https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2015.11.011

Reconfiguring Chinese cultural values and their tourism implications

Hsu, Cathy H.C., and Huang, Songshan (Sam)

Abstract:

This study explores the Chinese cultural values that prevail in the contemporary Chinese society and their tourism implications. Focus group discussions with residents in Beijing and Guangzhou identified 40 Chinese value items, which are classified as instrumental, terminal, and interpersonal. These value items are largely different from traditional Chinese values in the literature and provide a timely update on the current values system in China. Modern terminal values identified that demonstrate relationships with travel behaviors include *convenience*, *indulgence*, *leisure*, *liberation*, *self-interest*, and *ostentation.* Traditional values found to be associated with travel behaviors include the instrumental values of *courtesy and morality*, *honesty*, *respect for history*, and *thrift*; the terminal values of *horizon broadening/novelty*, *knowledge and education*, and *stability and security*; and the interpersonal values of *conformity* and *family orientation/kinship*. These Chinese value items serve as an invaluable measurement pool for future tourism research.

Keywords: China, Chinese tourist, contemporary, cultural value, travel preferences

1. Introduction

Cultural values are widely recognized by marketing theorists as one of the underlying determinants of consumer behaviors in tourism (e.g., De Mooij, 2010; Fu, Lehto, & Cai, 2012). Culture is generally defined as a cognitive system consisting of values, beliefs, norms, and other similar subjective constructs that shape human behavior and distinguish particular groups of people from others (Geertz, 2000; Goodenough, 1971; Kroeber & Parsons, 1958; Pizam, Jansen-Verbeke, & Steel, 1997). Cultural values are pivotal in influencing people's communication and thus defining cultural differences (Bond, 1996). Admittedly, every individual possesses a distinctive set of personal values that are molded by both the shared culture in the society and personal experiences. Schwartz (1994) argued that the commonalities found in social members' values formed the basis of a culture. To better understand Chinese tourists and their behaviors, a thorough understanding of their cultural values is required.

Research on cultural values has been dominated by a Western paradigm derived from mainstream Western ideologies, philosophies, and scientific research traditions; at the same time, such research is characterized by a dichotomous, analytical, logical, and rational approach of thinking. Despite the value of such a paradigm in advancing human knowledge, this paradigm is facing increasing criticisms (Lewis, 2000). As the world steps into a new era that views Eastern

cultures (and their influence on human behaviors) playing an increasing role in various aspects of human life, the current (Western) research paradigm in cultural values studies has limitations in advancing our understanding of non-Western cultures and associated behaviors (Winter, 2009). Jennings (2009), among many other scholars, called for a complete reconsideration of the lens from which tourism experiences could be interpreted and emphasized the need to identify and adopt alternative approaches to the Western-centric tourism research paradigm. Cross-cultural research involving Chinese nationals has also garnered the attention of tourism researchers; in this regard, theories developed in Western contexts need to be verified in Eastern cultural contexts (Schwartz & Bilsky, 1990).

Currently, the literature is insufficient in providing a solid theoretical foundation for researchers to proceed in investigating the relationship between Chinese cultural values and consumer behaviors in modern business contexts. Despite the growing body of literature in Chinese language examining the relationship between Chinese values and consumer behaviors (e.g., Pan, 2009; Zhang, 2012), most studies undertaken by researchers in China focus on the traditional Chinese values and how they explain Chinese consumer behaviors. Few studies have attempted to identify modern Chinese values and their influence on Chinese consumer behaviors. In tourism, the relationship between Chinese cultural values and Chinese tourist behaviors is unclear. Given that China is undergoing unprecedented social and cultural transformation, understanding Chinese tourist behaviors on the basis of their cultural values would be further restricted by a lack of current depiction of prevailing Chinese cultural values in China. Therefore, this study primarily aimed to explore and identify currently prevailing contemporary Chinese cultural values in China. As a secondary research objective, this study examined the potential linkages between Chinese cultural values and Chinese tourist behaviors in outbound travel. The study contributes to the provision of a solid pool of Chinese values that serves as the foundation for the future development and applications of a scale for Chinese cultural values in the tourism context.

2. Literature review

2.1 Need to identify contemporary Chinese cultural values

Both etic and emic perspectives can be found in prior research on cultural values. Adopting an etic perspective, Rokeach's (1973) Value Survey (RVS), Hofstede's (1980, 1991) cultural dimensions (HCD), and Schwartz's (1992) theory of human values have laid the foundation for cross-cultural studies by enabling the meaningful comparison of values in different cultural groups. Specific to Chinese cultural values, Michael Bond and colleagues (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987) examined the validity of HCD and developed their Chinese Value Survey (CVS) containing 40 value items that are central to the Chinese way of life. The CVS marked an effort toward an "emic" understanding of Chinese culture; however, the intention of Bond's team

was not to analyze the fundamental characteristics of Chinese culture but to seek the culture-free dimensions of values and develop a universal values instrument. Consequently, the 40 Chinese value items were neither extensively discussed nor adequately validated within the Chinese communities. Furthermore, most of the CVS items are more pertinent to traditional than modern China. Even at the time of the original study (1987), some of the items, such as non-competitiveness, may have already lost relevance in the Chinese society.

Culture is dynamic and evolutionary in nature (Fang, 2012; Hofstede, 1991; Rokeach, 1973). The theory of cultural crossvergence (Ralston, 2008; Ralston, Gustafson, Cheung, & Terpstra, 1993; Ralston, Holt, Terpstra, & Yu, 1997) provides a theoretical foundation for examining the evolution of Chinese cultural values under the influence of globalization and China's economic and social transition. *Crossvergence* theory posits that cultures evolve in two broad directions: convergence, which sees some national cultural values become more similar to one another across different countries, and divergence, which perceives other national cultural values to be increasingly distinct and different across national borders. In most cases, researchers observe that people simultaneously adopt both traditional and modern cultural values, even though traditional values may be contradictory to modern values (e.g., Leung, Bhagat, Buchan, Erez, & Gibson, 2005). The crossvergence view of cultural evolution implies that the evolution of cultural change is more complicated and paradoxical and calls for alternative perspectives in values research (Fang, 2012; Faure & Fang, 2008).

Recognizing the evolution of cultural values, Fan (2000) proposed 31 Chinese cultural values in addition to the 40 Chinese value items listed in CVS. These 71 Chinese values items were further classified into eight categories, namely, national traits, interpersonal relationship, family (social) orientation, work attitude, business philosophy, personal traits, time orientation, and relationship with nature. Although the 71-item pool identified by Fan (2000) appears to be more inclusive and comprehensive than the CVS, the approach for Fan to identify the value items is chiefly based on critical literature review. Hence, the extent to which these value items can be applicable to the contemporary society in China is questionable. Fan's (2000) study included the 40 CVS items in an undifferentiated manner, despite the criticisms on CVS that some of its items (e.g., chastity) are already irrelevant to the modern Chinese society. Therefore, Fan's Chinese cultural value items need to be further verified and cannot be readily used to reflect the current state of values in China.

In the context of cross-cultural management studies, researchers have also attended to alternative paradigms in analyzing culture. Fang (2012) resorted to the indigenous Chinese philosophy of Yin Yang and proposed a new alternative perspective of culture. According to Fang (2012), potential paradoxical values coexist, reinforce, and complement one another in a culture, and

culture is holistic, dynamic, and dialectical in nature. Each culture is "a unique dynamic portfolio of self-selected globally available value orientations as a consequence of that culture's all-dimensional learning over time" (Fang, 2012, p. 25). Although Fang's conceptualization of culture and cultural values represents the much needed paradigm shift in cultural studies, which, more or less, is also reflected in crossvergence theory (Ralston, 2008; Ralston et al., 1993; Ralston et al., 1997), the Yin Yang perspective of Chinese cultural values studies remains mostly conceptual and requires empirical corroborations. Based on a paradigm shift advocated by Fang (2012) and adopting the lens of crossvergence theory, the current study addresses the limitations of both CVS and Fan's (2000) study to identify an array of relevant cultural values in the society of mainland China.

