they would complete an online survey that included the variables in the research model, control variables, demographic questions, and manipulation check questions. Different from Study 1, the pro-environmental behaviors were measured by whether the participants chose to click the "Buy Now" button included in the social media posts.

### 5.2 | Results

#### 5.2.1 | Manipulation checks

One-way ANOVA was conducted to evaluate the success of both anthropomorphism (animate-like vs. human-like) and racial homophily (foreign-like vs. local-like) virtual influencers manipulations. Respondents in the animate-like condition rated their perception of the virtual influencers higher as "like an animate character" than those in human-like condition ( $M_{Animate} = 5.78$ ,  $M_{Human} = 2.22$ , p < 0.001). On the other hand, respondents in human-like condition rated the virtual influencer as "like a real person" than those in animate-like condition ( $M_{Animate} = 2.31$ ,  $M_{Human} = 5.71$ , p < 0.001). Furthermore, two items were included for checking the success of foreign-like and localvirtual influencer manipulations by asking respondents whether the virtual influencer resembled "a foreigner" or "a local person." Respondents in the foreign-like virtual influencer condition rated the virtual influencer as "a foreigner" significantly higher ( $M_{\text{Foreign}}$  = 5.85,  $M_{Local} = 2.09$ , p < 0.001). Respondents in local-like virtual influencer condition rated their perception of the virtual influencer higher as "a local person" than those in the foreign-like virtual influencer condition ( $M_{\text{Foreign}}$  = 2.21,  $M_{\text{Local}}$  = 5.81, p < 0.001). Overall, both manipulations were successful.

### 5.2.2 | Hypothesis testing

A two-way ANCOVA analysis was performed to test the main and interaction effects of anthropomorphism (animate-like coded as 0 vs. human-like coded as 1) and racial homophily (foreign-like coded as 0 vs. local-like coded as 1) on trust in the virtual influencer. The same control variables as Study 1, three demographic and two continuous variables, were included as co-variates. The results showed that the main effect of anthropomorphism on trust was significant ( $M_{Animate}$  = 4.596,  $M_{\text{Human}} = 5.086$ , F = 22.170, p < 0.001,  $\eta^2 = 0.045$ ) in which high level of anthropomorphism (human-like virtual influencer) elicited a higher level of trust than low level of anthropomorphism (animate-like virtual influencer). Thus, H1 was supported. However, the main effect of racial homophily was insignificant ( $M_{\text{Foreign}} = 4.947$ ,  $M_{\text{Local}} = 4.736$ , F = 3.469, p = 0.063,  $\eta^2 = 0.009$ ). This suggested that the racial homophily did not lead to significant difference on trust in the virtual influencers. Furthermore, the interaction effect was significant (F = 4.096, p < 0.05,  $\eta^2 = 0.010$ ). Further pairwise comparisons showed that the human-foreign condition elicited a higher level of trust than human-animate condition (M<sub>Animate-Foreign</sub> = 4.588,  $M_{\text{Human-Foreign}}$  = 5.306, p < 0.001). This provided further insights on the main effect of anthropomorphism that virtual influencers in high level of anthropomorphism (human-like) elicited stronger trust than virtual influencers in low level of anthropomorphism (animate-like) when racial homophily was low. In addition, participants in humanforeign condition reported a higher level of trust than those in human-local condition ( $M_{Human-Foreign} = 5.306$ ,  $M_{Human-Local} = 4.866$ , p < 0.01). This supported H3b that, in the context of high-cost pro-



FIGURE 3 Effect of anthropomorphism and racial homophily on trust in virtual influencers (Study 2).

environmental behaviors, virtual influencers in low level of racial homophily (foreign-like) generated a higher level of trust than those in high level (local-like) when anthropomorphism was high. The graphical presentation of these results is shown in Figure 3.

A moderated mediation analysis utilizing PROCESS MACRO v4.2 Model 7 (Hayes, 2018) was conducted (95% CI; 10,000 bootstrap samples) was conducted in testing the effect of all manipulated and measured variables. Anthropomorphism (0 = animate-like; 1 = human-like was included as independent variable, racial homophily (0 = foreign-like; 1 = local-like) as a moderator, trust as mediator, and pro-environmental behavior (0 = not buy; 1 = buy) as dependent variable. The control variables were the same as previous analyses. The index of moderated mediation was significant (Index = -0.5349, SE = 0.2975, CI = [-1.1939, -0.0208]) indicating that the effect of anthropomorphism on proenvironmental intention via trust was conditional on racial homophily.

Specifically, the results showed anthropomorphism had a significant positive relationship with trust ( $\beta = 0.7180$ , SE = 0.1598, p < 0.001, CI = [0.4039, 1.0321]), this suggested that a higher level of anthropomorphism leads to a higher level of trust in the virtual influencer. Thus, H1 was supported. However, the effect of racial homophily was insignificant ( $\beta = 0.0170$ , SE = 0.1589, p = 0.9146, CI = [-0.2954, 0.3295]). There was a negative significant interaction effect of anthropomorphism and racial homophily on trust ( $\beta = -0.4565$ , SE = 0.2255, p < 0.05, CI = [-0.8999, -0.0130). By examining the conditional effect of anthropomorphism at different values of racial homophily, the effect of anthropomorphism on trust was positive and significant (β = 0.7180, SE = 0.1598, p < 0.001, CI = [0.4039, 1.0321]) when racial homophily was low (i.e., foreign-like virtual influencer). This implied that the trust level of a foreign-like virtual influencers can be enhanced by utilizing anthropomorphic (i.e., more human-like) features. However, the effect of anthropomorphism on trust was insignificant when racial homophily was high (i.e., local-like virtual influencer) ( $\beta$  = 0.2615, SE = 0.1599, *p* = 0.1027, CI = [-0.0529, 0.5759]). H3b was supported as trust level was highest when the virtual influencer had a high level of

anthropomorphism and a low level of racial homophily (i.e., humanforeign virtual influencer). Regarding the outcome variable, the direct effect of anthropomorphism on the pro-environmental behavior was insignificant ( $\beta$  = -0.4689, SE = 0.2648, *p* = 0.0766, CI = [-0.9880, 0.0501]). However, the relationship between trust and proenvironmental behavior was significant ( $\beta$  = 1.1718, SE = 0.1443, *p* < 0.001, CI = [0.8889, 1.4547]) and thus H2 was supported. The results also indicated a significant conditional indirect effect of anthropomorphism on pro-environmental intentions at low level of racial homophily ( $\beta$  = 0.8413, SE = 0.2372, CI = [0.4531, 1.3734]) but not at high level ( $\beta$  = 0.3065, SE = 0.1954, CI = [-0.0678, 0.7022]).

