

1 **Potential Impact of Flowback Water from Hydraulic Fracturing on**  
2 **Agricultural Soil Quality: Metal/Metalloid Bioaccessibility, Microtox**  
3 **Bioassay, and Enzyme Activities**

4 Season S. Chen<sup>1</sup>, Yuqing Sun<sup>1,2</sup>, Daniel C.W. Tsang<sup>1,\*</sup>, Nigel J.D. Graham<sup>3</sup>, Yong Sik Ok<sup>4</sup>, Yujie  
5 Feng<sup>2,\*</sup>, Xiang-Dong Li<sup>1</sup>

6

7 <sup>1</sup> Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, The Hong Kong Polytechnic University, Hung  
8 Hom, Kowloon, Hong Kong, China.

9 <sup>2</sup> State Key Laboratory of Urban Water Resource and Environment, Harbin Institute of Technology,  
10 Harbin 150090, China.

11 <sup>3</sup> Environmental and Water Resources Engineering, Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering,  
12 Imperial College London, South Kensington, London SW7 2AZ, UK.

13 <sup>4</sup> School of Natural Resources and Environmental Science & Korea Biochar Research Center, Kangwon  
14 National University, Chuncheon 24341, Korea.

15 \* *Corresponding author (email: dan.tsang@polyu.edu.hk, phone: 852-2766-6072, fax: 852-2334-6389).*

16 \* *Co-corresponding author (email: yujief@hit.edu.cn, phone: 86-451-86283068, fax: 86-451-87162150).*

17 **Abstract**

18 Hydraulic fracturing has advanced the development of shale gas extraction, while inadvertent  
19 spills of flowback water may pose a risk to the surrounding environment due to its high salt  
20 content, metals/metalloids (As, Se, Fe and Sr), and organic additives. This study investigated the  
21 potential impact of flowback water on four representative soils from shale gas regions in  
22 Northeast China using synthetic flowback solutions. The compositions of the solutions were  
23 representative of flowback water arising at different stages after fracturing well establishment.  
24 The effects of solution composition of flowback water on soil ecosystem were assessed in terms  
25 of metal mobility and bioaccessibility, as well as biological endpoints using Microtox bioassay  
26 (*Vibrio fischeri*) and enzyme activity tests. After one-month artificial aging of the soils with  
27 various flowback solutions, the mobility and bioaccessibility of As(V) and Se(VI) decreased as  
28 the ionic strength of the flowback solutions increased. The results inferred a stronger binding  
29 affinity of As(V) and Se(VI) with the soils. Nevertheless, the soil toxicity to *Vibrio fischeri* only  
30 presented a moderate increase after aging, while dehydrogenase and phosphomonoesterase  
31 activities were significantly suppressed with increasing ionic strength of flowback solutions. On  
32 the contrary, polyacrylamide in the flowback solutions led to higher dehydrogenase activity.  
33 These results indicated that soil enzyme activities were sensitive to the composition of flowback  
34 solutions. A preliminary human health risk assessment related to As(V) suggested a low level of  
35 cancer risk through exposure via ingestion, while holistic assessment of environmental  
36 implications is required.

37 **Keywords:** fracturing fluids; metal mobility; microbial toxicity; enzyme activity; soil interaction.

38

39 **1. Introduction**

40 The technology breakthrough of hydraulic fracturing (fracking) has expanded the natural gas  
41 extraction from shale reserves, of which the global volume is estimated to be over 200 trillion m<sup>3</sup>  
42 (Kargbo et al., 2010; Kuuskraa et al., 2013). China plans to produce 300 billion m<sup>3</sup> of shale gas  
43 by 2020 (China's State Council, 2015). In spite of the huge economic benefit it may bring,  
44 fracking has raised substantial concerns on human health and environmental impact, such as air  
45 pollution (Bunch et al., 2014; Moore et al., 2014) and water contamination (Warner et al., 2013;  
46 Vengosh et al., 2014). Depending on the geological conditions of the shale formation, the  
47 fracking process requires varying amount of fracking fluid from 8000-19,000 m<sup>3</sup> per well, which  
48 is composed of about 90% water, 6-9% proppant and 0.5-2% chemical additives such as gelling  
49 agents, friction reducers, and surfactants (Gregory et al., 2011; Vidic et al., 2013; Vandecasteele  
50 et al., 2015).

51

52 About 10-70% of the injected fluid returning to the surface prior to gas recovery is known as  
53 flowback water, while the produced water is generated during gas production (Gregory et al.,  
54 2011; Vidic et al., 2013; Vengosh et al., 2014). These wastewaters contain elevated  
55 concentration of dissolved organic carbon (up to 590 mg L<sup>-1</sup>) from the chemical additives in  
56 fracking fluids. Naturally present substances such as radioactive elements, metals/metalloids, and  
57 brine salts from the shale formations also result in highly concentrated total dissolved solids (up  
58 to 350,000 mg L<sup>-1</sup>) (Barbot et al., 2013; Kondash et al., 2013; Lester et al., 2015). The release of  
59 fracking chemicals into the environment could happen at any stage during shale gas development  
60 from drilling to waste disposal due to accidental spills or operational failures (Ziemkiewicz et al.,  
61 2014; Vandecasteele et al., 2015). In particular, more than three quarters of the spills may

62 involve flowback and produced water as revealed by the latest study (McLaughlin et al., 2016),  
63 and the associated risks to water resources have aroused extensive interests (Ferrar et al., 2013;  
64 Warner et al., 2013; Vengosh et al., 2014). Recent studies have reported the positive  
65 relationships between the composition in fracking wastewaters and the occurrence of disinfection  
66 by-products (Hladik et al., 2014). Elevated concentrations of arsenic, selenium, and strontium  
67 (Fontenot et al., 2013; Abualfaraj et al., 2014) were also found in surrounding streams of shale  
68 gas formations. However, contamination in soil environment exposed to the spills of flowback  
69 and produced water is poorly understood in the existing literature (Annevelink et al., 2016).

