1	Early-age Strength and Long-term Performance of Asphalt Emulsion
2	<b>Cold Recycled Mixes with Various Cement Contents</b>
3	Jinhai Yan <sup>1</sup> , Zhen Leng <sup>2</sup> *, Feng Li <sup>3</sup> , Haoran Zhu <sup>4</sup> , Shihui Bao <sup>5</sup>
4	
5	ABSTRACT
6	Cold recycling with asphalt emulsion is an economical and environment-friendly
7	technology for asphalt pavement maintenance and rehabilitation. This study aims to
8	investigate the early-age strength and long-term performance of the asphalt emulsion cold
9	recycled mixes with various cement contents, as well as the correlation between the
10	early-strength and long-term performance. To achieve this objective, three research tasks
11	were conducted, including: 1) quantifying the early-age strength of four types of asphalt
12	emulsion cold recycled mixes by measuring their cohesive forces and raveling loss rates
13	through the Hveem cohesion test and raveling test, respectively; 2) characterizing their

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> PhD, National Engineering Laboratory for Advanced Road Materials, Jiangsu Transportation Institute Group, 2200 Chenxin Street, Nanjing, China, 211112, jason.yan1@gmail.com <sup>2</sup>Assistant Professor, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, Hung Hom, Kowloon, Hong Kong, zhen.leng@polyu.edu.hk (\*Corresponding Author)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Engineer, National Engineering Laboratory for Advanced Road Materials, Jiangsu Transportation Institute Group, 2200 Chenxin Street, Nanjing, China, 211112, lf78@jsti.com

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> PhD, National Engineering Laboratory for Advanced Road Materials, Jiangsu Transportation Institute Group, 2200 Chenxin Street, Nanjing, China, 211112, zhr75@jsti.com

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Assistant Engineer, National Engineering Laboratory for Advanced Road Materials, Jiangsu Transportation Institute Group, 2200 Chenxin Street, Nanjing, China, 211112, bsh359@jsti.com

long-term performance properties, including moisture stability, high-temperature stability, and low-temperature cracking resistance; and 3) developing the correlation models between the early-age strength and long-term performance of asphalt emulsion cold recycled mixes through regression analysis. It was concluded that adding cement in cold recycled mixes played positive effects on both its early-age strength and long-term performance. In addition, strong linear correlation was found between the early-age strength and long-term performance of asphalt emulsion cold recycled mixes.

21

KEY WORDS: Reclaimed asphalt pavement; cold recycling; asphalt emulsion; cohesive
force; raveling loss rate; failure strain

# 24 1 INTRODUCTION

Cold recycling of reclaimed asphalt pavement (RAP) is a cost-effective and environment-friendly technology, which has been widely applied for asphalt pavement maintenance, rehabilitation and reinforcement [1]. Asphalt emulsion, foamed asphalt and cement have been commonly added to RAP to produce cold recycled mixes. Due to the curing effects of asphalt emulsion, cold recycled mixes with asphalt emulsion show different performance characteristics, especially at the early stage, compared with hot-mix asphalt (HMA). Correspondingly, various research studies have been conducted 32 on the mix design, long-term performance, performance evaluation and prediction, and economic and environmental analysis of cold recycling [2-11]. In general, asphalt 33 emulsion cold recycled mixes have been reported to provide satisfactory performance in 34 terms of moisture damage resistance, rutting resistance, and low-temperature cracking 35 36 resistance compared with HMA [12-15]. However, very few studies have systematically looked into the early-age strength, long-term performance, and their correlation of asphalt 37 emulsion cold recycled mixes with and without cement. As a result, this study aims to 38 investigate the early-age strength and long-term performance of asphalt emulsion cold 39 recycled mixes with different cement contents, as well as their correlation. The early-age 40 strength of the cold mixes was evaluated through the Hveem cohesion test and raveling 41 42 test, while the long-term performance was characterized through tests on their moisture 43 stability, high-temperature stability, and low-temperature cracking resistance

# 44 2 EXPERIMENTAL PROGRAM

#### 45 2.1 Materials

The RAP samples used to produce the cold recycled mixes in this study were collected from the surface and binder courses of the Ning-Xuan highway in Nanjing, China. The binder extraction and recovery tests indicated that the asphalt content of RAP was 4.3%. The 25 °C penetration, softening point, and 15 °C ductility of the extracted RAP binder