2.2 Traditional and modern value items

In general, cultural values that exist in contemporary China can be grouped into two types, namely, traditional and modern values. Although this classification might seem over-simplistic and arbitrary, Leung (2008) believed that the investigation of traditional (old) and modern (new) values and the interplay between them would serve as a valuable starting point for insights into Chinese idiosyncrasies. The cultural roots of Chinese traditions and values can be traced to several schools of thought, including Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism, with Confucianism being the most influential and widespread among them (Pun, Chin, & Lau, 2000). The major teachings of Confucius include a set of principles that guide behaviors in human relations and are essential in maintaining social order. Individual and family are heavily emphasized, as the former is considered a basic element of the society and the latter is the first institution where an individual learns to be a gentleman (*junzi* 君子). Nevertheless, the value of a group is well above that of an individual; therefore, any true gentleman should dedicate himself to his country (Zhou, 2003). In addition to Confucianism, Taoism and Buddhism as two religious traditions in China also shape the Chinese traditional culture. Taoism emphasizes the need to maintain a harmonious relationship with the *Tao* (道) (the Way, i.e., nature) and advocates *wu wei* (无为) ("do-nothing-ism"). By contrast, Buddhism preaches karma and the cause–effect relationship (Chen, 2001; Zhou, 2003).

China has been integrated into the world in various aspects under the influence of globalization and its continuing efforts in opening-up and modernization. In its social and economic transition, some modern values have emerged and gained society's wide acceptance. These values include individualism, materialism, and ostentation. Individualism is likely to be associated with a high level of economic development, and is possibly considered both an antecedent and a consequence of economic growth (Triandis, Bontempo, Villareal, Asai, & Lucca, 1988). The rise of individualism in China has been noted by some scholars (Lu, 1998; Wang & Lin, 2009; Yan, 2010). Together with individualism are some emerging consumer values, such as materialism

and ostentation (Leung, 2008). In addition to individualism and materialism, Faure and Fang (2008) have identified six more modern values that coexist with their traditional counterparts. These modern values include *professionalism*, *self-expression*, *and directness*; *respect for legal practices*; *respect for simplicity*; *creativity and competence*; *short-term orientation*; and *modern approaches*.

An array of economic, political, and technological factors are considered to contribute to the evolution of Chinese culture, particularly to the formation of modern Chinese values. Economic reform in China resulted in the recognition and appreciation of market economy principles, which promote competition, efficiency, and wealth (Yan, 2010; Yang & Stening, 2012). The privatization of labor and economy is believed to contribute to the transition of Chinese society into a more individualized one. On the political front, institutional changes in China, such as the privatization of housing and the marketization of education and medical care, have forced members of the society in China to increasingly engage in market competition and gradually adapt toward individualism rather than collectivism (Yan, 2010). Along the pathway of China's reform and opening-up, Chinese individuals began to develop a clearer sense of self with a set of rights and entitlement (Fang, 2012; Yan, 2010). Pursuit of self-identity and self-expression seems to have been reinforced by popular cultural TV programs (e.g., *Super Girls* contest); furthermore, such changes in rights awareness boost the incidence of "rightful resistance" even in rural villages. This trend of increasing self-expression, self-enterprising, and individualization are reinforced by the growing netizenship in China due to the rapid development of Internet technology and online forums.

Extended discussions of Chinese modern values are evident in advertising research, which tends to highlight certain values over others (Pollay, 1986). Despite the concern over commercial bias, studying cultural values in advertisements and general media is valuable because of the influences of mass media on the evolution of cultural values (Cheng, 1997; Wang & Lin, 2009). Lin (2001) has indicated that although the depiction of traditional cultural values remains in Chinese commercials, modern values such as modernity and youth are conspicuously promoted in commercials in China as much as in the United States. Chinese advertising has been vividly described as a "melting pot of cultural values" because it incorporates both traditional (Eastern) and modern (Western) values (Zhang & Shavitt, 2003, p. 24).

2.3. Cultural values and consumer/tourist behaviors

Some traditional values have been found to influence Chinese consumer behaviors (Du, Fan, & Feng, 2010; Hoare & Butcher, 2008; Lowe & Corkindale, 1998; Qian, Razzaque, & Keng, 2007). For example, Hoare and Butcher (2008) reported that the traditional Chinese values of "face" and "harmony" were positively related to customer satisfaction and loyalty. Modern values also

appear to be applicable in explaining consumer behaviors (Wang & Lin, 2009). Wang, Chen, Chan, and Zheng (2000) revealed that hedonistic values (e.g., pleasure seeking) overwhelm utilitarian values (e.g., quality and effectiveness) among Chinese youth in their influences on consumption motivations and preferences (e.g., novelty seeking, responsiveness to marketing stimuli, and preferences for foreign brands).

The effects of cultural values are particularly prominent in tourism and hospitality businesses that involve intensive interactions between customers and service delivery personnel (Lovelock, 1999). Mok and DeFranco (1999) reviewed the dominant Chinese cultural values considering the tourism context and identified six aspects of Chinese values that could influence the behaviors of Chinese tourists. These aspects include *respect for authority*, *interdependence*, *face*, *group orientation*, *harmony*, and *external attribution*. However, the hypotheses presented by Mok and DeFranco regarding the possible influence of these values on the tourism-related behaviors of Chinese consumers were not empirically tested. Mattila (1999) examined the influence of culture on the customer evaluation of luxury hotel services and determined that compared with Asians whose values tend to reflect duty in life, Western customers tend to rely on tangible cues from the physical environment and regard the hedonistic dimension of consumer experience as more important. Similarly, Fu et al. (2012) studied the evaluations of an island vacation experience by Chinese and U.S. tourists in the aspects of scenery, food, and social interaction, and revealed that the differences in their evaluation might be determined by their cultural dispositions. Moreover, Fu et al. indicated that Chinese tourists demonstrated more humanistic preferences; that is, they were more likely to visit man-made spots than natural landscapes and seemed to attach more importance to food and dining as a social function.

Kwek and Lee (2010) noted a paucity of research aimed at gaining an in-depth understanding of Chinese tourists' idiosyncrasies and their possible relationships with Chinese cultural values. Through participant observation with a group of corporate incentive tourists, Kwek and Lee reported that harmony as a Confucian value was an underlying theme that characterized these tourists' behaviors. In addition, these Chinese tourists' behaviors can be explained by traditional values, such as respect for authority, relationship (*guanxi*关系) building, and conformity. The growing role of China in international tourism undoubtedly warrants further investigation into these tourist behaviors from a cultural perspective (Kwek & Lee, 2010).

Despite sporadic studies attempting to examine the links between Chinese cultural values and tourist behaviors, the relationship between the two aspects remains intriguing but unclear. This study explores the possible links between contemporary Chinese cultural values and Chinese tourist behaviors in the outbound travel context.

3. Methodology

This study aimed to develop a comprehensive list of prevailing cultural values in modern China and to investigate the possible connections between cultural values and travel-related behaviors. A qualitative research approach was adopted in this study due to its exploratory nature; more specifically, focus group discussions were employed to freely elicit cultural value items in an interactive group environment and to obtain an in-depth understanding of what are valued and the reasons behind the adoption of these values (Kloosterman & Giebel, 2007; Litosseliti, 2003). The sample of the present study consisted of residents with a length of residency of more than 10 years in Beijing and Guangzhou. The reasons for selecting the two cities are twofold. First, Beijing and Guangzhou are both commonly recognized as first-tier cities in China; the relatively high economic development levels and advanced transportation system have made them important regional market centers for outbound tourism (China Tourism Academy, 2013). Second, Beijing, with its imperial legacy, is inarguably the cultural capital of China, whereas Guangzhou, with its unique regional cultural traditions, is also making bold plans to claim itself as a cultural capital (Chan, 2012). The two geographically distant cultural hubs are clearly both unique in some dimensions and, at the same time, representative of China's modern cities in general.

Four focus groups, two each in Beijing and Guangzhou, were organized as per the rule-of-thumb for general research questions (Kreuger & Casey, 2000; Nyamathi & Shuler, 1990). A professional research firm made cold calls to residents in these two cities by telephone (randomly selected fixed line numbers) and in person in business districts to invite their participation. Potential participants were screened based on the length of residency and their willingness and availability to participate in the focus group discussion. Demographic information (e.g., age, income, and gender) was gathered during the cold calls to ensure the representation of diverse backgrounds. Potential participants were informed of the focus group time and location, and received a reminder call the day before the discussion.