70

71 In view of the elevated salt contents and organic additives in the fracking wastewater, the  
72 physico-chemical properties of soil such as viscosity and pH may be altered (Stringfellow et al.,  
73 2014). Our recent work has demonstrated that the leaching of flowback solutions may alter the  
74 transport channels in soil (Chen et al., 2016). Besides, the chemical interactions between  
75 fracking wastewater and soil environment may lead to eco-toxicological risks (Stringfellow et al.,  
76 2014; Annevelink et al., 2016). It has been shown that the biocide glutaraldehyde is largely  
77 sorbed in soil and it forms cross-linking with polyacrylamide (PAM), which is a friction reducer  
78 used in fracking fluids that can remain stable in soil over six months (Caulfield et al., 2002;  
79 McLaughlin et al., 2016). The presence of salts in the flowback water also prevents the  
80 biodegradation of polyethylene glycol, which is a surfactant employed in fracking fluid  
81 (McLaughlin et al., 2016). The complexity of the flowback water composition as well as the  
82 increasing reports of accidental spills have aggravated the potential risks to our soil environment  
83 and human health (Ziemkiewicz et al., 2014). Accidental spills of fracking fluids affect colloid  
84 mobilization in the unsaturated zone (Sang et al., 2014), while fracking activity often occurs near

85 the agricultural area and poses a higher risk to agricultural soil (McLaughlin et al., 2016).  
86 However, the implications of chemical toxicity of flowback water on soil organisms and  
87 functionalities of soil microbial communities such as enzyme activities of dehydrogenase and  
88 phosphomonoesterase still remain uncertain.

89  
90 Therefore, this study investigates the metal mobility/bioaccessibility and soil health by  
91 simulating spills of flowback water on representative surface soils collected in the vicinity of  
92 shale wells. Under acidic and oxidizing conditions in the flowback solution, As(V) and Se(VI)  
93 would be the predominant form and susceptible to mobilization (Phan et al., 2015; Parnell et al.,  
94 2016). Soil quality was assessed in terms of biological endpoints of the Microtox bioassay and  
95 soil enzyme activities, which are rapid and reliable approaches to assessing the chemical toxicity  
96 to organisms and the microbial activity in the soil ecosystem (Pandey and Singh, 2006; Maisto et  
97 al., 2011; Lyubun et al., 2013). Potential human health risk of accidental spills to neighbouring  
98 farmers is also estimated in this study.

99

## 100 **2. Materials and Methods**

### 101 *2.1 Soil sampling and synthetic flowback solutions*

102 The variations of soil properties on resultant metal mobilization and soil quality were  
103 investigated with four types of surface soils sampled from shale gas regions, namely Anda,  
104 Bayan, Binxian and Daqing, in Songliao Basin, China. The shale formation also overlapped with  
105 an elevated-arsenic-risk region (Rodriguez-Lado et al., 2013), which may increase the risk of the  
106 mobility and bioaccessibility of arsenic when exposed to the spills of flowback solutions. The soil  
107 samples were ground and passed through 2 mm sieve. The four soils were sampled from

108 agricultural land, where the pH ranged from 8.1 to 9.3, reflecting the prevalence of alkaline soils in  
109 this area. The content of total organic carbon (TOC) and amorphous Fe were measured, as they  
110 are known to provide major adsorption sites for arsenate (As(V)) and selenate (Se(VI)), and may  
111 influence the metal mobilization (Goldberg and Johnston, 2001; Peak and Sparks, 2002; Feng et  
112 al., 2013). Anda (AD) and Bayan (BY) soil contained similar level of TOC (25.3 mg g<sup>-1</sup> and 24.8  
113 mg g<sup>-1</sup>, respectively), while the amorphous Fe in BY soil (45.0 mg g<sup>-1</sup>) was much higher than  
114 that in AD soil (21.0 mg g<sup>-1</sup>). Binxian (BX) and Daqing (DQ) soil contained a relatively low  
115 amount of TOC (10.2 mg g<sup>-1</sup> and 12.4 mg g<sup>-1</sup>, respectively), and the amorphous Fe content was  
116 comparatively high in BX soil (38.7 mg g<sup>-1</sup>) but much less in DQ soil (9.36 mg g<sup>-1</sup>) (Table 1).

117  
118 The synthetic solutions were prepared according to the characteristics of Day 1 and Day 14  
119 (flowback water) as well as Day 90 (produced water) effluent waters from the comprehensive  
120 report (Hayes, 2009). In this study, they were referred to synthetic flowback solutions. As  
121 summarized in Table 2, they represented significant temporal variation in ionic strength, iron  
122 content, and scaling (precipitation) in the field. Polyacrylamide (0.088% v/v) and ethylene glycol  
123 (0.043% v/v) were added as commonly used fracturing additives (information obtained from  
124 FracFocus database; [www.FracFocus.org](http://www.FracFocus.org)). The presence of As(V) and Se(VI) has been widely  
125 reported in fracking fluids and aroused environmental concerns (Balaba and Smart, 2012;  
126 Fontenot et al., 2013; Abualfaraj et al., 2014), therefore, 100 µg L<sup>-1</sup> concentrations of assurance  
127 grade As(V) and Se(VI) (SPEX CertiPrep, USA) were spiked into flowback solutions (Sun et al.,  
128 2017). The presence of Sr(II) and Fe(III) in flowback solutions was also studied for their  
129 potential environmental impact. The soil quality and the associated risks of metals/metalloids of  
130 concern (i.e., As(V), Se(VI), Sr(II), and Fe(III)) were accordingly investigated in the case of spill

131 and leakage of flowback water near the ground surface.