50	were 24 (0.1mm), 65 °C, and 14 cm, respectively. Virgin coarse limestone aggregates
51	(16mm-31.5mm) were added to the cold recycled mixes to improve interface friction
52	between aggregate. The asphalt emulsion used in this study is a cationic slow-setting
53	asphalt emulsion (CSS-1h), and its properties are shown in Table 1. Ordinary Portland
54	cement with a 28-day compressive strength of 42.5 MPa (labelled as PO 42.5 according
55	to the Chinese specification standards, JTJ 034-2000) was used, and its properties are
56	presented in Table 2. Pre-mix water was added to cold recycled mixes to improve the
57	coating of the RAP and virgin aggregates, lubricate the mix during compaction, and
58	accelerate the cement hydration reaction.

# TABLE 1 Test Results and Technical Requirements of Asphalt Emulsion

Test Item	Results	Technical Requirement	Test Method	
Velocity of setting	Slow	Slow or medium	T0658	
Charge	Cationic	Cationic	T0653	
Residual content on sieve (1.18 mm), %	0.10	≤0.1	T0652	
Standard viscosity, C25.3, s	22	10-60	T0621	
Coating characteristic with coarse aggregate, coating squares, %	>80	≥66.7	T0654	
Residue content by evaporation, %	65.7	≥62	T0651	
Penetration, 25°C, 1/10 mm	63	50-150	T0604	
Soften point, °C	47	-	T0606	
Ductility,15 °C, cm	50	$\geq 40$	T0605	
Solubility in TCE, %	99.5	≥97.5	T0607	
Storage stability, 1 day, %	0.3	≤1	T0655	
Storage stability, 5 day, %	0.5	$\leqslant$ 5	T0655	

61

**TABLE 2 Test Results of Ordinary Portland Cement PO 425** 

Test Item	Results	Technical Requirement	Test Method
Initial setting time, min	405	≥180	T0505
Final setting time, min	455	≥360	T0505
Soundness, mm	1.0	≤5.0	T0505
Compressive strength, 3d, MPa	24.7	≥18.0	T0506
Flexural strength, 3d, MPa	5.0	≥3.5	T0506

In total, four cold recycled mixes as shown in Table 3 were prepared and evaluated. Among the four mixes, Mix III was the design mix for cold recycling adopted in Ning-Xuan highway, and the other three mixes, which have various percentages of cement, were selected to evaluate the effect of cement content. The gradation of the combined RAP and virgin aggregate was designed to meet the requirement of the Chinese specification for cold recycling (JTG F41-2008), as shown in Figure 1.

69

TABLE 3 Material Compositions of Cold Recycled Mixes

RAP	Virgin Coarse	Asphalt	Portland	Pre-mix
(%)	Aggregate (%)	Emulsion (%)	Cement (%)	Water (%)
85	15	4.3	0	2.6
85	15	4.3	1.0	2.6
85	15	4.3	1.5	2.6
85	15	4.3	2.0	2.6
	RAP (%) 85 85 85 85 85	RAP         Virgin Coarse           (%)         Aggregate (%)           85         15           85         15           85         15           85         15           85         15           85         15           85         15	RAP         Virgin Coarse         Asphalt           (%)         Aggregate (%)         Emulsion (%)           85         15         4.3           85         15         4.3           85         15         4.3           85         15         4.3           85         15         4.3           85         15         4.3	RAP         Virgin Coarse         Asphalt         Portland           (%)         Aggregate (%)         Emulsion (%)         Cement (%)           85         15         4.3         0           85         15         4.3         1.0           85         15         4.3         1.5           85         15         4.3         2.0





#### **FIGURE 1 Cold Recycled Mix Gradation**

# 72 2.2 Early-age Strength Characterization

The early-age strength of the cold recycled mixes was quantified by the Hveem cohesive test and raveling test. The test specimens for these two tests were 150 mm in dimeter and  $80 \pm 3.0$  mm in height, and 150 mm in diameter and  $70 \pm 5.0$  mm in height, respectively. 20 gyrations of compaction were applied to each specimen using a Superpave gyratory compactor. Three replicates were prepared for each mix, and all specimens were cured at a temperature of 25 °C and a humidity of 70% for 4 h.