The topic of Chinese cultural values may be too abstract for ordinary residents to comment on; thus, relatively large groups with eight participants were deemed more appropriate because they ease participants' pressure to contribute and facilitate moderators to stimulate the discussions (David & Sutton, 2004). Focus group discussions work best with homogeneous groups (Litosseliti, 2003), and cultural differences may exist across different generations (Egri & Ralston, 2004); thus, participants who were born before and after the end of the Cultural Revolution (i.e., 1976) were deliberately separated into different groups. Table 1 shows that gender balance exists among the group participants. The numbers of participants in the age groups of 18–29, 30–39, 40–49, and 50 and over are similar. Of the 32 participants, 26 are married; 27 of them have a tertiary college or above education level. The participants hold jobs in a diverse range of occupations. Notably, five members of the older groups are retired, and four members of the younger groups are students. Group members in Beijing reported a higher

monthly family income than those in Guangzhou. Overall, the majority (28 out of 32) of the participants had a monthly family income between RMB 10,000 and RMB 29,999. Although travel experience was not a screening question, most of the participants had traveled outside of mainland China, Hong Kong, and Macao in the past three years.

Table 1 Here

Each focus group was moderated by two experienced professionals, and each discussion lasted for approximately two hours. All of the participants were presented with a small honorarium as a token of appreciation and a means of covering transportation costs. The participants were also informed of their rights to withdraw their participation at any time and that their input would remain anonymous. The discussions were semi-structured following a predesigned guide to help maintain focus. A brief ice-breaking session was held at the beginning of each focus group discussion, allowing participants to become familiarized with one another and setting the tone for the discussions. The topics covered could be divided into two sections, namely, (1) prevalent Chinese values related to different aspects of life, and (2) influence of the values on travel behaviors. The main questions asked were:

- Cultural values refer to the shared ideas about what is good, right, and desirable that guide the actions and evaluations of the people in a society. What do you think are the most important cultural values that are applicable in the modern Chinese society?
- Do any of the cultural values you just mentioned affect your travel-related behaviors? If yes, what are these cultural values and how do they influence your travel decisions and behaviors?

The first section also included six probing questions, and the second section included three. All of the focus group discussions were conducted in Chinese and voice recorded with the participants' consent. The recordings were later transcribed into Chinese text and analyzed along with field notes by two researchers whose native language is Chinese. The 135-page transcribed text data were read by two researchers and coded following the grounded theory procedure (Glaser & Strauss, 1967). Data analysis software NVivo 10.0 was used to assist in coding organization and management. Each coder performed the coding process independently by initially fragmenting the textual data into analyzable discrete units (e.g., words, phrases, and sentences) and subsequently indexing the units according to shared or differing meanings. After the completion of preliminary coding assignment, coding decisions were compared and discussions were held to resolve the discrepancies that emerged. This process was repeatedly performed to ensure the reliability of the data analysis results. Adjustments were made in each iteration to refine the code labels assigned to each unit. Based on the agreed coding framework, associations among codes were examined, and those that shared common properties were grouped into higher-level categories. In the final treelike structure, 40 cultural values were identified, and their connections with travel behaviors were identified.

4. Results

The prevalent cultural values identified in the focus group discussions and the links between the values and travel behaviors are shown in Table 2. Echoing the observations made by many scholars (Faure & Fang, 2008; Leung, 2008; Wang & Lin, 2009), both modern and traditional values were found in the current research. Based on the emergent themes, the results are arranged into three sections, namely, (1) values that relate to desired character traits; (2) values that are pertinent to life pursuits; and (3) values that concern the desired interpersonal relations and behaviors. Following Rokeach (1973), the present study termed the first two themes as "instrumental values" and "terminal values," respectively. The third theme was named "interpersonal values" by the authors. Rokeach (1973) classified human values into two distinctive categories, namely, terminal and instrumental. Terminal values refer to the beliefs of desirable end states of existence and human living such as freedom and happiness, whereas instrumental values refer to beliefs of desired human traits and characters such as being independent, ambitious, and honest, which are instrumental to achieving the desired end-states (Allen, Ng, & Wilson, 2002; MacIntosh & Spence, 2012). This classification provides meaningful interpretation of the nature of human values, and it has been widely adopted by researchers until today (e.g., Allen, Ng, & Wilson, 2002; MacIntosh & Spence, 2012; Schwartz & Bilsky, 1990). Meanwhile, the values system as prescribed in Confucianism centers around five dyadic relationships between father and son, older brother and younger brother, husband and wife, superior and subordinate, and between friends. Therefore, interpersonal relationships are commonly referred to when identifying Chinese cultural values (e.g., Fan, 2000). The application of an instrumental–terminal–relational classification of Chinese cultural values in the current study is consistent with crossvergence theory. Hence, the values identified in this study are reported below following this values classification system. In each section, the value items are further categorized into traditional and modern values.

Table 2 Here

4.1 Instrumental values

Instrumental values are defined as beliefs about preferred modes of behavior that are instrumental in realizing the desirable terminal states that an individual pursues. Instrumental values are often associated with personal characteristics or character traits, such as sincerity, obedience, and independence (Rokeach, 1973). The participants in the present study intensely discussed *honesty*, along with *courtesy and morality*. Many participants were worried that moral standards had deteriorated in modern China, and that distrust among people was prevalent. Nearly all of the participants expressed distrust toward merchants, which was triggered by a series of infamous food safety scandals in China in recent years. Examples of poor manners and misbehaviors mentioned include littering in public places, standing in the middle of a busy walkway, wasting food, rushing to grab a seat, and disrespecting traffic rules. The focus group participants agreed on the importance of complying with standard *moral rules* and behaving with *honesty* and *courtesy and morality.*

Most of the participants attached great importance to laws and regulations and believed that strict enforcement was necessary. In this regard, a modern value, *respect for legal practices*, emerged. Moreover, a few participants in the younger groups showed compassion for people who committed minor offenses for self-gain as a means of coping with pressures in the society (limited resources vs. a huge population). These participants acknowledged that people nowadays commonly pursue self-interest rather than common good, but they condemned those who are selfish and unconcerned about others' interests. Two values that stemmed from the Confucian value of "ren (忍)", namely, *kindness* and *being considerate of others*, were also frequently mentioned.

Several respondents agreed on the importance of developing *self-discipline*, maintaining that each individual should initially examine and mend his/her own faults before judging others. Although not explicitly included in CVS, *self-discipline* is implied because it is needed to maintain the other virtues (e.g., *morality*, *courtesy*), avoid aggressive behaviors, and thereby manage conflicts (Matthews, 2000). *Self-discipline* is also one of the communication rules guided by "ren" (Chen & Chung, 1994). Four other CVS values brought up in the discussions are *industry*, *moderation*, *complacency*, and *thrift*. *Industry*, along with *sense of obligation* and being *down-to-earth*, which are mainly about attitudes toward work and the roles individuals play in a group environment, were only raised by participants from Beijing. Although these values are all traditional, the focus groups revealed modern adjustments on some of the meanings. For example, the reasons for working hard and the sense of obligation were more personal and intrinsic than what the traditional doctrines educate people to do, that is, to devote themselves to the mother country (Zhou, 2003).

Participants from the older groups emphasized the importance of continuity and exhibited strong admiration for the rich cultural heritage in China. The value *respect for history* was captured by Yau (1988) with the term "time orientation", which covers both the idea of continuity and past-time orientation. Chinese have been known to take pride in the long history of their nation and believe in the importance of passing down the heritage to future generations. Cultural restoration was ardently advocated among older participants.