132

### 133 *2.2 Metals/metalloids Leaching and Human Health Risks Assessment*

134 As the soil samples were obtained from the agricultural land of Northeast China Plain, where rice  
135 is one of the dominating crops (USDA, 2014) and flooded environment is prevalent in rice paddy  
136 fields, the fate of chemicals under saturated condition was investigated in this study. According  
137 to a sudden spill scenario where spill volume is 1000 gallon (3785.4 L) over an impacted area of  
138 0.1 acre (404.7 m<sup>2</sup>) (Gradient, 2012), the solid-to-liquid ratio was calculated to range from 7 to  
139 28 g L<sup>-1</sup> assuming the bulk density of soil of 1.3 x 10<sup>3</sup> kg m<sup>-3</sup> and the topsoil thickness of 5 to 20  
140 cm. Therefore, the median solid-to-liquid ratio (17.5 g L<sup>-1</sup>) was rounded up to 20 g L<sup>-1</sup> and  
141 adopted in this study. Each type of soil was mixed with Day 1, Day 14, and Day 90 flowback  
142 solutions (400 mL), respectively, in 500 ml polypropylene centrifuge bottles at a soil-to-solution  
143 ratio of 20 g L<sup>-1</sup>. The samples were shaken by an end-over-end shaker at 20 rpm for 24 h, and  
144 then incubated for 30 d at room temperature with daily shaking by hand for 1 min. At the end of  
145 30 days, the artificially aged samples were separated by centrifugation at 4000 rpm. The  
146 supernatant solutions were acidified with concentrated hydrochloric acid to pH less than 2 and  
147 stored at 4 °C. The concentrations of As(V) and Se(VI) were determined by Atomic Absorption  
148 Spectrometry with vapour generation accessory (VGA-AAS, Agilent VGA77, limit of detection  
149 1 µg L<sup>-1</sup>), while Sr(II) and Fe(III) were measured by AAS (limit of detection 1 mg L<sup>-1</sup>). The  
150 separated soils were air-dried (for subsequent biological analyses) in an incubator at room  
151 temperature with a relative humidity of 20%. The control soils were aged at the same conditions  
152 with deionized water instead of flowback solutions. Portions of the dried soils was assessed by  
153 Synthetic Precipitation Leaching Procedure (SPLP, US EPA 1312) and European Council Waste

154 Acceptance Criteria (ECWAC, prCEN/TS 12457-3) tests, simulating the mobility under leaching  
155 of acidic rainwater and unbuffered deionized water, respectively (Tsang et al., 2013a; 2013b).

156  
157 In regard of human health risks in the vicinity of sensitive regions, the bioaccessibility of As(V),  
158 Se(VI), Sr(II), and Fe(III) from the control and flowback-water-contaminated soils for human  
159 receptors was assessed by an *in vitro* simplified physiologically based extraction test (SBET) for  
160 estimating the bioaccessible metals in a simulated gastric environment (Drexler and Brattin,  
161 2007; Beiyuan et al., 2016). The non-carcinogenic and carcinogenic risks of As(V), Se(VI), and  
162 Sr(II) were characterized using the SBET results and US EPA standard methods. The hazard  
163 quotients (HQ) of a specific metal element from the exposure routes via accidental soil ingestion  
164 were added to determine a hazard index (HI) (US EPA, 1997; US EPA, 2001). The human risks  
165 were adjusted by the bioaccessible fraction (BAF) rather than the total metal concentration, and  
166 the corresponding hazard index (HI<sub>B</sub>) was derived (Luo et al., 2012; Beiyuan et al., 2016). Three  
167 major exposure pathways of heavy metals in soils were considered in this study: (a) ingestion; (b)  
168 inhalation; and (c) dermal absorption (De Miguel et al., 2007), while only (a) and (c) were of  
169 concern for As(V), Se(VI), and Sr(II) in flowback water contamination. Detailed calculations are  
170 shown in the Supplementary Information.

171

### 172 *2.3 Ecological impact on soil quality*

173 The Microtox<sup>®</sup> bioassay and selected soil enzyme activity tests were carried out on the soils after  
174 one-month exposure to flowback solutions. The soil toxicity was examined by the Microtox<sup>®</sup>  
175 Basic Solid-Phase Test (AZUR, Model M500 Analyzer), which detects changes to specific  
176 luminescent bacteria (*Vibrio fischeri*). The EC<sub>20</sub> was adopted to represent the soil concentration



177 at 20% effects on *Vibrio fischeri* bioluminescence upon 30-min exposure, which provides more  
178 sensitive endpoints (Fulladosa et al., 2005). Dehydrogenases and phosphomonoesterase activities  
179 were examined as a relatively rapid and easy procedure to assess soil health, which reflect the  
180 total metabolic activity of soil microorganisms and regulated phosphorus metabolism in soils,  
181 respectively (Lyubun et al., 2013; Beiyuan et al., 2017). Dehydrogenases activity was  
182 determined by standard assay that reduced 2,3,5-triphenyltetrazolium chloride to  
183 triphenylformazan, of which the intensity at 485 nm was detected by UV/Vis spectrophotometer  
184 (Biochrom, Libra S35). Since all the soils used in this study were alkaline soils, the predominant  
185 alkaline phosphomonoesterase activities were determined by measuring the *p*-nitrophenol  
186 released from *p*-nitrophenyl phosphate using UV/Visible spectrophotometer at 410 nm.

187

### 188 **3. Results and Discussion**

#### 189 *3.1 Mobility of metals/metalloids in soils after exposure to flowback solutions*

190 The mobility of As(V) and Se(VI) in the soils incubated with Day 1 flowback solution was more  
191 than 50% and 5 times higher than those in the control soils when subject to DI water leaching  
192 and acidic rainfall, respectively (Figure 1a-d). The mobility of both metalloids drastically  
193 decreased with increasing ionic strength of flowback solutions (Table 2). The concentrations of  
194 extracted As(V) from the soils incubated with Day 14 and Day 90 flowback solutions were even  
195 lower than those from the control (Figure 1a&c). This suggested an unexpected suppression of  
196 metal mobility by the chemical composition of the flowback solutions. The results may be  
197 explained by possible change of binding phases in soil or formation of precipitates with elevated  
198 cation concentrations in the flowback solutions, particularly for Ba(II), Ca(II), and Fe(III) as  
199 shown in previous studies on arsenate (Zhang and Selim, 2005; Zhu et al., 2005). Besides, the

200 concentrations of As(V) in the ECWAC and SPLP tests were relatively comparable despite the  
201 difference in soil-to-solution ratios (0.1 and 0.05 kg L<sup>-1</sup>), indicating that As(V) was probably  
202 desorbed from the soils via dissolution of acid-soluble minerals. Selenate showed similar  
203 extraction patterns to As(V), but nearly 10-times higher leachate levels than the latter, suggesting  
204 its weaker binding with the soils, which was also in line with our previous results of column  
205 studies on metal transport (Chen et al., 2016).