The key findings of both Studies 1 and 2 are presented in Figure 4.

#### 6 | GENERAL DISCUSSION

#### 6.1 | Theoretical implications

This research makes a twofold contribution to academic literature. First, this research advances the understanding of virtual influencers by examining the interaction effect of anthropomorphism and racial homophily. Prior studies often examined how the level of anthropomorphism influencer customer perception and engagement and these studies often compared human influencers, human-like virtual influencers, and animate-like virtual influencers with markedly different appearances (e.g., Arsenyan & Mirowska, 2021; Jiang et al., 2024). Drawing upon the social identity theory (Tajfel, 1978), this study extends the current research on virtual influencers by examining the moderating role of racial homophily. Prior studies often examined the concept of homophily based on appearance and attitude similarity between influencers and their audiences (e.g., Bu et al., 2022; Gupta et al., 2023), this research provides a novel perspective in virtual influencer marketing. Second, the two 1844 WILEY- Marketing Racial Homophily foreign-like vs. local-like

> Study 1:  $\beta = -.32 *$ Study 2:  $\beta = -.46 *$

Study 1: β = .51 \*\*\*

Study 2:  $\beta = .72 ***$ 

Trust in Virtual

Influencers



FIGURE 4 The key findings in Studies 1 and 2.

Anthropomorphism

animate-like vs. human-like

experimental studies examined the research model in the context of low-cost and high-cost pro-environmental behaviors respectively. Although several studies have examined the role of virtual influencers in promoting pro-environmental behaviors (e.g., Gerrath et al., 2024; Guo et al., 2023), these studies did not adequately examine the perceived costs to the audiences that could potentially influencer their willingness to engage in the respective pro-environmental behaviors (Huang et al., 2020; Uren et al., 2021). Drawing upon the low-cost hypotheses by Diekmann and Preisendörfer (2003), our study explores how perceived costs for engaging in a proenvironmental behavior may call for tailored design approaches for virtual influencers.

The findings of the two experimental studies demonstrated that the impact of anthropomorphism is dependent upon racial homophily. Building upon prior sociological studies (e.g., Antonoplis & John, 2022) and match-up hypothesis (Kamins, 1990), racial homophily is considered as a mental shortcut for decision making and this is often useful for quick and impulsive decisions. Nevertheless, racial heterophily between the message sources and their audiences appears to be an effective option in the context of celebrity endorsement for symbolic products (Schouten et al., 2021; Tong & Su, 2021; Yu & Hu, 2020). Consistent with prior studies (Blut et al., 2021; So et al., 2023), both studies in this research confirmed that the level of anthropomorphism enhances the level of trust in virtual influencers by comparing animate-like and human-like virtual influencers generated by artificial intelligence. Additionally, our study specifically demonstrated that level of trust would be further diminished when an animate-like (low in anthropomorphism) and foreign-like (low in racial homophily) virtual influencer is employed, particularly in the context of low-cost pro-environmental behaviors. Nevertheless, in high-cost pro-environmental behavior, human-like (high in anthropomorphism) and foreign-like (low in racial homophily) virtual influencer is the most effective in eliciting trust from the audiences. These findings extend the current research on virtual influencers by not only investigating their potential in promoting proenvironmental behaviors, but also their racial homophily to the audiences and its influence on both low-cost and high-cost proenvironmental behaviors. To the best of our knowledge, this is the

first empirical investigation in virtual influencer research to examine the interaction effect of anthropomorphism and racial homophily on pro-environmental behaviors at different cost levels.

**Pro-environmental** 

Behavior

Study 1 – Low-cost Behavior

Study 2 - High-cost Behavior

Note: \* p < 0.05, \*\* p < 0.01, \*\*\* p < 0.001

### 6.2 | Managerial implications

Study 1:  $\beta = 14^{\circ}$ 

Study 2:  $\beta = .1.17^{-1}$ 

Our findings offer valuable insights for businesses and marketers promoting pro-environmental behaviors. Virtual influencers with human-like traits can effectively encourage sustainable practices and lifestyles among social media audiences. Therefore, the anthropomorphic characteristics of virtual influencers should be carefully considered and designed for enhancing trust and subsequently motivating pro-environmental actions.

Racial homophily, that is, whether the virtual influencers look ethnically similar to the audiences, should also be thoroughly evaluated in pro-environmental campaigns. For low-cost and straightforward pro-environmental behaviors, such as recycling, reusing shopping bags, virtual influencers should not possess characteristics of an animated character resembling a foreigner. In high-cost pro-environmental behaviors, such as changing transportation means, purchasing carbon offsets, virtual influencers with human-like characteristics resembling a foreigner are the most effective. Therefore, businesses and marketers are suggested to first assess the costs associated with the target pro-environmental behaviors before designing virtual influencers or considering potential collaborations with them. Artificial intelligence has the potential to assist marketing activities on digital channels, such as crafting promotional messages and monitoring customer behaviors and sentiment (Karnouskos, 2020; Kietzmann et al., 2018). This technological approach can create highly effective pro-environmental messages that influence audiences' behaviors (Cooper, 2023).