Two additional modern values, *competitiveness and competence* and *confidence*, emerged from the focus group discussions. In CVS, "non-competitiveness" was considered part of the Confucian ethos and could be explained by the Chinese cultural tradition of harmony and conflict avoidance. A common belief is that competitive behaviors should be avoided because they are likely to trigger confrontation and create discord; such a situation is disagreeable to the Chinese. However, this particular value has stirred significant controversy because many

scholars regard Chinese people as among the most competitive ethnic groups in the world (Matthews, 2000). Apparently in modern China, *competitiveness and competence* have become desirable personal qualities and key determinants of one's success, as explained by two participants:

> *"Nowadays, the society pays great attention to your competence; thus, you have to show that you are capable. Once you do, you will get more [resources/power]. The more you get, the better you will do in various aspects, hence your competitive advantage."* (BJ1-6)

> *"If you are competent, people will be able to tell… no matter how close you are with the teachers, they will see which one of us is more competent than the others."* (GZ2-3)

Confidence, as described by Yang et al. (1989, as cited in Hui, Wong, & Tjosvold, 2007), is one of the elements of Chinese modernity. This value was proposed by both groups of Beijing residents and believed to be necessary as the country continues to open up to the world:

> *"We have confidence in ourselves as we go outside [of our country] and welcome foreign visitors who come to us."* (BJ1-5)

> *"What we need to convey to the children is a positive attitude. I want you to be optimistic in your life. Do not complain to your parents whenever you hit a rough patch. No matter what happens, you should face it with a positive mentality."* (BJ2-3)

4.2 Terminal values

Terminal values delineate the ideal state of existence or life goals that one aims to achieve through modes specified by the instrumental values (Rokeach, 1973). In the Chinese tradition, personal achievement is subjugated to the work toward the betterment of the social group (Hsu, 1981). Correspondingly, very few values in CVS are pertinent to the pursuit and intended outcomes of life at an individual level, with the exceptions of "wealth" and "knowledge". Two CVS values, "having few desires" and "keeping oneself disinterested and pure", actually instruct people not to be concerned with terminal values.

Although Confucianism approves of accumulating wealth as long as the means are appropriate, the "worship of money" is a relatively recent phenomenon in China and is often associated with Western capitalism (Ong & Nonini, 2003). In the words of two participants, the blunt appreciation and pursuit of *fame and fortune* (in Chinese: *ming li* 名利) is after all "an inevitable consequence (BJ2-7)" in the current "world of commodities (BJ1-7)". Furthermore, the emphasis on *fame and fortune* has revealed important implications on consumption attitudes, work behaviors, and human relations, as demonstrated by the following observations:

> *"…because children know about everything. Even kindergarten kids talk about cars owned by different families. They are under a lot of pressure at school."* (BJ2-6)

"Everybody is money-oriented... I will work harder if you pay me more." (GZ1-8)

"You cannot trust or be best friends with your colleagues… You are competitors in the workplace, so there are bound to be conflicts." (GZ2-3)

Many participants opined that *ostentation*, which is a byproduct of economic development and increased disposable income, has become a serious problem in modern China. People are faced with societal pressure to keep up with the Joneses in terms of material possessions, resources they can provide to their children, and the quality of life that they can afford in general. *Self-interest*, which includes but goes beyond money, is the new principle that guides people's decisions in the workplace and other social circumstances. Colleagues, friends, or relatives cannot be immune to calculating their own interests. Nevertheless, the participants were not completely negative toward modern values. Instead, they were agreeable to a high *quality of life*. The younger generation, in particular, displayed admiration for the advanced technologies and ideas invented in *foreign cultures* (i.e., economically developed countries).

Thrift was mentioned as an instrumental value. However, China is no longer a nation with all savers and no spenders. *Live in the moment* or "seize the day" was the attitude toward life promoted in all four groups. The participants believed in seeking pleasure and *carpe diem*. This mindset can perhaps be partly attributed to the feeling of insecurity reported by many participants in their comments such as, "it may seem perfect at this moment, but it may not the next (GZ2-6)". The participants mentioned a number of factors that could cause life volatility, including high divorce rate, disturbing food safety issues, and tragic traffic accidents. Consequently, significant effort was exerted to establish a sense of *stability and security* in life, and growing attention was given to *health*. Although "personal steadiness and stability" was included in CVS, which referred to the quality of being prudent and taking a long-term view in making decisions (Fang 2003), the value *stability and security* derived from the focus group discussions put more emphasis on the physical living conditions than on the mental composure and capability. Meanwhile, *health* has always been one of the central topics in Chinese traditions (Chen, 2001).

To *live in the moment*, even though *thrift* was still upheld by many participants as one of the instrumental values, "the Chinese are getting increasingly open-minded [with money and consumption] (BJ1-7)". The participants expressed willingness to *indulge* themselves as long as their budget permitted; nevertheless, the manner of allocating the budget differed individually:

"If I have extra money left after setting aside an amount for my family and daily expenditures, I will consider spending it on myself, for travel or other things…" (BJ1-4)

"I'm not going to spend the money I haven't earned, but I will spend all that I have." (BJ2-6)

"[I use credit cards]. I will just slowly pay off the balance." (GZ2-8)

Although hard work may be required to secure the material means for *indulgence* and *quality of life*, it is not appreciated by many participants because they prefer an *easy and comfortable* life with an emphasis on *leisure*. The reluctance toward hard work is evident in the following statements:

> *"Most people are not down-to-earth... We want to maximize our gains, but at the same time we want to minimize our inputs such as time and effort."* (BJ2-6)
>
> *"I want to work for a company where a humanized management approach is adopted, a place that offers a competitive pay package, with more leave days."* (GZ2-6)
>
> *"It's a paradoxical situation. For me, personally I want a life that's easy and comfortable. You know, just let it be… but then I also want more…"* (BJ1-3)

Specifically, young people may strive for an *easy and comfortable* life; they have been criticized for being lazy and living off of their parents. "Boomerang children", a new term for individuals exemplifying such a behavior, has been popularized in China. The balance between work and leisure has apparently become an important consideration in career choice. In terms of consumption, *convenience*, which is a feature incorporated in many TV commercials aired in China (Cheng, 1997), is highly valued nowadays. Online shopping, electronic payment, and home delivery are the new forms of business services preferred by many people.

Knowledge and education, a traditionally valued achievement for the Chinese, remained an ambition for the majority of participants. *Knowledge* and *horizon broadening* could also be used to achieve another goal—*fame and fortune*. Chinese parents are very concerned with their children's academic achievement because they believe that knowledge leads to wealth, respect, and high social status (Lin & Fu, 1990). The focus group participants with children confirmed this concern and explained that they would provide their children with the best education possible.

Much of the discussion surrounding material gains, *indulgence*, and maximizing *self-interest* signified a trend toward utilitarian individualism (Lu, 1998). Furthermore, Beijing residents in the younger group supported an all-embracing *liberation*, covering the ideas of individualization, self-expression, and self-reliance. By contrast, Guangzhou residents in the older group recognized a taste for *fashion* among Chinese consumers, many of whom are trend chasers. The following quotes typically illustrate these beliefs:

> *"Of course you have to be considerate of others, but staying true to yourself is also important."* (BJ2-1)
>
> *"At work, you should fight for yourself instead of putting up with situations that make you uncomfortable."* (BJ2-5)

"Basically we are all doing okay financially, so the real motive behind the effort is self-actualization." (BJ2-6)

4.3 Interpersonal values

China has been regarded as a collectivistic society in which group goals are placed above individual goals, and individuals take pride in their groups and value in-group cohesiveness (Jiang, Chen, & Liu, 2010; Lu, 1998). The focus group discussions have identified eight values that guide interpersonal relationships and interactions in the modern Chinese society. These values are mostly traditional Chinese values deeply rooted in the Chinese culture.

Despite the growing attention to individual achievements, *collectivism* is still valid in regulating the interpersonal behaviors of people. The Confucian concept of *harmony*, as commented by one participant, was highlighted at the 2008 Beijing Olympics and revitalized thereafter (Leibold, 2010). As stated in the quotes below, *harmony* must be sustained at the society, organization, and family levels:

"[We hope for an overall social atmosphere] that is positive and healthy. Social disharmony may occur from time to time as a result of the improper handling by the government or people in charge." (BJ1-2)

"If you have a harmonious family, [meaning] your kids are doing well at school and your family members such as your wife support you, you can fully focus on your work." (BJ1-5)

Conformity plays a crucial role in creating such a harmonious social environment. To blend in and get along with other group members, sometimes an individual needs to *compromise*. Members of Chinese communities are expected to observe trends and follow suit to be considered team players and to build a sense of *harmony*.