79 2.2.1 Cohesion Test

80 The cohesion test was performed in accordance with ASTM D1560-81. Figure 2 shows

the Hveem cohesiometer used in this study and a failed specimen after testing. During

this test, steel balls keep falling into the bucket at the end of the cantilever beam at a constant speed. The test will stop when the specimen cracks or the vertical deformation is more than 13 mm. The cohesion force value, C ( $g/cm^2$ ), is calculated based on the weight of steel balls in the bucket using the following equation

86 
$$C = \frac{L}{W \times (0.031H + 0.00269H^2)}$$
(1)

87 where L, W, and H represent the ball weight (g), the specimen diameter (cm), and the

specimen height (cm), respectively.



89

90

FIGURE 2 Hveem cohesiometer (left) and specimen after failure (right)

91

### 92 2.2.2 Raveling Test

The raveling test was performed in accordance with ASTM D7196-06. Figure 3 shows the raveling tester used in this study and the specimen before and after testing. This test measures the raveling resistance of asphalt emulsion cold recycled mixes by simulating the abrasion caused by early-age traffic. The test is continued for 15 minutes or until a major part of the specimen is broken. When the test is completed, the specimen will be
carefully removed from the base and its surface will be gently brushed with a paint brush
to remove any loose material. Then, its weight will be measured and the raveling loss rate,
L (%), can be calculated using the following equation:

$$L = \frac{W_a - W_b}{W_a} \times 100 \tag{2}$$

102 where  $W_{a}$ , and  $W_{b}$  represent the weight of the specimen before raveling test (g), and the

103 weight of the specimen after raveling test (g), respectively.



- 104
- 105

FIGURE 3 Raveling tester and raveling specimen

# 106 2.3 Long-term Performance Characterization

The long-term performance characteristics of the cold recycled mixtures evaluated in this
study include moisture susceptibility, high-temperature stability, and low-temperature

109 cracking resistance.

Three tests, including the immersion Marshall test, immersion indirect tensile strength (IDT) tests, and freeze-thaw IDT test, were conducted to assess the moisture susceptibility of the fully cured asphalt emulsion mixes. The high-temperature stability and the low-temperature cracking resistance of the fully cured asphalt emulsion mixes were evaluated through wheel track rutting test, and three-point bending test, respectively.

116 2.3.1 Moisture Susceptibility

117 2.3.1.1 Immersion Marshall test

Two groups of specimens with each group three replicates were prepared for the immersion Marshall test. The specimens in group 1 were soaked in a water bath at  $40 \pm$ 1°C for 1 h before the Marshall test, while the specimens in group 2 were soaked in a water bath at 25 °C for 23 h, and then placed in a water bath at  $40 \pm 1$  °C for 1 h before the Marshall test. The percentage of residual stability, RS (%), was calculated according to the following equation:

124

$$RS = MS_2 / MS_1 \times 100\% \tag{3}$$

where MS<sub>2</sub> and MS<sub>1</sub> represent the Marshall stability of specimen in group 2 (kN) and
Marshall stability of specimen in group 1 (kN), respectively.

127

128 2.3.1.2 Immersion IDT test

129	Two groups of specimens with each group three replicates were prepared for the
130	immersion IDT test. The specimens in group 1 and group 2 were conditioned with the
131	same methods before testing as those for the immersion Marshall test. The IDT samples
132	were subjected to a load at a vertical displacement rate of 50 mm/min at 15 °C until the
133	specimen failed. The percentage of the IDT strength ratio, $\text{TSR}_{\text{d-w}}$ (%), was calculated
134	according to the following equation:
135	$TSR_{d-w} = IDT_2 / IDT_1 \times 100\% $ <sup>(4)</sup>
136	Where $IDT_2$ , and $IDT_1$ represent the IDT strength of the specimen in group 2 (MPa), and
137	the IDT strength of the specimen in group 1 (MPa), respectively.
138 139	2 3 1 3 Freeze-thaw IDT test
140	Two groups of specimens with each group three replicates were prepared for the
110	Two groups of specimients with each group ance reprivates were prepared for the
141	freeze-thaw IDT tests. The specimens in both groups were soaked in a 25 °C water bath
142	for at least 2 h before testing at 25 °C. But in addition, the specimens in group 2 were first
143	vacuum saturated to 55 %-75 %, sealed in plastic bags at -18 °C for 16 h, and placed in
144	a water bath at 60 °C for 24 h after removal from the plastic bags. The percentage of the
145	IDT strength ratio, TSR (%), was calculated according to the following equation:
146	$TSR = RT_2 / RT_1 \times 100\% $ <sup>(5)</sup>
147	where $RT_1$ , and $RT_2$ represent the IDT strength of the specimen in group 2 (MPa), and the
148	IDT strength of the specimen in group 1 (MPa), respectively.