To enhance trust, businesses can consider collaborating with well-known and successful local or foreign virtual influencers to raise awareness about climate changes and environmental causes and promote pro-environmental behaviors. However, as discussed above, the targeted pro-environmental behaviors should be carefully evaluated in terms of the costs to the audiences. For example,

15206793, 2024, 8, Downloaded from https:

nelibrary.wiley.

com/doi/10.1002/mar.22013 by HONG KONG POLYTECHNIC UNIVERSITY HU NG HOM, Wiley Online Library on [10/12/2024]. See the 7

Term

.willey

on Wiley Online Library for rules of use; OA articles are governed by the applicable Creative Commons

marketers can collaborate with Lil Miquela, Liu Yexi, or Imma, who are well-known virtual influencers from America, China, and Japan respectively (Yu et al., 2024; Zhou et al., 2023). These collaborations can involve sharing promotional messages to their followers on social media regarding adopting pro-environmental behaviors in daily life.

### 6.3 | Study limitations and future research

While this study provides insights into the critical aspects of virtual influencers in the context of pro-environmental behaviors, it is essential to acknowledge its limitations. First, all the studies were based on the responses from Chinese customers, which calls for future research to verify the findings of this research in other cultural contexts, particularly the impact of racial homophily. Second, cross-sectional studies were conducted in this research; the continuance of proenvironmental attitudes and behaviors influenced by virtual influencers may be investigated using a longitudinal research design. Third, the research employed the virtual influencer avatar and messages generated by specific generative artificial intelligence platforms, future research may investigate the outputs of different artificial intelligence technologies and platforms for business and marketing purposes. The messages generated for this research included emoji that may be a factor influencing message persuasiveness and warrants further investigation in future studies (Baek et al., 2022). Lastly, this research examined the pro-environmental behaviors of opting-out cutlery in food delivery and purchasing carbon offsets, future studies may attempt to investigate other types of pro-environmental behaviors and prosocial behaviors. This helps understand the potential or limitations of virtual influencers for the greater good.

## 7 | CONCLUSIONS

In summary, this study examined how anthropomorphism and racial homophily of virtual influencers in motivating pro-environmental behaviors. Our research revealed the effectiveness of human-like virtual influencers in encouraging pro-environmental actions. Moreover, the moderating role of racial homophily in low-cost and high-cost pro-environmental behaviors was examined. The results showed that low racial homophily (foreign-like virtual influencer) diminishes the trust level when a virtual influencer with low anthropomorphism (animate-like virtual influencer) is employed. By contrast, the trust level is enhanced by utilizing a virtual influencer with high anthropomorphism and low racial homophily (human- and foreign-like virtual influencer) for promoting high-cost pro-environmental behaviors. These findings contribute to the theoretical understanding of the two key visual traits of virtual influencers. Third, our study applied generative artificial intelligence in creating virtual influencers' images and crafting messages. This research utilized images generated by artificial intelligence and this helps ensure consistency across virtual influencers used in different conditions, with only the relevant

differences highlighted for the tested conditions (Kim et al., 2024) and suggested a promising avenue for methodological development in future studies (Qasem, 2023; Rahman et al., 2023).

This study provides valuable insights for businesses and marketers and the potential of using virtual influencers to drive sustainability practices. Marketers can create human-like virtual influencers or collaborate with established ones to develop their pro-environmental campaigns to foster consumers' pro-environmental behaviors. Marketers should carefully assess the costs associated with the target proenvironmental behaviors before designing virtual influencers' racial homophily or considering potential collaborations with them. By leveraging virtual influencers and messages generated by artificial intelligence to promote sustainability practices, businesses and marketers can potentially convey effective pro-environmental messages to their intended audience.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work is supported by a grant from the College of Professional and Continuing Education, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University (Ref.: BHM-2022-273[E]).

#### CONFLICT OF INTEREST STATEMENT

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

#### DATA AVAILABILITY STATEMENT

The data that support the findings of this study are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.

#### ORCID

Calvin Wan <sup>D</sup> http://orcid.org/0000-0001-5750-0610 Daisy Lee <sup>D</sup> http://orcid.org/0000-0002-9630-1689 Peggy Ng <sup>D</sup> http://orcid.org/0000-0001-8659-5700

#### REFERENCES

- Ahmat Zainuri, N., Abd-Rahman, N., Halim, L., Chan, M. Y., & Mohd Bazari, N. N. (2022). Measuring pro-environmental behavior triggered by environmental values. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 19(23), 16013.
- Ajzen, I. (1991). The theory of planned behavior. Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes, 50(2), 179–211.
- Andersson, M., & von Borgstede, C. (2010). Differentiation of determinants of low-cost and high-cost recycling. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 30(4), 402–408.
- Antonoplis, S., & John, O. P. (2022). Who has different-race friends, and does it depend on context? Openness (to other), but not agreeableness, predicts lower racial homophily in friendship networks. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 122(5), 894–919.
- Apaolaza, A., Hartmann, P., He, J., Barrutia, J. M., & Echebarria, C. (2014). Choosing celebrity endorsers for advertising campaigns in cosmopolitan China: Does their ethnicity matter? South African Journal of Business Management, 45(3), 45-55.
- Arias, C., & Trujillo, C. A. (2020). Perceived consumer effectiveness as a trigger of behavioral spillover effects: A path towards recycling. *Sustainability*, 12(11), 4348.
- Arsenyan, J., & Mirowska, A. (2021). Almost human? A comparative case study on the social media presence of virtual influencers. International Journal of Human-Computer Studies, 155:102694.