Family and kinship was frequently discussed with a modern twist. In contrast to the conventional explanation of a collectivistic culture (Jiang et al., 2010), "Chinese households are now predominated by three-person families (BJ2-7)". The virtue of *xiao* (*孝*), denoting the respect for one's parents and seniors, was documented in the Classic of Filial Piety (*Xiao Jing孝经*) written by Confucian scholars, and was subsequently emphasized in the statement "filial piety is the most important of all virtues (*bai shan xiao wei xian百善孝为先*)", of which "every participant is aware of (BJ1-4)." Although *filial piety* was agreed to be one of the most influential values for Chinese people, one participant noted that nowadays "Chinese people care for the next generation much more than they do for the seniors" (BJ1-4). After getting married and having children, the center of people's lives seems to shift toward children. Comments that convey *devotion to children* include:

"I see him as an extension of my life. He is my everything." (BJ2-7)

"I want to give my child the best of everything. For example, if you see what the other parents have done for their children, then you will do everything you can to give yours the same." (GZ2-3)

Two Guangzhou residents shared their views on the generation gap between them and their parents, stating that opinion clashes on issues such as child rearing practices often occurred. Three other Guangzhou residents in the older group pointed out that young people today do not value family connections, blaming the influences of smart phones and the self-centered pursuits of the youth.

Competitiveness and *self-interest* hinder the development of genuine *friendships*. Nevertheless, a few participants expressed their goal of meeting new friends and bonding with them:

"I hang out with my friends more often than with my cousins." (GZ1-4)

"At the current stage, my focus is to develop interpersonal relationships, like those with friends. I want to have more friends and hopefully some romantic relationship as well." (GZ2-7)

4.4 Implications for tourism

Some of the instrumental values were found to influence participants' travel behaviors. Most prominently, historic sites and museums were mentioned by all four groups as must-visit places when they travel. Most of the participants were enthusiastic about seeing different forms of architecture and learning about the history from visiting these attractions, reflecting an appreciation of *respect for history*. Additionally, *thrift* seemed to be of great concern to them. Most people would carefully assess the monetary value of different options and select the ones that represent the best deal in choosing destinations, travel modes, and places for shopping. Moreover, with the recent exposure of many dishonest product or service providers and the prevalent distrust of merchants, travel agencies are no longer considered a reliable source of travel information because they are frequently caught in defrauding business cases. Consequently, most participants, particularly those from the older groups, heavily rely on word-of-mouth for travel recommendations.

Compared with instrumental values, terminal values appear to exhibit a considerably wider range of influences on travel motivations, destination choices, travel mode preferences, and post-travel behaviors. In line with Hsu and Huang's (2012) discovery using a Chinese sample, the participants mentioned three travel motivations, namely, relaxation, knowledge, and novelty, which correlated with the need for *leisure*, *knowledge and education*, and *horizon broadening*, respectively. Based on these motivations, destinations that provide opportunities for education or novelty (e.g., representing a different culture) or relaxation (e.g., boasting beautiful natural

sceneries) were the most popular among the participants. Specifically, the participants would be attracted to places with unique local cuisines and lifestyles, or those with soothing sceneries such as beaches and coasts; this finding concurred with that of Chow and Murphy (2008) in their research on Chinese outbound travelers. *Liberation* and *security* could also affect destination choices. For instance, two participants preferred to visit democratic societies and experience the social systems there. Three other participants would research on safety issues before making the decision. According to Kim, Guo, and Agrusa (2005), "safety" and "beautiful scenery" were the two most important destination attributes for Chinese outbound leisure travelers.

Similarly, the choices of travel mode seemed to be determined by a combination of factors, including *convenience*, *knowledge and education*, *safety*, *leisure*, and *liberation*. Most of the older participants and those who normally travel with children placed more emphasis on the first three factors, and therefore would choose an all-inclusive package tour. Package tours can also allow participants to meet new people and exchange ideas. The participants felt safer in a package tour because the potential conflict of interest with stranger group members can be minimal. Other participants, particularly those with more travel experience, would opt for independent travel for more freedom. A hybrid mode combining booking assistance and the freedom of setting personalized itineraries was preferred by these participants. Many participants would prefer to share their travel experience on social media to impress people or brag to their friends about the places they visited and the food they enjoyed partly because of *ostentation*. The willingness to spend and *indulge* oneself served as a prerequisite to travel.

In terms of interpersonal values, *conformity* and *family orientation* were more relevant in influencing travel preferences. The participants expressed enthusiasm in visiting famous heritage and city sites. Further probing revealed that this preference might be related to *conformity*:

> *"When you come back from Malaysia, people are going to ask you 'did you go to XX'. So if you didn't go to those attractions, you will feel quite regretful."* (BJ1-6)
>
> *"… because it's famous. It's where most people go. Your travel experience is not complete without visiting that attraction."* (GZ1-7)
>
> *"I want to visit those attractions because all other tourists will."* (GZ2-7)

Family members, particularly the children, have a significant influence on travel decision making. Participants mentioned that the motivation for visiting certain destinations (e.g., Austria for its music, and Antarctica for its research stations) was to broaden the horizon and knowledge base for children. Shopping for souvenirs and specialties is mostly for sharing with family members.

5. Discussion and conclusion

This study provides a snapshot of the configuration of cultural values currently prevalent in China. Cultural values in contemporary China are subjected to the effects of both global and local forces as China undergoes rapid transformations in its social and economic systems (Faure & Fang, 2008; Yan, 2010). Thus, Chinese cultural values continuously evolve and adapt. Previous studies have identified useful value items to understand Chinese culture (e.g., Chinese Cultural Connection, 1987; Fan, 2000); however, with the rapid change in China's values landscape, the existing measurement does not seem to have the content validity required to capture all of the current cultural values. Hence, this study aimed to examine the prevailing cultural values in China nowadays. It also explored the links between Chinese cultural values and people's travel behaviors.

By employing focus group interviews, this study identified 40 Chinese cultural value items. Aligning with the key literature, the study classified these items into three categories, namely, instrumental, terminal, and interpersonal values. Table 2 shows that only 20 of the 40 items identified had similar items in the CVS (Chinese Cultural Connection, 1987) and Fan's (2000) extended list of Chinese value items. Hence, half of the value items identified in the current study, which are mostly terminal values, either have only emerged recently from society in China or have not been captured by previous Chinese values studies. Most of the modern values identified are not unique to China because of the influence of globalization, mass media, and social media.

Although modern values were identified for both instrumental and terminal value categories, all of the items in the interpersonal value category represent traditional values that are well-documented in the literature. This observation indicates that the values that regulate social relationships among members of the Chinese society are still mostly from the traditional domain. The three modern instrumental values (i.e., *confidence, competitiveness and competence*, and *respect for legal practices*) could be derived from the market economy values and principles (Yan, 2010; Yang & Stening, 2012). These desirable personal traits seem to be consistent with some traditional values, such as *industry (working hard)*, but contradictory to others (e.g., *moderation*), as identified by the current study and those from previous studies (e.g., *non-competitiveness* in CVS and *governing by leaders instead of by law* in Fan [2000]). This outcome may suggest a transition of attitude toward authorities in China. In China's political discourse, an acknowledged view is that the traditional model of governance by man should give way to the model of governance by law. Among the populace, the pervasive corruption problems may be greatly attributed to the traditional model of governance by man (Li, 2008). As such, people in China may have denounced the traditional value of *governing by leaders instead of by law*.

Notably, more modern values were identified in the terminal value category concerning desirable

life states than in the instrumental value category pertaining to individual traits. Among the 16 terminal value items, 12 are contemporary values that emerged from the modern Chinese society. Most of the modern terminal cultural values identified in this study are consistent with the capitalist values (Yang & Stening, 2012), particularly those identified with consumerism and materialism (Belk, 1985). For example, *live in the moment* presents a short-term view of life in contrast to the long-term orientation as identified in the Confucian values system (Hofstete, 1991). Other modern value items, such as *fame and fortune*, *easy and comfortable, fashion*, and *indulgence*, represent life states that substantially deviate from the traditional way of Chinese life. These items suggest the life pursuits of Chinese people are becoming less collectivistic and more individualistic. Yan (2010) noted that the Chinese society has treaded a path toward individualization since the 1970s. This individualization process appears to be continuing. The Chinese seem to have integrated some foreign values, such as *fashion* and *indulgence*, in their modern values system. Understandably, with economic development and increased wealth, *quality of life*, together with the increasing pursuit of *leisure* and *liberation*, are also developed in the Chinese values system.