# 149 2.3.2 High-temperature Stability Test

To determine the rutting resistance of the cold recycled mixes, the wheel track test was conducted at  $60 \pm 1$  °C in accordance with JTG E20-2011. Three replicates were prepared for each mix, and the dimensions of each specimen were 300 mm x 300 mm x 50 mm. The dynamic stability (DS), which is defined as the number of wheel passes that causes 1 mm rut from 45 minutes to 60 minutes, was calculated by the following equation:

156 
$$DS = (t_2 - t_1) \times N / (d_2 - d_1)$$
(6)

where  $t_1$  and  $t_2$  are 45 min and 60 min, respectively;  $d_1$  and  $d_2$  represent the vertical deformations at 45 min and 60 min, respectively; and N represents the rolling speed of rubber wheel, which was 42 cycles/min.

# 160 2.3.3 Low-temperature Cracking Resistance Test

To evaluate the low temperature cracking resistance of cold recycled mixes, the three-point bending test was conducted at -10  $^{\circ}$ C with a loading rate of 50 mm/min in accordance with JTG E20-2011. The dimensions of the specimens were 250 mm x 30 mm x 35 mm. The tensile strength and tensile strain at failure were calculated by Equations 7 and 8, respectively. The ratio of the tensile strength and strain at failure was denoted as stiffness, as shown in Equation 9. The failure strain was calculated to evaluate the low-temperature cracking resistance of the asphalt mix.

$$R = 3Pl/2bh^2 \tag{7}$$

$$\varepsilon = 6hd/l^2 \tag{8}$$

170 
$$S = R / \varepsilon$$
 (9)

where R, P, b, h, l, d, ε, and S represent tensile strength (MPa), peak load (kN), width of
specimen (cm), thickness of specimen (cm), length of specimen (cm), deformation at
failure (cm), strain at failure, and stiffness (MPa), respectively.

# 174 **3 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

#### 175 **3.1 Early-age Strength**

Figure 4 shows the results of the Hveem cohesion test and raveling test. It can be seen that among the four mixes, Mix I, which did not contain cement, had the lowest cohesion force and highest raveling loss rate. In general, a higher cement content leads to a higher cohesion force and a lower raveling loss rate, indicating that adding cement provides positive effect on the early-age strength of asphalt emulsion cold recycled mixes.





#### FIGURE 4 Results of cohesion and raveling tests

# 183 **3.2 Long-term Performance**

# 184 *3.2.1 Moisture Susceptibility*

Table 4, Figure 5, and Figure 6 show the results of the moisture susceptibility tests. From Figure 5, it can be seen that Mix I, which contained no cement, had the lowest Marshall stability and IDT strength. A higher cement contents leads to higher MS, IDT and RT values. From Figure 6, it can be observed that RS, TSR<sub>d-w</sub> and TSR values increase with the increase of cement content, while the results of Mixes II and III are close to each other. The results indicated that adding cement improved the long-term strength and moisture stability of asphalt emulsion cold recycled mixes.

192

#### TABLE 4 The Results of Moisture Susceptibility Test

Mar	$MS_1$	$MS_2$	RS	$IDT_1$	IDT <sub>2</sub>	$TSR_{d-w}$	$RT_1$	RT <sub>2</sub>	TSR
IVIIX	(kN)	(kN)	(kN)	(MPa)	(MPa)	(%)	(MPa)	(MPa)	(kN)

Ι	7.64	5.76	75.4	0.7842	0.6521	83.2	0.4977	0.3528	70.9
II	7.88	6.14	77.9	0.7953	0.6704	84.3	0.5787	0.4105	79.2
III	8.23	6.47	78.6	0.8117	0.6916	85.2	0.5921	0.4592	79.4
IV	8.55	7.03	82.2	0.9354	0.8214	87.8	0.6182	0.4818	81.4





FIGURE 5 The strength results of Marshall test and IDT test





# *3.2.2 Wheel Track Rutting Resistance*



containing no cement had the lowest DS value. With the increase of cement content, DS
values increase. In other words, adding cement improved the high-temperature stability
of asphalt emulsion cold recycled mixes.