- Azer, J., Anker, T., Taheri, B., & Tinsley, R. (2023). Consumer-driven racial stigmatization: The moderating role of race in online consumer-toconsumer reviews. *Journal of Business Research*, 157:113567.
- Baek, T. H., Kim, S., Yoon, S., Choi, Y. K., Choi, D., & Bang, H. (2022). Emojis and assertive environmental messages in social media campaigns. *Internet Research*, 32(3), 988–1002.
- Blut, M., Wang, C., Wünderlich, N. V., & Brock, C. (2021). Understanding anthropomorphism in service provision: A meta-analysis of physical robots, chatbots, and other Al. *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 49, 632–658.
- Boerman, S. C., Meijers, M. H. C., & Zwart, W. (2022). The importance of influencer-message congruence when employing greenfluencers to promote pro-environmental behavior. *Environmental Communication*, 16(7), 920–941.
- Bozkurt, S., Gligor, D., & Hollebeek, L. D. (2021). Ethnicity's effect on social media-based comment intention: Comparing minority and majority consumers. *Psychology & Marketing*, 38(11), 1895–1910.
- Bu, Y., Parkinson, J., & Thaichon, P. (2022). Influencer marketing: Homophily, customer value co-creation behaviour and purchase intention. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 66:102904.
- Bui, N. H. (2017). Exploring similarity characteristics, identification, and parasocial interactions in choice of celebrities. *Psychology of Popular Media Culture*, 6(1), 21–31.
- Byun, K. J., & Ahn, S. J. (2023). A systematic review of virtual influencers: Similarities and differences between human and virtual influencers in interactive advertising. *Journal of Interactive Advertising*, 23, 293–306.
- Centeno, D., & Wang, J. J. (2020). Effects of narrowed social distance on local and international celebrity-endorsed advertisement attitudes. *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, 37(5), 521–532.
- Chetioui, Y., Benlafqih, H., & Lebdaoui, H. (2020). How fashion influencers contribute to consumers' purchase intention. Journal of Fashion Marketing and Management: An International Journal, 24(3), 361–380.
- Chiang, A.-H., Trimi, S., & Lo, Y.-J. (2022). Emotion and service quality of anthropomorphic robots. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 177:121550.
- Cologna, V., Berthold, A., & Siegrist, M. (2022). Knowledge, perceived potential and trust as determinants of low-and high-impact proenvironmental behaviours. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 79:101741.
- Conti, M., Gathani, J., & Tricomi, P. P. (2022). Virtual influencers in online social media. *IEEE Communications Magazine*, 60(8), 86–91.
- Cooper, G. (2023). Examining science education in chatgpt: An exploratory study of generative artificial intelligence. *Journal of Science Education and Technology*, 32(3), 444–452.
- Davis, N., Olsen, N., Perry, V. G., Stewart, M. M., & White, T. B. (2023). I'm only human? The role of racial stereotypes, humanness, and satisfaction in transactions with anthropomorphic sales bots. *Journal of the Association for Consumer Research*, 8(1), 47–58.
- Dekoninck, H., & Schmuck, D. (2022). The mobilizing power of influencers for pro-environmental behavior intentions and political participation. *Environmental Communication*, 16(4), 458–472.
- Diekmann, A., & Preisendörfer, P. (2003). Green and greenback: The behavioral effects of environmental attitudes in low-cost and highcost situations. *Rationality and Society*, 15(4), 441–472.
- Do, K. T., Wang, C. Y., & Guchait, P. (2021). When normative framing saves Mr. Nature: Role of consumer efficacy in proenvironmental adoption. *Psychology & Marketing*, 38(8), 1340–1362.
- Duffy, B. R. (2003). Anthropomorphism and the social robot. *Robotics and Autonomous Systems*, 42(3-4), 177-190.
- Epley, N., Waytz, A., & Cacioppo, J. T. (2007). On seeing human: A threefactor theory of anthropomorphism. *Psychological Review*, 114(4), 864–886.
- Erba, J., Zhang, D., & Liu, Y. (2019). Exploring the role of ethnic and biethnic identities in advertisements targeting Chinese and Chinese-

American consumers using celebrity athletes. *China Media Research*; A Journal of Science and its Applications, 15(1), 67–76.

- Faul, F., Erdfelder, E., Buchner, A., & Lang, A. G. (2009). Statistical power analyses using G\* Power 3.1: Tests for correlation and regression analyses. *Behavior Research Methods*, 41(4), 1149–1160.
- Franke, C., Groeppel-Klein, A., & Müller, K. (2023). Consumers' responses to virtual influencers as advertising endorsers: Novel and effective or uncanny and deceiving? *Journal of Advertising*, 52(4), 523–539.
- Gerrath, M. H. E. E., Olya, H., Shah, Z., & Li, H. (2024). Virtual influencers and pro-environmental causes: The roles of message warmth and trust in experts. *Journal of Business Research*, 175:114520.
- Gifford, R., & Nilsson, A. (2014). Personal and social factors that influence pro-environmental concern and behaviour: A review. *International Journal of Psychology*, 49(3), 141–157.
- Grilli, G., & Curtis, J. (2021). Encouraging pro-environmental behaviours: A review of methods and approaches. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews*, 135:110039.
- Guo, L., Hu, X., Lu, J., & Ma, L. (2021). Effects of customer trust on engagement in live streaming commerce: Mediating role of swift guanxi. *Internet Research*, 31(5), 1718–1744.
- Guo, Y.-M., Ng, W.-L., Hao, F., Zhang, C., Liu, S.-X., & Aman, A. M. (2023). Trust in virtual interaction: The role of avatars in sustainable customer relationships. *Sustainability*, 15(18), 14026.
- Gupta, P., Burton, J. L., & Costa Barros, L. (2023). Gender of the online influencer and follower: The differential persuasive impact of homophily, attractiveness and product-match. *Internet Research*, 33(2), 720–740.
- Gutuleac, R., Baima, G., Rizzo, C., & Bresciani, S. (2024). Will virtual influencers overcome the uncanny valley? The moderating role of social cues. *Psychology & Marketing.*
- Hafen, C. A., Laursen, B., Burk, W. J., Kerr, M., & Stattin, H. (2011). Homophily in stable and unstable adolescent friendships: Similarity breeds constancy. *Personality and Individual Differences*, 51(5), 607–612.
- Han, R., & Xu, J. (2020). A comparative study of the role of interpersonal communication, traditional media and social media in proenvironmental behavior: A China-based study. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health, 17(6), 1883.
- Hayes, A. F. (2018). Introduction to mediation, moderation, and conditional process analysis: A regression-based approach. Guilford Press.
- Hesapci, O., Merdin, E., & Gorgulu, S. (2016). Your ethnic model speaks to the culturally connected: Differential effects of model ethnicity in advertisements and the role of cultural self-construal. *Journal of Consumer Behaviour*, 15(2), 175–185.
- Hetherington, R., & McRae, R. (2017). Make-believing animated films featuring digital humans: A qualitative inquiry using online sources. *Animation*, 12(2), 156–173.
- Hofeditz, L., Nissen, A., Schütte, R., & Mirbabaie, M. (2022). Trust me, I'm an influencer!-A comparison of perceived trust in human and virtual influencers. ECIS 2022 Research-in-Progress Papers, 27.
- Hofstra, B., Corten, R., Van Tubergen, F., & Ellison, N. B. (2017). Sources of segregation in social networks: A novel approach using Facebook. *American Sociological Review*, 82(3), 625–656.
- Homans, G. C. (1974). Social behavior: Its elementary forms. Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.
- Hovland, C. I., & Weiss, W. (1951). The influence of source credibility on communication effectiveness. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, 15(4), 635–650.
- Huang, L., Wen, Y., & Gao, J. (2020). What ultimately prevents the proenvironmental behavior? An in-depth and extensive study of the behavioral costs. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 158:104747.
- Huber, R. A., Anderson, B., & Bernauer, T. (2018). Can social norm interventions promote voluntary pro environmental action? *Environmental Science & Policy*, 89, 231–246.
- Hudders, L., De Jans, S., & De Veirman, M. (2021). The commercialization of social media stars: A literature review and conceptual framework