Ostentation has been identified as a significant cultural phenomenon in modern China and acknowledged as a new social and cultural phenomenon. Several news articles (e.g., Australian Centre on China in the World, n.d.) confirmed the prevalence of *ostentation* in the Chinese society. Various socio-psychological explanations on ostentation could be identified, including Chinese people's "face" concerns, increasing societal competition, growing materialism, and lack of social and spiritual security among society members (Li, Zhang, & Sun, 2015).

From a theoretical perspective, this study confirmed both the traditional/modern dichotomy of Chinese values studies (Chang, Wong, & Koh, 2003) and the paradoxical view on Chinese values (Faure & Fang, 2008). The present study further established that Chinese cultural values are evolving rapidly toward individualization and materialism (Yan, 2010). Considering the modern Chinese values system as dynamic and adaptive to both global and local changes is crucial. In China's turbulent history of being ruled by numerous ethnic groups under different dynasties, the culture encountered many crossroads for its development and evolution. Some core cultural values prevailed, whereas others were modified through an adaptive learning process, which continued today.

This study also attempted to explore the links between Chinese cultural values and travel behaviors, as presented in Table 2. These links are mostly established on the basis of travel motivations (e.g., novelty, relaxation, and knowledge), travel mode, and destination choice. The association between values and travel behaviors is relatively complex. Thus, one-to-one connections between specific value items and travel behaviors are less likely to be identified.

The limited number of links revealed in the data also suggested the difficulty of establishing the connection between cultural values and travel behaviors by the research subjects under an unaided, open-ended discussion.

In terms of the limitations of this study, the data were collected from two mega-cities in China. Thus, the results may be biased toward Chinese residents living in large cities and cannot be generalized to the entire Chinese population. Although these two cities could represent the different subcultures of China, future studies may include other first-tier cities, such as Shanghai, and other less developed cities or rural areas to be more inclusive. With a qualitative research design, this study cannot verify the possible associations and relationships among the identified Chinese values and the value-travel behaviors. The qualitative approach in this study also involves researcher subjectivity in the data analysis and interpretation. Thus, the findings are not free from researcher bias. However, the author team shares a thorough understanding of Chinese culture and the modern Chinese society. The knowledge of Chinese culture, values, Chinese society, and tourist behaviors possessed by the authors should warrant a quality research process for the validity of the findings.

The Chinese value items identified in this study can serve as a valuable pool for further scale development in measuring contemporary Chinese values and future studies seeking cultural explanations of Chinese tourist behaviors. Future studies could adopt the 40 value items identified in this study to develop a scale for measuring contemporary Chinese cultural values. Further theoretical explorations could be conducted to evaluate the Chinese values model and structure (instrumental–terminal–relational vs. modern–traditional) proposed in this study, and contribute to a better informed theory of Chinese cultural values. By applying a quantitative design, future research could further examine and verify the links between Chinese cultural values and travel behaviors via questionnaire survey data and conjoint analysis.

References

Allen, M.W., Ng, S.H., & Wilson, M. (2002). A functional approach to instrumental and terminal values and the value-attitude-behaviour system of consumer choice. *European Journal of Marketing, 36*(1/2), 111-135.

Australian Centre on China in the World (n.d). *China's luxury fever and curbing official ostentation.* Retrieved on April 29, 2015, from https://www.thechinastory.org/key-article/chinas-luxury-fever-and-official-ostentation/

Belk, R.W. (1985). Materialism: Trait aspects of living in the material world. *Journal of Consumer Research, 12*(3), 265-280.

Bond, M.H. (Ed.). (1996). *The handbook of Chinese psychology*. London: Oxford University Press.

Chan, T. (2012, June). *Guangzhou aims to be China's culture capital by restoring its past glory*. Retrieved on 9 November, 2015, from http://macaomagazine.net/china/turning-back-clock

Chan, K., & Cheng, H. (2002). One Country, Two Systems: Cultural values reflected in Chinese and Hong Kong television commercials. *International Communication Gazette, 64*(4), 385-400.

Chang, W.C., Wong, W.K., & Koh, J.B.K. (2003). Chinese values in Singapore: Traditional and modern. *Asian Journal of Social Psychology, 6*(1), 5-29.

Chen, Y.C. (2001). Chinese values, health and nursing. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 36*(2), 270-273.

Chen, G.M., & Chung, J. (1994). The impact of Confucianism on organizational communication. *Communication Quarterly, 42*(2), 93-105.

Cheng, H. (1997). Toward an understanding of cultural values manifest in advertising: A content analysis of Chinese television commercials in 1990 and 1995. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly, 74*(4), 773-796.

China Tourism Academy. (2013). *Annual report of China outbound tourism development 2013*. Beijing: Beijing Tourism Education Press.

Chinese Culture Connection. (1987). Chinese values and the search for culture-free dimensions of culture. *Journal of Cross-cultural Psychology, 18*(2), 143-164.

Chow, I., & Murphy, P. (2008). Travel activity preferences of Chinese outbound tourists for overseas destinations. *Journal of Hospitality & Leisure Marketing, 16*(1-2), 61-80.

David, M., & Sutton, C.D. (2004). *Social research: The basics*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

De Mooij, M.K. (2010). *Consumer behavior and culture: Consequences for global marketing and advertising*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Du, J., Fan, X., & Feng, T. (2010). An experimental investigation of the role of face in service failure and recovery encounters. *Journal of Consumer Marketing, 27*(7), 584-593.

Egri, C.P., & Ralston, D.A. (2004). Generation cohorts and personal values: A comparison of China and the United States. *Organization Science, 15*(2), 210-220.

Fan, Y. (2000). A classification of Chinese culture. *Cross Cultural Management: An International Journal, 7*(2), 3-10.

Fang, T. (2003). A critique of Hofstede's fifth national culture dimension. International *Journal of Cross Cultural Management, 3*(3), 347-368.

Fang, T. (2012). Yin Yang: A new perspective on culture. *Management and Organization Review, 8*(1), 25-50.

Faure, G.O., & Fang, T. (2008). Changing Chinese values: Keeping up with paradoxes. *International Business Review, 17*(2), 194-207.

Fu, X., Lehto, X.Y., & Cai, L.A. (2012). Culture-based interpretation of vacation consumption. *Journal of China Tourism Research, 8*(3), 320-333.

Geertz, C. (2000). *The interpretation of cultures: Selected essays*. New York: Basic Books.

Glaser, B.G., & Strauss, A.L. (1967). *The discovery of grounded theory: Strategies for qualitative research*. Piscataway, NJ: Transaction Publishers.

Goodenough, W.H. (1971). *Culture, language, and society*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley Modular Publications.

Hoare, R.J., & Butcher, K. (2008). Do Chinese cultural values affect customer satisfaction/loyalty? *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management, 20*(2), 156-171.