## 204 *3.2.3 Low-temperature Cracking Resistance*

202

203

Figure 8 shows the results of the low-temperature cracking resistance tests. It was found that Mix I containing no cement showed the lowest failure strain value. With the increase of cement content, the failure strain values first increases, and then decreases. Among the four mixes, Mix III, which contained 15% of cement, showed the best low-temperature cracking resistance. The results indicated that adding cement could increase the low temperature cracking resistance of cold recycled mix without cement, but there might exist an optimum cement content.





FIGURE 8 Results of low-temperature cracking resistance test

214 **3.3 Correlation Analysis between Early-age Strength and Long-term Performance** 

Based on the results of raveling test and cohesion test, the linear correlation between raveling loss rate and cohesion force was developed as shown in Figure 9. In consideration of the relatively good correlation between cohesion force and raveling loss, as evidenced by a correlation coefficient ( $R^2$ ) of 0.613, only one of these two variables, the cohesion force, was selected to develop the correlation models between the early-age strength and long-term performance of cold recycled mixes.



221 222

FIGURE 9 The correlation between cohesion force and raveling loss rate

Figures 10, 11 and 12, present the linear correlation models between the early-age 224 strength and the long-term performances of asphalt emulsion cold recycled mixes. The 225 226 correlation coefficients between cohesion force and Marshall stability, IDT strength, 227 TSR<sub>d-w</sub>, RS, TSR, dynamic stability, and failure strain are 0.990, 0.734, 0.904, 0.871, 228 0.904, 0.904 and 0.871, respectively. The high correlation coefficients indicate that the cohesion force has strong linear relation with various long-term performance 229 characteristics of asphalt emulsion cold recycled mixes. The highest correlation 230 coefficients were achieved between the cohesive force and IDT strength, TSR<sub>d-w</sub>, and DS, 231 which were all above 0.9. It is worth noting that the correlation between cohesive force 232 and failure strain is different from others, since the relation between failure strain and 233 cement content is not linear. But in general, strong linear correlations between the 234

early-age strength property and various long-term performance properties of asphalt
emulsion cold recycled mixes could be developed based on the linear correlation
analysis.







FIGURE 10 Linear correlation between cohesion force and long-term strength



240

241 FIGURE 11 Linear correlation between cohesion force and moisture stability



243 FIGURE 12 Linear correlation between cohesion force and DS and failure strain

# 244 4 CONCLUSIONS

242

245 This study investigated the early-age strength and long-term performance of asphalt

emulsion cold recycled mixes with various cement contents, as well as their correlation.

247 The following summarizes the major findings of this study:

- 248 1. The results of the Hveem cohesion test and raveling test indicated that a higher
- cement content results in a higher cohesive force and a lower raveling loss of the
- asphalt emulsion cold recycled mixes.
- 251 2. In general, adding cement in asphalt emulsion cold recycled mix improved its
- early-age strength, moisture stability, high-temperature stability and low-temperature
- 253 cracking resistance.
- 254 3. With the increase of cement content, the moisture stability, high-temperature stability

- and strength of cold recycled mixes increase, while the low-temperature cracking
  resistance increases first and then decreases.
- 257 4. A strong linear correlation between the early-age strength and long-term performance
- of cold recycled mixes with full curing exists based on the linear correlation analysis,
- and the correlation coefficients between IDT strength,  $TSR_{d-w}$ , DS and the cohesive

260 force exceed 0.9.

# 261 ACKNOLEDGEMENT

This study was supported by the Jiangsu Natural Science Foundation under Grant No.
BK20140111 and BK20140112. In addition, we'd like to thank Mr. Licheng Wang and
Mr. Peng Han for their help with the laboratory tests.