WAN FT AL

on the strategic use of social media influencers. *International Journal* of Advertising, 40(3), 327–375.

- Insider. (2023). ChatGPT and Generative AI in the Creator Economy: Reality, Hype, What's Next, and How to Prepare. Business Insider. https://www.businessinsider.com/generative-ai-creator-economyreality-hype-next-how-to-prepare-2023-may
- Janairo, J. I. B. (2021). Unsustainable plastic consumption associated with online food delivery services in the new normal. *Cleaner and Responsible Consumption*, 2:100014.
- Jhawar, A., Kumar, P., & Varshney, S. (2023). The emergence of virtual influencers: A shift in the influencer marketing paradigm. Young Consumers, 24(4), 468–484.
- Jiang, K., Zheng, J., & Luo, S. (2024). Green power of virtual influencer: The role of virtual influencer image, emotional appeal, and product involvement. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 77:103660.
- Joffe-Nelson, N., van Riper, C. J., & Stedman, R. C. (2024). Values and proenvironmental behavior: What is the role of trust? *Journal of Outdoor Recreation and Tourism*, 46:100745.
- Kamins, M. A. (1990). An investigation into the "match-up" hypothesis in celebrity advertising: When beauty may be only skin deep. *Journal of Advertising*, 19(1), 4–13.
- Kandel, D. B. (2017). Homophily, selection, and socialization in adolescent friendships 1 In R. Zukauskiene (Ed.), *Interpersonal development* (pp. 249–258). Routledge.
- Karnouskos, S. (2020). Artificial intelligence in digital media: The era of deepfakes. IEEE Transactions on Technology and Society, 1(3), 138–147.
- Khan, I., Hou, F., Zakari, A., Tawiah, V., & Ali, S. A. (2022). Energy use and urbanization as determinants of China's environmental quality: Prospects of the Paris climate agreement. *Journal of Environmental Planning and Management*, 65(13), 2363–2386.
- Kietzmann, J., Paschen, J., & Treen, E. (2018). Artificial intelligence in advertising: How marketers can leverage artificial intelligence along the consumer journey. *Journal of Advertising Research*, 58(3), 263–267.
- Kim, D., & Wang, Z. (2023). The ethics of virtuality: Navigating the complexities of human-like virtual influencers in the social media marketing realm. *Frontiers in Communication*, 8:1205610.
- Kim, D. Y., & Kim, H.-Y. (2021). Trust me, trust me not: A nuanced view of influencer marketing on social media. *Journal of Business Research*, 134, 223–232.
- Kim, I., Ki, C.-W., Lee, H., & Kim, Y.-K. (2024). Virtual influencer marketing: Evaluating the influence of virtual influencers' form realism and behavioral realism on consumer ambivalence and marketing performance. *Journal of Business Research*, 176:114611.
- Kleinlogel, E. P., Schmid Mast, M., Renier, L. A., Bachmann, M., & Brosch, T. (2023). Immersive virtual reality helps to promote proenvironmental norms, attitudes and behavioural strategies. *Cleaner* and Responsible Consumption, 8:100105.
- Kothe, E. J., Ling, M., North, M., Klas, A., Mullan, B. A., & Novoradovskaya, L. (2019). Protection motivation theory and proenvironmental behaviour: A systematic mapping review. *Australian Journal of Psychology*, 71(4), 411–432.
- Kuzminov, M. (2023). Consumer trust and virtual influencers. Forbes, https://www.forbes.com/sites/forbesagencycouncil/2023/03/29/ consumer-trust-and-virtual-influencers/
- Ladhari, R., Massa, E., & Skandrani, H. (2020). YouTube vloggers' popularity and influence: The roles of homophily, emotional attachment, and expertise. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 54:102027.
- Laszkiewicz, A., & Kalinska-Kula, M. (2023). Virtual influencers as an emerging marketing theory: A systematic literature review. International Journal of Consumer Studies, 47(6), 2479–2494.
- Lauren, N., Fielding, K. S., Smith, L., & Louis, W. R. (2016). You did, so you can and you will: Self-efficacy as a mediator of spillover from easy to

more difficult pro-environmental behaviour. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 48, 191–199.