Hofstede, G.H. (1980). *Culture's consequences: International differences in work-related values*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
Hofstede, G.H. (1991). *Cultures and organizations: Software of the mind*. London: McGraw-Hill.
Hsu, C.H.C., & Huang, S. (2012). An extension of the TPB model for tourists. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Research, 36*(3), 390-417
Hsu, F.L.K. (1981). *American and Chinese: Passage to differences*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.
Hui, C., Wong, A., & Tjosvold, D. (2007). Turnover intention and performance in China: The role of positive affectivity, Chinese values, perceived organizational support and constructive controversy. *Journal of Occupational and Organizational Psychology, 80*(4), 735-751.
Jennings, G.R. (2009). Methodologies and methods. In T. Jamal & M. Robinson (Eds.), *The SAGE handbook of tourism studies*. London: Sage.
Jiang, L., Chen, Q., & Liu, Y. (2010). FDI and the change of the Chinese culture. *International Journal of Social Economics, 37*(2), 101-118.
Kim, S.S., Guo, Y., & Agrusa, J. (2005). Preference and positioning analyses of overseas destinations by mainland Chinese outbound pleasure tourists. *Journal of Travel Research, 44*(2), 212-220.
Kloosterman, P., & Giebel, K. (2007). *T-kit on educational evaluation in youth work: Tasting the soup*. Strasbourg Cedex: Council of Europe.
Kroeber, A.L., & Parsons, T. (1958). The concepts of culture and of social system. *American Sociological Review, 23*(5), 582-583.
Krueger, R.A., & Casey, M.A. (2000). *Focus groups: A practical guide for applied research* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
Kwek, A., & Lee, Y.S. (2010). Chinese tourists and Confucianism. *Asia Pacific Journal of Tourism Research, 15*(2), 129-141.
Leibold, J. (2010). The Beijing Olympics and China's conflicted national form. *The China Journal, 63*, 1-24.
Leung, K. (2008). Chinese culture, modernization, and international business. *International Business Review, 17*(2), 184-187.
Leung, K., Bhagat, R.S., Buchan, N.r., Erez, M., & Gibson, C.B. (2005). Culture and international business: Recent advances and their implications for future research. *Journal of International Business Studies, 36*(4), 357-378.
Lewis, M.W. (2000). Exploring paradox: Toward a more comprehensive guide. *Academy of Management Review, 25*(4), 760-776.
Li, J, Zhang, X.-A. & Sun, G. (2015). Effects of "face" consciousness on status consumption among Chinese consumers: Perceived social value as a mediator. *Psychological Report, 116* (1), 280-291.
Li, S. (2008). Thirty years of China reform: Transformation from "rule by men" to "rule by law". *China Reform, 2008*(3), 20-25.
Lin, C.A. (2001). Cultural values reflected in Chinese and American television advertising. *Journal of Advertising, 30*(4), 83-94.
Lin, C.Y.C., & Fu, V.R. (1990). A comparison of child-rearing practices among Chinese, immigrant Chinese, and Caucasian-American parents. *Child Development, 61*(2), 429-433.
Litosseliti, L. (2003). *Using focus groups in research*. London: Bloomsbury Publishing.

Lovelock, C.H. (1999). Developing marketing strategies for transnational service operations. *Journal of Services Marketing, 13*(4/5), 278-295.
Lowe, A.C.T., & Corkindale, D.R. (1998). Differences in "cultural values" and their effects on responses to marketing stimuli: A cross-cultural study between Australians and Chinese from the People's Republic of China. *European Journal of Marketing, 32*(9/10), 843-867.
Lu, X. (1998). An interface between individualistic and collectivistic orientations in Chinese cultural values and social relations. *Howard Journal of Communication, 9*(2), 91-107.
MacIntosh, E., & Spence, K. (2012). An exploration of stakeholder values: in search of common ground within an international sport and development initiative. *Sport Management Review, 15,* 404-415.
Matthews, B.M. (2000). The Chinese Value Survey: An interpretation of value scales and consideration of some preliminary results. *International Education Journal, 1*(2), 117-126.
Mattila, A.S. (1999). The role of culture in the service evaluation process. *Journal of Service Research, 1*(3), 250-261.
Mok, C., & DeFranco, A.L. (1999). Chinese cultural values: their implications for travel and tourism marketing. *Journal of Travel and Tourism Marketing, 8*(2), 99-114.
Nyamathi, A., & Shuler, P. (1990). Focus group interview: A research technique for informed nursing practice. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 15*(11), 1281-1288.
Ong, A., & Nonini, D. (2003). *Ungrounded empires: The cultural politics of modern Chinese transnationalism*. London: Routledge.
Pan, Y. (2009). The influence of Chinese traditional values and customer perceived values on Chinese consumer behavior. *Journal of Shanghai Jiaotong Univeristy (Philosophy and Social Sciences), 17*(3), 53-61.
Pizam, A., Jansen-Verbeke, M., & Steel, L. (1997). Are all tourists alike, regardless of nationality? The perceptions of Dutch tour-guides. *Journal of International Hospitality, Leisure & Tourism Management 1*(1), 19-38.
Pollay, R.W. (1986). The distorted mirror: Reflections on the unintended consequences of advertising. *Journal of Marketing, 50*(2), 18-36.
Pun, K.F., Chin, K.S., & Lau, H. (2000). A review of the Chinese cultural influences on Chinese enterprise management. *International Journal of Management Reviews, 2*(4), 325-338.
Qian, W., Razzaque, M.A., & Keng, K.A. (2007). Chinese cultural values and gift-giving behavior. *Journal of Consumer Marketing, 24*(4), 214-228.
Quek, K.M.T., & Storm, C.L. (2012). Chinese values in supervisory discourse: Implications for culturally sensitive practices. *Contemporary Family Therapy, 34*(1), 44-56.
Ralston, D.A. (2008). The crossvergence perspective: Reelections and projections. *Journal of International Business Studies, 39*(1), 27-40.
Ralston, D.A., Gustafson, D.J., Cheung, F.M., & Terpstra, R.H. (1993). Difference in managerial values: A study of U.S., Hong Kong and PRC managers. *Journal of International Business Studies, 24*(2), 249-275.
Ralston, D.A., Holt, D.H., Terpstra, R.H., & Yu, K.C. (1997). The impact of national culture and economic ideology on managerial work values: A study of the United States, Russia, Japan, and China. *Journal of International Business Studies, 28*(1), 177-207.
Rokeach, M. (1973). *The nature of human values*. New York: Free Press.
Schwartz, S.H. (1992). Universals in the content and structure of values: Theoretical advances and empirical tests in 20 countries. In M. Zanna (Ed.), *Advances in experimental social psychology* (Vol. 25, pp.1-65). New York: Academic Press.

Schwartz, S.H. (1994). Cultural dimensions of values: Towards an understanding of national differences. In U. Kim, H.C. Trandis, C. Kagiticibasi, S.C. Choi, & G. Yoon (Eds.), *Individualism and collectivism: Theory, method and application* (pp. 84–110). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Schwartz, S.H., & Bilsky, W. (1990). Toward a theory of the universal content and structure of values: Extensions and cross-cultural replications. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 58*(5), 878.

Triandis, H.C., Bontempo, R., Villareal, M.J., Asai, M., & Lucca, N. (1988). Individualism and collectivism: Cross-cultural perspectives on self-ingroup relationships. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 54*(2), 323-338.

Wang, C.L., Chen, Z.X., Chan, A.K., & Zheng, Z.C. (2000). The influence of hedonic values on consumer behaviors: An empirical investigation in China. *Journal of Global Marketing, 14*(1-2), 169-186.

Wang, C.L., & Lin, X. (2009). Migration of Chinese consumption values: Traditions, modernization, and cultural renaissance. *Journal of Business Ethics, 88*(3), 399-409.

Willis, M. (2009). Tradition versus change: Evaluating the currency of some traditional Chinese values in today's business environment. *Journal of Global Marketing, 22*(1), 67-89.

Winter, T. (2009). Asian tourism and the retreat of Anglo-western centrism in tourism theory. *Current Issues in Tourism, 12*(1), 21-31.

Yan, Y. (2010). The Chinese path to individualization. *The British Journal of Sociology, 61*(3), 489-512.

Yang, S., & Stening, B.W. (2012). Mao meets the market. *Management International Review, 53*(3), 419-448.

Yau, O.H. (1988). Chinese cultural values: Their dimensions and marketing implications. *European Journal of Marketing, 22*(5), 44-57.

Zhang, Y.B., & Harwood, J. (2004). Modernization and tradition in an age of globalization: Cultural values in Chinese television commercials. *Journal of Communication, 54*(1), 156-172.

Zhang, J., & Shavitt, S. (2003). Cultural values in advertisements to the Chinese X-Generation: Promoting modernity and individualism. *Journal of Advertising, 32*(1), 23-33.

Zhang, X. (2012). Consciousness of social face and conspicuous consumption of luxury products in the Chinese society. *Journal of Marketing Science, 8*(1), 76-94.

Zhou, J. (2003). *Remaking China's public philosophy for the twenty-first century*. Westport, Conn: Praeger.