206  
207 The significance of soil characteristics on metal mobility seems to be less important than solution  
208 chemistry of flowback water in this study. For instance, the metal concentrations in the leachates  
209 from the BY and BX soils, which had abundant amounts of amorphous iron (oxy)hydroxides and  
210 clay minerals, did not differ much from those of the sandy DQ soil (Figure 1a-d). Although these  
211 contents proved to have a high affinity for the sorption and immobilization of As(V) and Se(VI)  
212 (Peak and Sparks, 2002; Dixit and Hearing, 2003), this may be comparatively less important than  
213 the effects of anionic PAM and elevated ionic strength in the flowback solutions.

214  
215 As shown in Figure 2a&c, the mobility of Fe(III) was similar to that of As(V) and Se(VI). It was  
216 the highest after aging with Day 1 flowback solution, even although the concentration of Fe(III)  
217 significantly increased from Day 1 to Day 90 flowback solutions. It has been reported that Fe(III)  
218 precipitates as Fe(OH)<sub>3</sub> in the flowback water (Lester et al., 2015), which probably induces the  
219 co-precipitation and surface-precipitation with As(V) and Se(VI), thereby reducing their mobility  
220 as observed in this study. In contrast, the leachate concentration of Sr(II) was significant and  
221 increased from the Day 1 to Day 90 flowback solutions (Figure 2b&d), indicating a large  
222 sorption capacity of Sr(II) in the four soils yet sorbed Sr(II) was relatively easy to leach out by

223 neutral or slightly acidic solutions. This result supports the previous findings that the sorption of  
224 Sr(II) in soil mainly depends on ion exchange and the sorbed Sr(II) exists in labile fraction  
225 (Twining et al., 2004; Gil-García et al., 2008), even in the matrix of fracking solutions.

226

### 227 *3.2 Bioaccessibility of metals/metalloids in soils after exposure to flowback solutions*

228 Figure 3a&b showed that the BAF values of As(V) and Se(VI) in all types of soils decreased  
229 gradually with flowback solution exposure from Day 1 to Day 90. Interestingly, the  
230 bioaccessible As(V) in all soil samples aged with the same flowback solution (except AD soil)  
231 showed comparable BAF values regardless of the amount of Fe (oxy)hydroxides. The amounts  
232 of As(V) sorption in each soil did not significantly vary among various flowback solutions as  
233 indicated by mass balance calculation (Table S1). It is known that As(V) bounded by iron  
234 (oxy)hydroxides could be released in the gastric solution (i.e., 0.4 M glycine in this study) in the  
235 gastrointestinal tract (Smith et al., 2008). While As(V) would also co-precipitate with Fe(OH)<sub>3</sub>  
236 on soils during aging (Lester et al., 2015), the results of this study suggested that this fraction  
237 was possibly bioaccessible as well. Consequently, the BAF values of As(V) showed little  
238 variation among soils by glycine extraction. The BAF value over 100% (i.e., bioaccessible  
239 concentration was higher than spiked total concentration) for the AD soil confirmed the presence  
240 of indigenous As(V) in an elevated-arsenic-risk region. In addition, the decreasing BAF values  
241 from Day 1 to Day 90 fracking solutions may suggest that the aquatic chemistry had an effect on  
242 metal bioaccessibility. Previous bioaccessibility studies revealed a decrease of soluble and  
243 exchangeable fractions with time during soil aging (Tang et al., 2007; Quazi et al., 2010), while  
244 this study indicated that the solutions with higher ionic strength may favour the metal binding  
245 with less-extractable fractions.

246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268

In contrast to the higher mobility of Se(VI) than As(V) (Figure 1a&b), the bioaccessibility of Se(VI) was generally lower than As(V) (Figure 3a&b). This could be attributed to the capability of glycine in the gastric solution for solubilizing more iron (oxy)hydroxides and consequently more associated As(V) was extracted (Meunier et al., 2010). There was an absence of a clear relationship between sorption and bioaccessibility of As(V) and Se(VI) (Figure S1), which corroborated the lack of correlation between the mobility (i.e., ECWAC and SPLP) and bioaccessibility (i.e., SBET) due to the different conditions in the measurements (Yang et al., 2002). The important implication of these findings is that although the risk of groundwater contamination by metal leaching is much lower in Day 14- and Day 90-contaminated soil, the relatively high BAF values in all soil samples may result in human health risk (as exemplified in subsequent section).

Moreover, the bioaccessible Se(VI) was much lower in the BX and DQ soils (approximately 10%) than in the BY and AD soils (about 40%) (Figure 3b). Both BY and AD soils had the highest amount of TOC (Table 1), which, however, has been reported to inhibit Se bioaccessibility to plants (Johnsson, 1991). The relatively high BAF values for Se(VI) in these soils indicated that the controlling factors may differ for bioaccessibility to plants and humans. The results of bioaccessible Fe(III) and Sr(II) related to the impacts of flowback solutions were inconclusive as a considerable amount of Fe(III) may come from indigenous soil (Table S1), while substantial concentrations of Sr(II) in the flowback solutions (up to 3320 mg L<sup>-1</sup>) may override the effects of different soil properties (Figure 3c&d).

269 3.3 Effects of flowback solutions on soil toxicity and functions

270 Bioavailability and soil properties are known to affect toxicity of metals in soils (Maisto et al.,  
271 2011). A mild increase of toxicity (i.e., a lower EC<sub>20</sub> value) was observed in the soils aged with  
272 flowback solutions compared to the control (Table 3). Arsenic(V) is known to hinder the  
273 generation of ATP and consequently inhibits *Vibrio fischeri* bioluminescence emission (Rubinos  
274 et al., 2014). On the other hand, the EC<sub>20</sub> values were approximately the same among flowback  
275 solutions in each soil. This could be related to the soil-metal interactions in Day 14 and Day 90  
276 flowback solutions, because they could limit the metal bioavailability to *Vibrio fischeri* (Tsiridis  
277 et al., 2006; Rubinos et al., 2014). This result was in accordance with lower mobility and  
278 bioaccessibility in soils incubated with Day 14 and Day 90 flowback solutions than with Day 1  
279 flowback solution.