Psychology Warkeling -WILEY

- Leszczensky, L., & Pink, S. (2019). What drives ethnic homophily? A relational approach on how ethnic identification moderates preferences for same-ethnic friends. *American Sociological Review*, 84(3), 394–419.
- Letheren, K., Jetten, J., Roberts, J., & Donovan, J. (2021). Robots should be seen and not heard... sometimes: Anthropomorphism and AI service robot interactions. *Psychology & Marketing*, 38(12), 2393–2406.
- Li, J., Chiu, D. K. W., Ho, K. K. W., & So, S. (2024). The use of social media in sustainable green lifestyle adoption: Social media influencers and value co-creation. *Sustainability*, 16(3), 1133.
- Li, Y., Liu, B., & Xie, L. (2022). Celebrity endorsement in international destination marketing: Evidence from eye-tracking techniques and laboratory experiments. *Journal of Business Research*, 150, 553–566.
- Liu, D., Jiang, Y., Peng, C., Jian, J., & Zheng, J. (2024). Can green certificates substitute for renewable electricity subsidies? A Chinese experience. *Renewable Energy*, 222:119861.
- Liu, F., & Lee, Y.-H. (2024). Virtually authentic: Examining the match-up hypothesis between human vs virtual influencers and product types. *Journal of Product & Brand Management*, 33(2), 287–299.
- Liu, L., Chen, R., & He, F. (2015). How to promote purchase of carbon offset products: Labeling vs. calculation? *Journal of Business Research*, 68(5), 942–948.
- Lord, K. R., Putrevu, S., & Collins, A. F. (2019). Ethnic influences on attractiveness and trustworthiness perceptions of celebrity endorsers. *International Journal of Advertising*, 38(3), 489–505.
- Lou, C., & Yuan, S. (2019). Influencer marketing: How message value and credibility affect consumer trust of branded content on social media. *Journal of Interactive Advertising*, 19(1), 58–73.
- McDonald, K. L., Dashiell-Aje, E., Menzer, M. M., Rubin, K. H., Oh, W., & Bowker, J. C. (2013). Contributions of racial and sociobehavioral homophily to friendship stability and quality among same-race and cross-race friends. *The Journal of Early Adolescence*, 33(7), 897–919.
- McPherson, M., Smith-Lovin, L., & Cook, J. M. (2001). Birds of a feather: Homophily in social networks. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 27(1), 415-444.
- Mehrolia, S., Alagarsamy, S., & Solaikutty, V. M. (2021). Customers response to online food delivery services during COVID-19 outbreak using binary logistic regression. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, 45(3), 396–408.
- Molina-Besch, K. (2020). Food delivery packaging and tableware waste. *Nature Food*, 1(9), 531–532.
- Mori, M. (1970). The Uncanny Valley: The original essay by Masahiro Mori. IEEE Spectrum, 6, 1–6.
- Moser, A. K. (2015). Thinking green, buying green? Drivers of proenvironmental purchasing behavior. *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, 32(3), 167–175.
- Mouritzen, S. L. T., Penttinen, V., & Pedersen, S. (2023). Virtual influencer marketing: The good, the bad and the unreal. *European Journal of Marketing*, 58(2), 410-440.
- Moustakas, E., Lamba, N., Mahmoud, D., & Ranganathan, C. (2020). Blurring lines between fiction and reality: Perspectives of experts on marketing effectiveness of virtual influencers. 2020 International Conference on Cyber Security and Protection of Digital Services (Cyber Security).
- Nascimento, T. C. D., Campos, R. D., & Suarez, M. (2020). Experimenting, partnering and bonding: A framework for the digital influencerbrand endorsement relationship. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 36(11-12), 1009-1030.
- Ohanian, R. (1990). Construction and validation of a scale to measure celebrity endorsers' perceived expertise, trustworthiness, and attractiveness. *Journal of Advertising*, *19*(3), 39–52.
- Ouvrein, G., Pabian, S., Giles, D., Hudders, L., & De Backer, C. (2021). The web of influencers. A marketing-audience classification of (potential)

1847

social media influencers. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 37(13–14), 1313–1342.

- Ozdemir, O., Kolfal, B., Messinger, P. R., & Rizvi, S. (2023). Human or virtual: How influencer type shapes brand attitudes. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 145(C), 17. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2023. 107771
- Van Pinxteren, M. M. E., Wetzels, R. W. H., Rüger, J., Pluymaekers, M., & Wetzels, M. (2019). Trust in humanoid robots: Implications for services marketing. *Journal of Services Marketing*, 33(4), 507–518.
- Pittman, M., & Abell, A. (2021). More trust in fewer followers: Diverging effects of popularity metrics and green orientation social media influencers. *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, 56(1), 70–82.
- Pradhan, D., Kuanr, A., Anupurba Pahi, S., & Akram, M. S. (2023). Influencer marketing: When and why Gen Z consumers avoid influencers and endorsed brands. *Psychology & Marketing*, 40(1), 27–47.
- Qasem, F. (2023). ChatGPT in scientific and academic research: Future fears and reassurances. *Library Hi Tech News*, 40(3), 30–32.
- Rahman, M. M., Terano, H. J., Rahman, M. N., Salamzadeh, A., & Rahaman, M. S. (2023). ChatGPT and academic research: A review and recommendations based on practical examples. *Journal of Education, Management and Development Studies*, 3(1), 1–12.
- Raimondo, M., Hamam, M., D'Amico, M., & Caracciolo, F. (2022). Plasticfree behavior of millennials: An application of the theory of planned behavior on drinking choices. Waste Management, 138, 253–261.
- Ruby, D. (2023). Social media users in the world–2023 demographics. https://www.demandsage.com/social-media-users
- Sands, S., Ferraro, C., Demsar, V., & Chandler, G. (2022). False idols: Unpacking the opportunities and challenges of falsity in the context of virtual influencers. *Business Horizons*, 65(6), 777–788.
- del Saz Salazar, S., & Pérez y Pérez, L. (2021). Exploring the differential effect of life satisfaction on low and high-cost pro-environmental behaviors. International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health, 19(1), 277.
- Schouten, A. P., Janssen, L., & Verspaget, M. (2021). Celebrity vs. Influencer endorsements in advertising: The role of identification, credibility, and product-endorser fit, In S. Yoon, Y. K. Choi, C. R. Taylor (Eds.), *Leveraged marketing communications* (pp. 208–231). Routledge.
- Shen, J., Liang, H., Zafar, A. U., Shahzad, M., Akram, U., & Ashfaq, M. (2023). Influence by osmosis: Social media green communities and pro-environmental behavior. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 143:107706.
- Shen, Z. (2024). Shall brands create their own virtual influencers? A comprehensive study of 33 virtual influencers on Instagram. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*, 11(1), 1–14.
- Shoenberger, H., & Kim, E. (2023). Explaining purchase intent via expressed reasons to follow an influencer, perceived homophily, and perceived authenticity. *International Journal of Advertising*, 42(2), 368–383.
- So, K. K. F., Kim, H., Liu, S. Q., Fang, X., & Wirtz, J. (2023). Service robots: The dynamic effects of anthropomorphism and functional perceptions on consumers' responses. *European Journal of Marketing*, 58(1), 1–32.
- Sparrow, R. (2019). Do robots have race?: Race, social construction, and HRI. IEEE Robotics & Automation Magazine, 27(3), 144–150.
- Statista. (2024). Influencer advertising–Worldwide. https://www.statista. com/outlook/amo/advertising/influencer-advertising/worldwide
- Tajfel, H. (Ed.) (1978). Social categorization, social identity and social comparison. Differentiation Between Social Group: Studies in the social psychology of intergroup relations (pp. 61–76). Academic Press.
- Tam, K.-P., & Chan, H.-W. (2018). Generalized trust narrows the gap between environmental concern and pro-environmental behavior: Multilevel evidence. *Global Environmental Change*, 48, 182–194.