Table 1. Profile of Focus Group Participants

Characteristics	Beijing			Guangzhou			
	Group 1 (older)	Group 2 (younger)	Subtotal	Group 1 (older)	Group 2 (younger)	Subtotal	Total
Gender							
Male	4	4	8	4	4	8	16
Female	4	4	8	4	4	8	16
Age							
18–29 years		5	5		4	4	9
30–39 years		3	3		4	4	7
40–49 years	4		4	4		4	8
50–59 years	2		2	2		2	4
≥ 60 years	2		2	2		2	4
Marital Status							
Unmarried		3	3		3	3	6
Married	8	5	13	8	5	13	26
Education							
High school	1		1	4		4	5
2/3-year college	5	1	6	3	2	5	11
4-year university	2	5	7	1	6	7	14
Postgraduate or above		2	2				2
Occupation							
Transportation	1		1				1
Water supply/Energy	1		1	1		1	2
Engineering	1	1	2	1		1	3
Interior design	1		1				1
Finance/Accounting	1	1	2	1		1	3
Communication		1	1		1	1	2
Construction		1	1				1
Civil service		1	1				1
Fashion/Jewelry				1	1	2	2
Wine					1	1	1
Logistics					1	1	1
Trading					1	1	1
Technology/Electronics		1	1		1	1	2
Housewife				1		1	1
Student		2	2		2	2	4
Self-employed				1		1	1
Retired	3		3	2		2	5
Monthly family income (in RMB)							
10,000–19,999	3	2	5	5	3	8	13
20,000–29,999	3	4	7	3	5	8	15
30,000–39,999		2	2				2
≥ 40,000	2		2				2
Traveled outside of mainland, Hong Kong, and Macao in the past 3 years							

Yes	8	8	8	5	4	9	17
No	0	0	0	3	4	7	7

Table 2. Chinese Cultural Values Derived from Focus Groups

#	Cultural Value	Literature Support	Meaning	Travel Behaviors
	Instrumental Values: Desired Character Traits			
1	Confidence 乐观自信	Assertiveness 自信 (Yang et al., 1989, as cited in Hui et al., 2007)	Be positive and confident	
2	Competitiveness and competence 具竞争力	Competition 竞争 (Cheng, 1997)	Have a competitive edge in one's work	
3	Respect for legal practices 遵纪守法	Respect for legal practices 遵重法律规定 (Faure & Fang, 2008)	Believe in the necessity of abiding by laws and regulations	
4	Being considerate of others 为他人着想	Other-centeredness/focused/orientation 注重其它 (Quek & Storm, 2012; Zhang & Shavitt, 2003)	Put oneself into others' shoes	
5	Complacency 安于现状	Contentedness with one's position in life 安分知足 (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987; Fan, 2000)	Be satisfied with one's position in life	
6	Courtesy and morality 道德修养	Courtesy 有礼貌/ 彬彬有礼(Chinese Culture Connection, 1987)	Exhibit good manners, comply with regulations, and conform with local customs	⇒Uncivilized travel behaviors
7	Down-to-earth 务实	Pragmatic/to suit a situation 务实 (Fan, 2000)	Not caught up in superficial things	
8	Honesty 诚信	Trustworthiness 诚信/ 信用(Chinese Culture Connection, 1987)	Conduct business with integrity and keep one's words	⇒Travel info source – trust word-of-mouth (WOM) but not travel agencies
9	Industry (working hard) 勤奋、拼搏	Industry (working hard) 勤劳/勤奋 (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987)	Work hard to achieve one's goals	

10	Kindness 友善	Kindness (forgiveness, compassion) 仁爱（恕、人情）/友善(Chinese Culture Connection, 1987)	Be kind to others and lend a helping hand to those in need	
11	Moderation 适可而止	Moderation 中庸之道 (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987; Willis, 2009)	Not have excessive desires	
12	Planning 规划	Taking a long range view/long-term orientation 从长计议 (Fan, 2000; Faure & Fang, 2008)	Make plans for one's personal development	
13	Respect for history 尊重历史	Continuity/being part of history 承前启后 (Fan, 2000); past-time orientation 以史为鉴 (Kluckhohn & Strodbeck, 1961, as cited in Yau, 1988)	Value the concept of continuity and not to forget history	⇒Travel activity – historic sites and museums
14	Self-discipline 自律	Self-cultivation 修养 (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987)	Be able to regulate oneself and set an example for others	
15	Sense of obligation 责任感	Obligation for one's family, and nation 对家庭（国家）的责任感 (Fan, 2000)	Be accountable at work and to the family	
16	Thrift 节俭	Thrift 节俭 (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987; Faure & Fang, 2008)	Refrain from excessive consumption	⇒Destination choice – assess value for money ⇒Travel mode – look for cheaper options ⇒Travel activity – shop for good deals
	Terminal Values: Life Pursuits			
17	Convenience 便利	Convenience 方便 (Cheng, 1997)	Achieve one's objectives without having to put in much effort (usually related to consumption)	⇒Travel mode – package tour
18	Easy and comfortable 安逸		An easy life in a comfortable environment	
19	Fame and fortune 名		Be rich and famous	

	利			
20	Fashion 时尚	Fashion 时尚 (Zhang & Shavitt, 2003)	Grasp the latest trend	
21	Indulgence 享乐		Gratify one's (material) desires	⇒Prerequisite to travel – willing to spend
22	Leisure 休闲	Leisure 悠闲 (Zhang & Shavitt, 2003; Cheng, 1997)	Relax and enjoy a balance of life and work	⇒Travel motivation – relaxation ⇒Destination choice – natural sceneries ⇒Travel mode – independent
23	Liberation 个性/独立/自由		Have the freedom of being independent and true to oneself	⇒Destination choice – democratic societies ⇒Travel mode – independent
24	Live in the moment 活在当下		Seek pleasure in the present to avoid having regrets in the future	
25	Ostentation 攀比/炫富	Materialism and ostentation 物质享受与爱虚荣 (Faure & Fang, 2008)	Keep up with the Joneses	⇒Share travel experience with friends on social networks
26	Quality of life 生活品质		Improve the general well-being of one's life	
27	Self-interest 私利		Satisfy the needs and wants (money, power, etc.) of oneself	⇒Friendly casual interactions with stranger fellow travelers
28	Worship foreign cultures 崇洋		Exposure to foreign cultures (out of admiration for their advanced developments)	
29	Health 健康	Health 注重健康 (Cheng, 1997; Zhang & Harwood, 2004)	A healthy body	
30	Horizon broadening/Novelty		Broaden one's views and have a wide range of experiences	⇒Travel motivation – broaden horizon

	开阔视野/新奇			⇒Destination choice – cultural attractions ⇒Travel mode – package tour ⇒Travel activity – shop for specialties ⇒Revisit intention – low
31	Knowledge and education 文化/教育	Knowledge (education) 学识（教育）/有知识有文化 (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987)	Improve one's knowledge and thinking skills	⇒Travel motivation – gain knowledge
32	Stability and security 安稳	Personal steadiness and stability 稳重 (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987; Willis, 2009)	Personal safety and stability of life in general	⇒Destination choice – security as an important criterion ⇒Travel mode – package tours
	Interpersonal Values			
33	Collectivism 抱团	Solidarity with others 团结 (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987); group-orientation (collectivism) 抱团（集体主义）(Chan & Cheng, 2002; Willis, 2009; Cheng, 1997)	Build in-group cohesiveness and value group effort	
34	Compromise 妥协	Reaching consensus or compromise 达成一致/妥协 (Fan, 2000)	Accept less than one desires (because of conflicts with others or reality)	
35	Conformity 从众	Conformity/ group orientation 从众 (Fan, 2000; Zhang & Shavitt, 2003)	Do as others have done	⇒Travel activity – famous attractions
36	Devotion to children 望子成龙		Want the best for one's children	
37	Family orientation/kinship 亲情	Family (orientation) 家族观念 (Zhang & Harwood, 2004; Chan & Cheng, 2002; Cheng, 1997; Qian et al., 2007)	Stay close with family and be family-oriented in one's decisions	⇒Travel decision - family oriented ⇒Travel activity - shopping (for family members)
38	Filial piety 孝/尊老	Filial piety 孝 (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987); veneration/respect for elderly 尊老 (Fan,	Respect and take care of one's parents and elderly people in	

		2000; Chan & Cheng, 2002; Cheng, 1997)	general	
39	Friendship 友情	A close, intimate friend 知己之交 (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987)	Make new friends and develop interpersonal relationships	
40	Harmony 和谐	Harmony with others 随和/和睦 (Chinese Culture Connection, 1987); avoiding confrontation 避免冲突 (Fan, 2000)	A harmonious atmosphere without fighting	

Note: The shaded cells denote modern values; the rest are traditional values.