280  
281 In addition, the compositional difference in the Day 1, 14, and 90 flowback water may alter the  
282 toxicity significantly, as the additive, synergistic, or antagonistic effects of heavy metals on  
283 toxicity was dependent on the concentration of each metal in the mixture (Tsiridis et al., 2006).  
284 Stimulation of light emissions was detected in BY soil, which was probably due to the organic  
285 compounds in the soil matrix that favoured the bioluminescence of *Vibrio fischeri* (Tang et al.,  
286 2012), hence overcoming the effects of flowback solutions. Although AD soil had a similar TOC  
287 content as BY soil (Table 1), indigenous arsenic exerted toxicity to AD soil, which was validated  
288 by the mobility result (Figure 1) and Microtox bioassay (Table 3) in the control group.

289  
290 As shown in Figure 4a, dehydrogenase activity was suppressed in soils with flowback solutions  
291 of higher ionic strength. Metal contamination could disrupt soil functions by uncoupling the

292 formation of enzyme-substrate complexes, or masking the active groups on enzymes (Gianfreda  
293 et al., 2005). Reduced dehydrogenase activity in soils was consistent with the increasing metal  
294 contents in flowback solutions. Since As(V) hampers ATP generation, it affects the total  
295 oxidative activity catalyzed by dehydrogenase (Rubinos et al., 2014). However, there was an  
296 increase of dehydrogenase activity in the incubation with Day 1 flowback solution in BX and  
297 DQ soil. A recent study on the impacts of fracking additives on agricultural topsoil showed an  
298 increased ATP concentration in the presence of PAM (McLaughlin et al., 2016), which may  
299 suggest an increasing microbial activity due to the utilization of the nitrogen source from PAM.  
300 It has been shown that PAM is stable in soil and water without degradation over six-month  
301 incubation (Caulfield et al., 2002; McLaughlin et al., 2016). Therefore, the presence of PAM  
302 may promote dehydrogenase activity, while its beneficial effect was offset in Day 14 and Day 90  
303 flowback solutions.

304

305 Similarly, phosphomonoesterase activity was significantly suppressed after incubation with Day  
306 90 flowback solution (Figure 4b). Phosphate transporters could also take up As(V) because of  
307 similar chemical and structural properties between phosphate (electron configuration of  
308 phosphorus:  $[\text{Ne}] 3s^2 3p^3$ ) and arsenate (electron configuration of arsenic:  $[\text{Ar}] 3d^{10} 4s^2 4p^3$ ), and  
309 competition between arsenate and phosphate in phosphatase activity was reported in soils (Rosen  
310 and Liu, 2009; Rubinos et al., 2014). A slight increase of phosphatase activity was found in some  
311 soils after incubation with Day 1 flowback solution. Lyubun et al. (2013) also reported an  
312 increase of soil phosphatase activities in As-contaminated soil, which could be also attributed to  
313 analogous functions between phosphate and As(V) or the increase of phosphate-solubilizing  
314 bacteria in soil. Varied microbial communities established in soils during aging with flowback

315 solutions may also contribute to a slight-to-moderate increase of dehydrogenase and  
316 phosphomonoesterase activity in some soils with Day 1 solution (Mohan et al., 2013; Cluff et al.,  
317 2014). In contrast to the lower mobility and bioaccessibility with Day 14 and Day 90 flowback  
318 solutions, the more adverse influence on soil enzyme activities with Day 14 and Day 90 solution  
319 indicated the contents of flowback solution should also be accessed by soil microflora. These  
320 results revealed that flowback solutions were able to alter the soil microbial functions and the  
321 influence varied with soil type, while only a gentle increase of toxicity was determined by  
322 Microtox bioassay. A summary of the chemical and biological impact of various flowback  
323 solutions on the soil environment was given in Table 4.

324

325 The carcinogenic risk assessment was based on the As(V) concentration in soils after one-month  
326 aging with flowback solutions. Among the four concerned metals in this study, As(V) is  
327 classified as a known human carcinogen by the Integrated Risk Information System of US EPA.  
328 The results revealed that the adjusted carcinogenic risk posed by As(V) ranged from  $4.56 \times 10^{-7}$  to  
329  $2.09 \times 10^{-6}$ , of which more than 85% was attributed to exposure via ingestion (Table S2).  
330 According to the US EPA (2011), the cancer risks derived in this study would be considered  
331 acceptable ( $10^{-4} - 10^{-6}$ ), so that remediation might not be needed immediately. As for non-  
332 carcinogenic risks related to the metals present in this study (As(V), Se(VI) and Sr(II)), ingestion  
333 was also the dominant pathway followed by dermal contact and inhalation. The non-cancer  
334 hazard index representing the aggregated non-carcinogenic effects of metals was smaller than 1  
335 in this study, which meant that concern about an increase of health hazard was less likely (US  
336 EPA, 2011). Although this study has provided an approximate assessment of human health risks,  
337 the evaluation needs to be validated by site-specific exposure pathways. Potential synergistic or

338 antagonistic effects associated with the complex matrices and other components in the flowback  
339 water should be taken into account in order to provide a more comprehensive evaluation of the  
340 environmental risks.

341

#### 342 **4. Conclusions**

343 During hydraulic fracturing, inadvertent spills of flowback water have been reported. Here, we  
344 investigated the impact of contaminated flowback waters on environmental quality, soil  
345 ecological health, and human health risk exposed to the surrounding soils of representative shale  
346 gas areas in China. Both the mobility and bioaccessibility of As(V) and Se(VI) decreased as the  
347 ionic strength in flowback solution increased, indicating a change of metal-binding phases with  
348 varying solution pH and composition. The results revealed a mild increase of soil toxicity  
349 (Microtox bioassay) compared to the control after one-month aging with flowback solutions,  
350 while the dehydrogenase activity and phosphomonoesterase activity were significantly decreased  
351 with increasing ionic strength in flowback solutions. A preliminary human health risk assessment  
352 implied no immediate need for remediation due to As(V) and Se(VI). This study demonstrates  
353 that the temporal change of flowback water compositions leads to different environmental  
354 implications, which deserve more comprehensive evaluation for a holistic understanding of the  
355 environmental impact of fracking process.