- Tan, J. (2019). The rise of the Al influencer: Are they simply easier to work with? Marketing Interactive. https://www.marketing-interactive. com/the-rise-of-the-ai-influencer-are-they-simply-easier-towork-with
- The World Bank. (2024). CO<sub>2</sub> emissions (metric tons per capita). https:// data.worldbank.org/indicator/EN.ATM.CO2E.PC
- Thomas, V. L., & Fowler, K. (2021). Close encounters of the Al kind: Use of Al influencers as brand endorsers. *Journal of Advertising*, 50(1), 11–25.
- Tong, X., & Su, J. (2021). Country-of-origin effects in celebrity endorsements: The case of China. International Journal of Fashion Design Technology and Education, 14(2), 205–217.
- Tonglet, M., Phillips, P. S., & Read, A. D. (2004). Using the theory of planned behaviour to investigate the determinants of recycling behaviour: A case study from Brixworth, UK. *Resources, Conservation* and Recycling, 41, 191–214.
- Truelove, H. B., & Gillis, A. J. (2018). Perception of pro-environmental behavior. Global Environmental Change, 49, 175–185.
- Truelove, H. B., Yeung, K. L., Carrico, A. R., Gillis, A. J., & Raimi, K. T. (2016). From plastic bottle recycling to policy support: An experimental test of pro-environmental spillover. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 46, 55–66.
- Truong-Dinh, B. Q., Nguyen, T. T., Cheng, T.-C. F., & Cheng, J. M.-S. (2023). Effects of consumer perceptions on carbon-offset payment through mediating and moderating mechanisms. *Transportation Research Part D: Transport and Environment*, 115:103584.
- Uren, H. V., Roberts, L. D., Dzidic, P. L., & Leviston, Z. (2021). High-status pro-environmental behaviors: Costly, effortful, and visible. *Environment and Behavior*, 53(5), 455–484.
- De Veirman, M., Cauberghe, V., & Hudders, L. (2017). Marketing through Instagram influencers: The impact of number of followers and product divergence on brand attitude. *International Journal of Advertising*, 36(5), 798–828.
- De Visser, E. J., Monfort, S. S., McKendrick, R., Smith, M. A., McKnight, P. E., Krueger, F., & Parasuraman, R. (2016). Almost human: Anthropomorphism increases trust resilience in cognitive agents. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Applied*, 22(3), 331–349.
- Wan, C., Shen, G. Q., & Yu, A. (2014). The moderating effect of perceived policy effectiveness on recycling intention. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 37, 55–60.
- van der Werff, E., Steg, L., & Keizer, K. (2013). It is a moral issue: The relationship between environmental self-identity, obligation-based intrinsic motivation and pro-environmental behaviour. *Global Environmental Change*, 23(5), 1258–1265. https://doi.org/10.1016/ j.gloenvcha.2013.07.018
- Wiedmann, K.-P., & von Mettenheim, W. (2020). Attractiveness, trustworthiness and expertise-social influencers' winning formula? *Journal of Product & Brand Management*, 30(5), 707–725.
- Wimmer, A., & Lewis, K. (2010). Beyond and below racial homophily: ERG models of a friendship network documented on Facebook. *American Journal of Sociology*, 116(2), 583–642.
- Wongkitrungrueng, A., & Assarut, N. (2020). The role of live streaming in building consumer trust and engagement with social commerce sellers. *Journal of Business Research*, 117, 543–556.
- Wu, H., Zhang, H., & Song, H. (2024). Are Chinese willing to pay for travel carbon offset products? *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 1–22.
- Wu, M., Wang, N., & Yuen, K. F. (2023). Deep versus superficial anthropomorphism: Exploring their effects on human trust in shared autonomous vehicles. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 141:107614.
- Wyss, A. M., Knoch, D., & Berger, S. (2022). When and how proenvironmental attitudes turn into behavior: The role of costs, benefits, and self-control. *Journal of Environmental Psychology*, 79:101748.
- Yang, J., Chuenterawong, P., Lee, H., & Chock, T. M. (2023). Anthropomorphism in CSR endorsement: A comparative study on humanlike

1848

vs. cartoonlike virtual influencers' climate change messaging. Journal of Promotion Management, 29(5), 705–734.