# 265 **REFERENCES**

- 266 [1] Kandhal, P.S., R.B. Mallick. Pavement recycling guidelines for state and local
- 267 governments, participant's reference Book. Publication FHWA-SA-98-042, Federal
- 268 Highway Administration, Washington D.C., 1997.
- 269 [2] Thomas, T., A.Kadrmas. Performance-related tests and specifications for cold
- 270 in-place recycling: lab and field experience. Transportation Research Board of the
- 271 *National Academies*. Washington D.C., TRB; 2003.
- 272 [3] Du, J.C., S.A. Cross.Cold in-place recycling pavement rutting prediction model using

- 273 grey modeling method. *Construction and Building Materials*, Vol.21, No.5, 2007, pp.
  274 921-927.
- [4] Ozsahin, T.S., S. Oruc. Neural network model for resilient modulus of emulsified
  asphalt mixtures. *Construction and Building Materials*, Vol.22, No.7, 2008, pp.
  1436-1445.
- [5] Alkins, A.E., B.Lane, and T. Kazmierowsk. Sustainable pavements-environmental,
  economic and social benefits of in-situ pavement recycling. In *Transportation Research Record: Journal of the Transportation Research Board*, *No.2084*,
  Transportation Research Board of the National Academies, Washing, D.C., 2008,
  pp.100-103.
- [6] Kim, Y.J.,H.D. Lee. Performance evaluation of cold in-place recycling mixtures
  using emulsified asphalt based on dynamic modulus, flow number, flow time, and
  raveling loss. *KSCE Journal of Civil Engineering*, Vol.16, No 4, 2012, pp. 586-593.
- [7] Thenoux, G., A. Gonzalez, and D. Rafael. Energy consumption comparison for
   different asphalt pavements rehabilitation techniques used in Chile. *Resource and Conservation Recycling*, Vol.49,No.4, 2007, pp. 325-339.
- [8] Kazmierowski, T., P. Marks, and S. Lee. Ten-year performance review of in situ
  hot-mix recycling in Ontario. In *Transportation Research Record: Journal of the*
- 291 Transportation Research Board, No.1684, Transportation Research Board of the

- 292 National Academies, Washing, D.C., 1999, pp.194-202.
- 293 [9] Charmot S, P. Romero. Assessment of fracture parameters to predict field cracking
- 294 performance of cold in-place recycling mixtures. In *Transportation Research Record*:
- 295 Journal of the Transportation Research Board, No.2155, Transportation Research
- Board of the National Academies, Washing, D.C., 2010, pp.34-42.
- 297 [10] Gao, L., F. Ni, A.F. Braham, and H.L. Luo, Mixed-mode cracking behavior of cold
- 298 recycled mixes with emulsion using Arcan configuration. *Construction and Building*
- 299 *Materials*, Vol.55, 2014, pp. 415-422.
- 300 [11] Kim, Y. J., S. Im, and H. Lee. Impacts of curing time and moisture content on engineering
- properties of cold in-place recycling mixtures using foamed or emulsified asphalt. *Journal of Material in Civil Engineering*, Vol.23,No.5, 2011, pp. 542-553.
- 303 [12] Loria, L., P.E. Sebaaly, and E. Y.Hajj. Long-term performance of reflective cracking
- 304 mitigation techniques in Nevada, USA. In Transportation Research Record: Journal
- 305 of the Transportation Research Board, No.2044, Transportation Research Board of
- the National Academies, Washing, D.C., 2008, pp.86-95.
- 307 [13] Murphy, D., J.Emery. Performance evaluation of modified cold in-place asphalt
- 308 recycling. In: Proceedings of Annual Conference Canadian Society for Civil
- 309 *Engineering*, New Brunswick: CSCE; 1998.
- 310 [14]Rogge, D.F., R.G. Hicks, T.V. Scholz, and D. Allen. Case Histories of cold in-place

311	recycled asphalt pavements in central Oregon, USA. In Transportation Research
312	Record: Journal of the Transportation Research Board, No.1337, Transportation
313	Research Board of the National Academies, Washing, D.C., 1992, pp.61-70.
314	[15]Morian, D.A., J. Oswalt, and A. Deodha. Experience with cold in-place recycling as
315	a reflective crack control technique - twenty years later. In Transportation Research
316	Record: Journal of the Transportation Research Board, No. 1896, Transportation
317	Research Board of the National Academies, Washing, D.C., 2004, pp.47-55.