356

#### 357 **Acknowledgements**

358 The authors appreciate the financial support from the National Natural Science Foundation of  
359 China (21407121), Hong Kong Research Grants Council (PolyU 538613 and 15222115), and  
360 State Key Laboratory of Urban Water Resource and Environment (HCK201209) for this study.



361

362 **References**

363 Abualfaraj, N., Gurian, P.L., and Olson, M.S., 2014. Characterization of Marcellus shale  
364 flowback water. *Environ. Eng. Sci.* 31, 514-524.

365 Annevelink, M.P.J.A., Meesters, J.A.J., Hendriks, A.J., 2016. Environmental contamination due  
366 to shale gas development. *Sci. Total Environ.* 550, 431-438.

367 Balaba, R.S.; Smart, R.B., 2012. Total arsenic and selenium analysis in Marcellus shale, high-  
368 salinity water, and hydrofracture flowback wastewater. *Chemosphere* 89, 1437-1442.

369 Barbot, E., Vidic, N. S., Gregory, K. B., Vidic, R. D., 2013. Spatial and temporal correlation of  
370 water quality parameters of produced waters from Devonian-age shale following hydraulic  
371 fracturing. *Environ. Sci. Technol.*, 47, 2562-2569.

372 Beiyuan, J., Tsang, D.C.W., Ok, Y.S., Zhang, W., Yang, X., Baek, K., Li, X.D., 2016.  
373 Integrating EDDS-enhanced washing with low-cost stabilization of metal-contaminated soil from  
374 an e-waste recycling site. *Chemosphere*, 159, 426-432.

375 Beiyuan, J., Tsang, D.C.W., Valix, M., Zhang, W., Yang, X., Ok, Y.S., Li, X.D., 2017. Selective  
376 dissolution followed by EDDS washing of an e-waste contaminated soil: Extraction efficiency,  
377 fate of residual metals, and impact on soil quality. *Chemosphere* 166, 489-496.

378 Bunch, A., Perry, C., Abraham, L., Wikoff, D., Tachovsky, J., Hixon, J., Urban, J., Harris, M.,  
379 Haws, L., 2014. Evaluation of impact of shale gas operations in the Barnett Shale region on  
380 volatile organic compounds in air and potential human health risks. *Sci. Total Environ.* 468,  
381 832–842.

382 Caulfield, M.J., Qiao, G.G., Solomon, D.H., 2002. Some aspects of the properties and  
383 degradation of polyacrylamides. *Chem. Rev.* 102, 3067-3083.

384 Chen, S.S., Sun, Y., Tsang, D.C.W., Graham, N.J.D., Ok, Y.S., Feng, Y., Li, X.D., 2016.  
385 Insights into the subsurface transport of As(V) and Se(VI) in flowback water from hydraulic  
386 fracturing. *Environ. Pollut.* under review.

387 China's State Council, 2016. National People's Congress 13th Five-Year Plan.  
388 [http://www.china.org.cn/china/NPC\\_CPPCC\\_2016/node\\_7234656.htm](http://www.china.org.cn/china/NPC_CPPCC_2016/node_7234656.htm)

389 Cluff, M. A., Hartsock, A., MacRae, J. D., Carter, K., Mouser, P. J., 2014. Temporal changes in  
390 microbial ecology and geochemistry in produced water from hydraulically fractured Marcellus  
391 shale gas wells. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 48, 6508–6517.

392 De Miguel, E., Iribarren, I., Chacon, E., Ordonez, A., Charlesworth, S., 2007. Risk-based  
393 evaluation of the exposure of children to trace elements in playgrounds in Madrid (Spain).  
394 *Chemosphere*, 66, 505–513.

395 Dixit, S.; Hering, J.G., 2003. Comparison of arsenic (V) and arsenic (III) sorption onto iron  
396 oxide minerals: implications for arsenic mobility. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 37, 4182-4189.

397 Drexler J.W., Brattin W.J., 2007. An in vitro procedure for estimation of lead relative  
398 bioavailability: with validation. *Hum. Ecol. Risk Assess.* 13, 383–401.

399 Feng, Q., Zhang, Z., Chen, Y., Liu, L., Zhang, Z., Chen, C., 2013. Adsorption and desorption  
400 characteristics of arsenic on soils: kinetics, equilibrium, and effect of Fe(OH)<sub>3</sub> colloid, H<sub>2</sub>SiO<sub>3</sub>  
401 colloid and phosphate. *Procedia Environ. Sci.* 18, 26-36.

402 Ferrar, K.J., Michanowicz, D.R., Christen, C.L., Mulcahy, N., Malone, S.L., and Sharma, R.K.,  
403 2013. Assessment of effluent contaminants from three facilities discharging Marcellus shale  
404 wastewater to surface waters in Pennsylvania. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 47, 3472-3481.

405 Fontenot, B.E., Hunt, L.R., Hildenbrand, Z.L., Carlton Jr., D.D., Oka, H., Walton, J.L., Hopkins,  
406 D., Osorio, A., Bjorndal, B., Hu, Q.H., and Schug, K.A., 2013. An evaluation of water quality in

407 private drinking water wells near natural gas extraction sites in the Barnett shale formation.  
408 Environ. Sci. Technol. 47, 10032-10040.

409 FracFocus, 2016. What chemicals are used. [https://fracfocus.org/chemical-use/what-chemicals-](https://fracfocus.org/chemical-use/what-chemicals-are-used)  
410 [are-used](https://fracfocus.org/chemical-use/what-chemicals-are-used).

411 Fulladosa, E., Murat, J.C., Martínez, M., Villaescusa, I., 2005. Patterns of metals and arsenic  
412 poisoning in *Vibrio fischeri* bacteria. Chemosphere, 60, 43-48.