- Yang, J., Chuenterawong, P., Lee, H., Tian, Y., & Chock, T. M. (2023). Human versus virtual influencer: The effect of humanness and interactivity on persuasive CSR messaging. *Journal of Interactive Advertising*, 23, 275–292.
- Yang, P.-C., Al-Sada, M., Chiu, C.-C., Kuo, K., Tomo, T. P., Suzuki, K., Yalta, N., Shu, K.-H., & Ogata, T. (2020). HATSUKI: An anime character like robot figure platform with anime-style expressions and imitation learning based action generation. 2020 29th IEEE International Conference on Robot and Human Interactive Communication (RO-MAN).
- Yin, J. (2023). Distinguishing the determinants of low-cost and high-cost sustainable travel behaviors. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Insights*.
- Yu, J., Dickinger, A., So, K. K. F., & Egger, R. (2024). Artificial intelligencegenerated virtual influencer: Examining the effects of emotional display on user engagement. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 76:103560.
- Yu, S., & Hu, Y. (2020). When luxury brands meet China: The effect of localized celebrity endorsements in social media marketing. *Journal* of Retailing and Consumer Services, 54):102010.

- Zhang, W., Chintagunta, P. K., & Kalwani, M. U. (2021). Social media, influencers, and adoption of an eco-friendly product: Field experiment evidence from rural China. *Journal of Marketing*, 85(3), 10–27.
- Zhou, X., Yan, X., & Jiang, Y. (2023). EXPRESS: Making sense? the sensoryspecific nature of virtual influencer effectiveness. *Journal of Marketing*, 00222429231203699.
- Zhu, X., Teng, L., Foti, L., & Yuan, Y. (2019). Using self-congruence theory to explain the interaction effects of brand type and celebrity type on consumer attitude formation. *Journal of Business Research*, 103, 301–309.

How to cite this article: Wan, C., Lee, D., & Ng, P. (2024). The role of anthropomorphism and racial homophily of virtual influencers in encouraging high- versus low-cost proenvironmental behaviors. *Psychology & Marketing*, 41, 1833–1853. https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.22013

Constructs	Items	Source(s)
Trust	The virtual influencer can be relied upon on her content. I trust the virtual influencer is an environmentalist. I trust the virtual influencer shares truthful experience.	Guo et al. (2021), Kim and Kim (2021), Wongkitrungrueng and Assarut (2020)
Pro-environmental Intentions (Study 1 only)	I intend to use reusable cutlery in the next takeaway purchase. I intend not to use single-use cutlery next time I purchase takeaway. Using reusable cutlery will be my preference over single-use cutlery in the future.	Ajzen (1991), Tonglet et al. (2004), Wan et al. (2014)
Control variables		
Environmental identity	Acting environmentally friendly is an important part of who I am. I am the type of person who acts environmentally friendly. I see myself as an environmental-friendly person.	Truelove et al. (2016), van der Werff et al. (2013)
Perceived behavioral control <sup>1</sup>	If I want to, I could avoid using single-use cutlery. Whether I avoid single-use cutlery or not is completely up to me. I have no difficulty using reusable cutlery. Whether I use reusable cutlery or not is completely up to me.	Raimondo et al. (2022)

APPENDIX A: MEASUREMENT ITEMS

<sup>1</sup>In Study 2, the wordings on cutlery were changed to carbon offset for aligning with the study context.

## APPENDIX B: STUDY 1 MATERIALS

## Messages generated by artificial intelligence

Platform	ChatGPT 3.5
Prompt	As a social media influencer, you wanted to encourage pro-environmental behaviors. Write a social media post of 50 words to encourage people to use reusable cutlery when they order food delivery. Provide the outputs in both English and Simplified Chinese
Output	English: Make your food delivery eco-friendly! Opt for reusable cutlery and cut down on waste. Together, we can make a positive impact on the environment, one meal at a time. In Let's dine sustainably and protect our beautiful planet! #GoGreen #ReduceWaste #SustainableLiving #ReuseCutlery Simplified Chinese: Comparison of the set of the s
Avatar of virtual influencer generated by artificial	intelligence
Platform	NightCafe
Model	SDXL BETA
Preset Style	Photo (for human-like virtual influencers) CGI Character (for animate-like virtual influencers)
Prompt	3D, virtual influencer, female, Asian/American, young, smile, blue shirt, headshot Note: after the 1st image was generated, the other three images were "evolved" from the 1st one.
Output	<image/>



## Social Media Posts (Chinese Version used in Study 1)



## APPENDIX C: STUDY 2 MATERIALS

### Messages generated by artificial intelligence

Platform	ChatGPT 3.5
Prompt	The monthly per capita carbon emission in China is 0.65 tons, it requires approximately ¥40 to offset the carbon emission. As a social media influencer, you wanted to encourage people to pay for carbon offset programmes, for example, tree planting, green energy, etc. Write a social media post of 50 words to encourage people to purchase carbon offset credits. Provide the outputs in both English and Simplified Chinese.
Output	English: ➤ Let's offset our carbon footprint together! For just ¥40, you can neutralize 0.65 tons of monthly per capita carbon emissions in China. Invest in carbon offset programs today and support initiatives like tree planting and green energy. Together, we can make a difference for our planet! , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
Avatar of virtual influencer generated by artificial	intelligence
Platform	NightCafe
Model	SDXL 1.0
Preset Style	Photo (for human-like virtual influencers) CGI Character (for animate-like virtual influencers
Prompt	3D, virtual influencer, female, Asian, young, smile, gray shirt without logo, headshot Note: after the 1st image was generated, the other three images were "evolved" from the 1st one.
Output	

Psychology Warkeling -WILEY 15206735, 2024, 8, Downloaded from https://initelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/mar.22013 by HONG KONG POL/TECHNIC UNIVERSITY HU NG HOM, Wiley Online Library on [10/12/2024]. Se the Terms and Conditions (https://oinitelibrary.wiley.com/terms-and-conditions) on Wiley Online Library or 10/12/2014 (Sector Library or 10/12/2024). Sector Library or 10/12/2024 (Sector Library or 10/12/2024). Sector Libra

License

## Social Media Posts (English Version for Illustrative Purpose)



## Social Media Posts (Chinese Version used in Study 1)