413 Gianfreda, L., Rao, M.A., Piotrowska, A., Palumbo, G., Colombo, C., 2005. Soil enzyme  
414 activities as affected by anthropogenic alterations: intensive agricultural practices and organic  
415 pollution. Sci. Total Environ. 341, 265–279.

416 Gil-García, C.J., Rigol, A., Rauret, G., Vidal, M., 2008. Radionuclide sorption-desorption pattern  
417 in soils from Spain. Appl. Radiat. Isot. 66, 126-138.

418 Goldberg, S., Johnston, C.T., 2001. Mechanisms of arsenic adsorption on amorphous oxides  
419 evaluated using macroscopic measurements, vibrational spectroscopy, and surface complexation  
420 modelling. J. Colloid Interface Sci. 234, 204-216.

421 Gradient, 2012. Human Health Risk Evaluation for Hydraulic Fracturing Fluid Additives.  
422 [https://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/3D73316595F846C185257C2400686964/\\$File/Gra](https://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/3D73316595F846C185257C2400686964/$File/Gradient+Human+Health+Risk+Evaluation.pdf)  
423 [dient+Human+Health+Risk+Evaluation.pdf](https://yosemite.epa.gov/sab/sabproduct.nsf/3D73316595F846C185257C2400686964/$File/Gradient+Human+Health+Risk+Evaluation.pdf)

424 Gregory, K.B., Vidic, R.D., and Dzombak, D.A., 2011. Water management challenges associated  
425 with the production of shale gas by hydraulic fracturing. Elements 7, 18-186.

426 Hayes, T., 2009. Sampling and Analysis of Water Streams Associated with the Development of  
427 Marcellus Shale Gas. Final report prepared for Marcellus Shale Coalition, Gas Technology  
428 Institute, Des Plaines, IL 60018.

429 Hladik, M.L., Focazio, M.J., Engle, M., 2014. Discharges of produced waters from oil and gas

430 extraction via wastewater treatment plants are sources of disinfection by-products to receiving  
431 streams. *Sci. Total Environ.* 466, 1085–1093.

432 Kargbo, D. M., Wilhelm, R. G., Campbell, D. J., 2010. Natural gas plays in the Marcellus Shale:  
433 challenges and potential opportunities. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 44, 5679–5684.

434 Kondash, A.J., Warner, N.R., Lahav, O., Vengosh, A., 2013. Radium and barium removal  
435 through blending hydraulic fracturing fluids with acid mine drainage. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 48,  
436 1334-1342.

437 Kuuskraa, V., Stevens, S.H., Moodhe, K.D., 2013. Technically recoverable shale oil and shale  
438 gas resources: An assessment of 137 shale formations in 41 countries outside the United States.

439 Lester, Y., Ferrer, I., Thurman, E.M., Sitterley, K.A., Korak, J.A., Aiken, G., Linden, K.G., 2015.  
440 Characterization of hydraulic fracturing flowback water in Colorado: implications for water  
441 treatment. *Sci. Total Environ.* 512, 637–644.

442 Luo, X.S., Ding, J., Xu, B., Wang, Y.J., Li, H.B., Yu, S., 2012. Incorporating bio-accessibility  
443 into human health risk assessments of heavy metals in urban park soils. *Sci. Total Environ.* 424,  
444 88-96.

445 Lyubun, Y.V., Pleshakova, E.V., Mkandawire, M., Turkovskaya, O.V., 2013. Diverse effects of  
446 arsenic on selected enzyme activities in soil-plant-microbe interactions. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 262,  
447 685–690.

448 Maisto, G., Manzo, S., De Nicola, F., Carotenuto, R., Rocco, A., Alfani, A., 2011. Assessment of  
449 the effects of Cr, Cu, Ni and Pb soil contamination by ecotoxicological tests. *J. Environ. Monit.*  
450 13, 3049-3056.

451 McLaughlin, M.C., Borch, T., Blotvogel, J., 2016. Spills of hydraulic fracturing chemicals on  
452 agricultural topsoil: Biodegradation, sorption, and co-contaminant interactions. *Environ. Sci.*

453 Technol. 50, 6071-6078.

454 Meunier, L., Wragg, J., Koch, I., Reimer, K.J., 2010. Method variables affecting the  
455 bioaccessibility of arsenic in soil. J. Environ. Sci. Health, Part A. 45, 517-526.

456 Mohan, A.M., Hartsock, A., Bibby, K.J., Hammack, R.W., Vidic, R.D., Gregory, K.B., 2013.  
457 Microbial community changes in hydraulic fracturing fluids and produced water from shale gas  
458 extraction. Environ. Sci. Technol. 47, 13141-13150.

459 Moore, C.W., Zielinska, B., Petron, G., Jackson, R.B., 2014. Air impacts of increased natural gas  
460 acquisition, processing, and use: A critical review. Environ. Sci. Technol. 48, 8349-8359.

461 Pandey, S., Singh, D.K., 2006. Soil dehydrogenase, phosphomonoesterase and arginine  
462 deaminase activities in an insecticide treated groundnut (*Arachis hypogaea L.*) field.  
463 Chemosphere, 63, 869-880.

464 Parnell, J., Broily, C., Spinks, S., Bowden, S. 2016. Selenium enrichment in Carboniferous  
465 Shales, Britain and Ireland: Problem or opportunity for shale gas extraction? Appl. Geochem. 66,  
466 82-87.

467 Peak, D., Sparks, L., 2002. Mechanisms of selenite adsorption on iron oxides and hydroxides.  
468 Environ. Sci. Technol. 36, 1460-1466.

469 Phan, T.T., Capo, R.C., Stewart, B.W., Graney, J.R., Johnson, J.D., Sharma, S., Toro, J. 2015.  
470 Trace metal distribution and mobility in drill cuttings and produced waters from Marcellus Shale  
471 gas extraction: Uranium, arsenic, barium. Appl. Geochem. 60, 89-103.

472 Quazi, S., Sarkar, D., Datta, R., 2010. Effect of soil aging on arsenic fractionation and bio-  
473 accessibility in inorganic arsenic pesticide contaminated soils. Appl. Geochem. 25, 1422-1430.

474 Rodriguez-Lado, L., Sun, G., Berg, M., Zhang, Q., Xue, H. B., Zheng, Q. M., Johnson, C. A.,  
475 2013. Groundwater arsenic contamination throughout China. Science 341, 866-868.

476 Rosen, B.P., Liu, Z., 2009. Transport pathways for arsenic and selenium: a minireview. *Environ.*  
477 *Int.* 35, 512-515.

478 Rubinos, D.A., Calvo, V., Iglesias, L., Barral, M.T., 2014. Acute toxicity of arsenic to *Alivibrio*  
479 *fischeri* (Microtox® bioassay) as influenced by potential competitive-protective agents. *Environ.*  
480 *Sci. Pollut. Res.* 21, 8631–8644.

481 Sang, W., Stoof, C.R., Zhang, W., Morales, V.L., Gao, B., Kay, R.W., Liu, L., Zhang, Y.,  
482 Steenhuis, T.S., 2014. Effect of hydrofracking fluid on colloid transport in the unsaturated zone.  
483 *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 48, 8266-8274.

484 Smith, E., Naidu, R., Weber, J., Juhasz, A.L., 2008. The impact of sequestration on the bio-  
485 accessibility of arsenic in long-term contaminated soils. *Chemosphere* 71, 773–780.

486 Stringfellow, W.T., Domen, J.K., Camarillo, M.K., Sandelin, W.L., Borglin, S., 2014. Physical,  
487 chemical, and biological characteristics of compounds used in hydraulic fracturing. *J. Hazard.*  
488 *Mater.* 275, 37-54.

489 Sun, Y., Chen, S.S., Tsang, D.C.W., Graham, N.J.D., Ok, Y.S., Feng, Y., Li, X.D., 2017. Zero-  
490 valent iron for the abatement of arsenate and selenate from flowback water of hydraulic  
491 fracturing. *Chemosphere* 167, 163-170.

492 Tang, J.Y.M., Glenn, E., Thoen, H., Escher, B.I., 2012. In vitro bioassay for reactive toxicity  
493 towards proteins implemented for water quality monitoring. *J. Environ. Monit.* 14, 1073-1081.

494 Tang, X.Y., Zhu, Y.G., Shan, X.Q., McLaren, R., Duan, J., 2007. The ageing effect on the bio-  
495 accessibility and fractionation of arsenic in soils from China. *Chemosphere* 66, 1183–1190.

496 Tsang, D.C.W., Olds, W.E., Weber, P.A., 2013b. Residual leachability of CCA-contaminated  
497 soil after treatment with biodegradable chelating agents and lignite-derived humic substances. *J.*  
498 *Soil. Sediment.* 13, 895-905.

499 Tsang, D.C.W., Olds, W.E., Weber, P.A., Yip, A.C.K., 2013a. Soil stabilisation using AMD  
500 sludge, compost and lignite: TCLP leachability and continuous acid leaching. *Chemosphere* 93,  
501 2839-2847.

502 Tsiridis, V., Petala, M., Samaras, P., Hadjispyrou, S., Sakellaropoulos, G., Kungolos, A., 2006.  
503 Interactive toxic effects of heavy metals and humic acids on *Vibrio fischeri*. *Ecotoxicol. Environ.*  
504 *Saf.* 63, 158–167.

505 Twining, J.R., Payne, T.E., Itakura, T., 2004. Soil-water distribution coefficients and plant  
506 transfer factors for <sup>134</sup>Cs, <sup>85</sup>Sr and <sup>65</sup>Zn under field conditions in tropical Australia. *J. Environ.*  
507 *Radioact.* 71, 71-87.

508 US EPA, 1994. Method 1312: Synthetic Precipitation Leaching Procedure.

509 US EPA, 1997. Exposure Factors Handbook (EPA/600/P-95/002Fa) (Update to Exposure  
510 Factors Handbook (EPA/600/8–89/043), Washington, D.C., USA.

511 US EPA, 2001. Risk Assessment Guidance for Superfund: volume III — part A, process for  
512 conducting probabilistic risk assessment. Washington, DC.

513 USDA, 2014. Northeast China: Prospects for U.S. Agricultural Exports.  
514 <http://www.fas.usda.gov/data/northeast-china-prospects-us-agricultural-exports>

515 Vandecasteele, I., Marí Rivero, I., Sala, S., Baranzelli, C., Barranco, R., Batelaan, O., Lavalle, C.,  
516 2015. Impact of shale gas development on water resources: a case study in northern Poland.  
517 *Environ. Manage.* 55, 1285-1299.

518 Vengosh, A., Jackson, R.B., Warner, N., Darrah, T.H., Kondash, A., 2014. A critical review of  
519 the risks to water resources from unconventional shale gas development and hydraulic fracturing  
520 in the United States. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 48, 8334-8348.

521 Vidic, R., Brantley, S., Vandenbossche, J., Yoxtheimer, D., and Abad, J., 2013. Impact of shale

522 gas development on regional water quality. *Science* 340, 12350091-12350099.

523 Warner, N.R., Christie, C.A., Jackson, R.B., and Vengosh, A., 2013. Impacts of shale gas  
524 wastewater disposal on water quality in Western Pennsylvania. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 47,  
525 11849-11857.

526 Yang, J.K., Barnett, M.O., Jardine, P.M., Basta, N.T., Casteel, S.W., 2002. Adsorption,  
527 sequestration, and bio-accessibility of As(V) in soils. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* 36, 4562-4569.

528 Zhang, H., Selim, H.M., 2005. Kinetics of arsenate adsorption – desorption in soils. *Environ. Sci.*  
529 *Technol.* 39, 6101-6108.

530 Zhu, Y., Zhang, X., Xie, Q., Chen, Y., Wang, D., Liang, Y., Lu, J. 2005. Solubility and stability  
531 of barium arsenate and barium hydrogen arsenate at 25 °C. *J. Hazard. Mater.* 120, 37-44.

532 Ziemkiewicz, P.F., Quaranta, J.D., Darnell, A.D., Wise, R., 2014. Exposure pathways related to  
533 shale gas development and procedures for reducing environmental and public risk. *J. Nat. Gas*  
534 *Sci. Eng.* 16, 77-84.